



## Minutes

Wednesday, January 21, 2015 14-15:05

Minutes of the meeting of Senate held on Wednesday, January 21, 2015 at 2:30 p.m. in the Robert Vogel Council Room (Room 232, Leacock Building.)

### PRESENT

Algieri, Stefano  
 Allison, Paul  
 Arezki, Amine  
 Bader, Darine  
 Bell, Graham  
 Benrimoh, David  
 Carter, Mindy  
 Crelinsten, Gordon  
 Cooke, Rosemary  
 Corkery, Christopher  
 Covo, David  
 Damha, Masad  
 Di Paola, Antonia  
 Doucette, Elaine  
 Dudek, Gregory  
 Dumont, Marie-Josée  
 Dyens, Ollivier  
 Ferguson, Sean  
 Fuhrer, Rebecca  
 Gold, Richard  
 Grant, Martin  
 Green, Garth  
 Greenspon, Jacob  
 Grobin, Morgan  
 Grütter, Peter

Harman, Christopher  
 Harpp, David  
 Hastings, Kenneth  
 Hébert, Terence  
 Henderson, Ian  
 Hill, Reghan  
 Hooton, Brett  
 Ibrahim, Kareem  
 Jutras, Daniel  
 Kamen, Amine  
 Kimmins, Sarah  
 Kreiswirth, Martin  
 Kucij, Maya  
 Kuzaitis, Ruth  
 Lach, Lucyna  
 Lane-Mercier, Gillian  
 Lu, Catherine  
 Masi, Anthony  
 McCullough, Mary Jo  
 Moore, Timothy  
 Mucci, Alfonso  
 Murray, Jennifer  
 Munteanu, Alexandru  
 Nicell, Jim  
 Nystrom, Derek  
 Oxhorn, Philip

Ram Panda  
 Rassier, Dilson  
 Ray, Saibal  
 Richard, Marc  
 Riches, Caroline  
 Robaire, Bernard  
 Rourke, Chloe  
 Saroyan, Alenoush  
 Scebba, Maximillion  
 Snider, Laurie  
 Snyder, Dan  
 Stewart-Kanigan, Claire  
 Stromvik, Martina  
 Stropole, Stephen  
*(Secretary)*  
 Thordardottir, Elin  
 Ulemek, Marina  
 Wang, Rui Hao (Leo)  
 Waters, Natalie  
 Weinstein, Marc  
 White, Lydia  
 Yalovsky, Morty  
 Yue, Stephen  
 Zhang, Ji  
 Zorychta, Edith

**REGRETS:**, Courtney Ayukawa, Daniel Bernard, Stuart Cobbett, Terence Coderre, Colleen Cook, Andre Costopoulos, Michael Di Grappa, David Eidelman, Eleanore Elstein, Jim Engle-Warnick, Suzanne Fortier, John Galaty, Kalle Gehring, Nabeel Godil, Rose Goldstein, John Gyakum, Nancy Heath, Natalie Hiles, Jacques Hurtubise, Ashraf Ismail, Alex Kalil, David Lametti, Chandra Madramootoo, Christopher Manfredi, Olivier Marcil, Michael A. Meighen, Juan Pinto, Trevor Ponech, Judith Potter, Cynthia Price, Yuanhang Yang.

## SECTION I

### 1. Approval of Senator Grant as Chair of the January 21, 2015 Senate Meeting

In the Principal's absence, the Secretary-General convened the meeting asking Senate to approve item 2 of the Report of the Steering Committee (Recommendation of Senator Grant as Chair of Senate for the January 21, 2015 Meeting).

*On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved the appointment of Senator Grant as Chair of Senate for the January 21, 2015 meeting.*

### 2. Welcoming Remarks

The Chair began by welcoming Senators to the fifth Senate meeting of the 2014-2015 governance year. He explained that Principal Fortier was unable to attend the Senate meeting as she was called to participate in a government relations meeting in Quebec City to discuss the final report of the university funding policy *Chantier* with her counterparts other Quebec universities, and with the deputy-minister for the *Ministère de l'Enseignement supérieur, de la Recherche et de la Science*.

He then reminded Senators, guests and spectators that the use of electronic devices are permitted for viewing meeting documents, but that the *Senate Rules of Procedure* prohibit the recording of sound or images, and the communication or posting of Senate deliberations.

### 3. Report of the Steering Committee (14:15-05)

Senate received the Report of the Steering Committee (14-15:04).

*Item 1. Approval of Minutes of Senate – December 3, 2014*

*Item 2. Approval of Confidential Minutes of Senate – December 3, 2014*

*Item 3. Recommendation of Senator Grant as Chair of Senate for the January 21, 2015 Meeting*  
Senate approved this item at the beginning of the meeting (see above).

*Item 4. Speaking Rights*

Upon approval of the report, speaking rights were granted to Professor Sarah Stroud, Associate Vice-Principal (Research and International Relations) for the following items: I4.1 (Business Arising: Follow-up to the November 4, 2014 Joint Board-Senate Meeting); IIB3 (Annual Report on Research Performance and Innovation (2013-2014)); and IIB5 (Progress Report on the Quartier de l'Innovation).

*Item 5. Approval of the Agenda*

The Chair indicated that the "Progress Report on the Development of a *Sexual Assault Policy*" which had initially been included on the agenda, would be deferred to the next meeting given Senator Costopoulos' absence.

*On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved the Steering Report.*

#### **4. Business Arising**

##### **4.1 Interdisciplinary Program Funding**

Senator Masi, the Provost, responded to a follow-up question arising from a question posed at the last meeting regarding whether the \$800,000 allocation to interdisciplinary program funding in FY2015 was higher than the funding allocated in FY2014. The Provost indicated that interdisciplinary program funding from FY2011-2013 was \$800,000 and \$650,000 in FY2014.

##### **4.2 Follow-up to the November 4, 2014 Joint Board-Senate Meeting**

Professor Sarah Stroud, the Associate Vice-Principal (Research and International Relations), highlighted key follow-up actions Research and International Relations will be pursuing in response to the feedback received at the November 2014 Joint Board-Senate meeting. She added that Research and International Relations welcomes feedback and suggestions from members of the University community.

#### **5. Principal's Remarks**

Given the Principal's absence, the remarks and kudos had been circulated electronically before the meeting. The remarks informed Senators that the Quebec government released the final report of the university funding policy *Chantier* in late December. The University is analyzing the potential impact of the report's 25 recommendations.

The remarks also explained that the University is expecting the feasibility study for the Royal Victoria Hospital site to proceed in the near future. The administration would be meeting with provincial government officials to reach an agreement on the conditions under which McGill could undertake this feasibility study.

Regarding kudos, the Principal noted that three of the ten discoveries of the year in Quebec science were led by McGill-affiliated researchers. In addition, nine members of the McGill community, including Chancellor Michael A. Meighen, Governor Emerita Kappy Flanders and Chancellor Emeritus Richard Pound, were recently named Members of the Order of Canada. The kudos also acknowledged Professor Tamara Sussman (Social Work) for being awarded a Strategic Impact Grant. Moreover, second-year medical student, Saman Ahmad, was congratulated for the success of the Health and Hygiene for the Homeless club he founded in Fall 2013. The kudos highlighted that the McGill Centraide campaign raised a record amount of funds totalling \$444,559. The kudos concluded by acknowledging Professor Eduardo Kohn (Anthropology) who received the 2014 Bateson Prize and Professor T.V. Paul's (Political Science) election as president of the International Studies Association.

## **SECTION II**

### **Part "A" – Questions and Motions by Members**

1. Question Regarding University Support for Out-of-the-Classroom Learning and Increasing Campus Accessibility through Student-Run Campus Businesses

Senators Rouke, Greenspon and Stewart-Kanigan submitted the following question:

Whereas, an Open Discussion was held in the November 19, 2014 session of Senate on “Non-Traditional/Out-of-the-Classroom Learning: Integrating Research Opportunities in Undergraduate Studies,”

Whereas, Applied Student Research (ASR) projects are an ongoing site of out-of-the-classroom learning at McGill,

Whereas, ASR projects in Statistics, Environment, and Operations Management courses have used student-run campus businesses, such as Gerts and Snax, as their research focus,

Whereas, student management and development of student-run campus business provide opportunities for building applicable management and entrepreneurship skills,

Whereas, the recommendations to “enhance diversity and broad access to McGill” and “increase the number of individuals from groups now underrepresented in various segments of the McGill community, [including] ... disadvantaged socioeconomic groups”<sup>2</sup> were made by the Principal’s Task Force on Diversity, Excellence, and Community Engagement,

Whereas, access to employment is a major factor in campus accessibility for promoting the inclusion of a range of socioeconomic groups; student-run campus businesses—including Snax, Gerts, Frostbite, Copi-EUS, G-Store, and Dave’s General Store—employ approximately seventy-five students across campus, expanding employment opportunities for those who do not qualify for Work Study or are otherwise unable to access employment,

Whereas, food that accommodates both a variety of dietary and financial needs is an important factor in creating an accessible, diverse community,

Whereas, student-run campus food businesses provide dietary and financial needs-sensitive services that are otherwise unavailable or mutually exclusive on campus,

Whereas, concerns’ regarding the University’s support of student-run campus businesses have recently been raised in response to the banning of sandwich sales by Snax, including the creation of a student petition to express discontent at this decision,

Whereas, other student-run campus food businesses, such as Architecture Cafe, Bookstore Cafe, the student-run cafeterias in Redpath, the Arts Building, the Strathcona Building, and the Education Building Chancellor Day Hall, and the Bronfman Building were previously closed by the University,

Senator Dyens, the Deputy-Provost (Student Life and Learning), provided the following written response:

Thank you Senators Rourke, Greenspon, and Stewart-Kanigan for your questions.

Some clarification is needed. Encouraging Non-Traditional/Out-of-the-Classroom Learning: Integrating Research Opportunities in Undergraduate Studies means encouraging learning and research opportunities within the framework of the curriculum. One of the goals of the university is to enhance and broaden the educational and scholarly experiences of its students through the use of out of the classroom initiatives. Part of this enhanced educational experience is to educate and train students to become entrepreneurs.

Once a student becomes an entrepreneur and operates a business, he or she then enters into a business relationship with his or her many partners and providers. This business relationship is built on signed and agreed to contracts.

The University maintains an educational as well as a business relationship with SSMU and other student run associations, such as AUS, which are independent corporations. These independent student-run corporations negotiate and sign agreements with McGill to clearly establish what is in the best interests of both parties. As in any other type of business relationship, questions of liability, responsibility and risks are discussed and negotiated.

SSMU runs many business operations in the University Centre. SSMU and other independent student run corporations are free to run business operations within the framework of the MOA each of them has agreed to and signed. The University expects all MOAs to be honoured as it expects contracts with any other providers or business operations on campus to be.

Senator Stewart-Kanigan asked whether the University provides preferential terms to student-run businesses to promote out-of-the-classroom learning. Senator Dyens replied that student-run businesses receive equal treatment to other businesses and that this contributes to out-of-the-classroom learning since, once they leave McGill, alumni must compete with other enterprises on equal terms.

## 2. Question Regarding McGill's Stance on the Deregulation of International Tuition Fees

Senators Greenspon, Ibrahim, Stewart-Kanigan and Ayukawa submitted the following question:

Whereas, in every Faculty, international students pay the highest tuition rates,

Whereas, financial accessibility is essential to allowing students from a diversity of socioeconomic backgrounds the opportunity to attend McGill University,

Whereas, McGill prides itself on its cosmopolitan character and internationally diverse student body,

Whereas, tuition fees for international students in the Faculties of Management, Engineering, Science, and Law have already been deregulated, resulting in significant fee increases compared to their previous regulated rates,

Whereas, the Robilliard Commission report released in December 2014 recommends the total deregulation of international and out-of-province tuition fees,

What is McGill's stance on the deregulation of student fees for international students in Faculties where tuition fees are still currently regulated?

Does McGill plan to consult students and the broader McGill community in shaping its stance on the deregulation of international tuition fees?

The Provost, provided the following written response:

Tuition for international students in undergraduate programs is “regulated” by the Government of Quebec. Through a complex set of financial transactions, universities keep only the equivalent of Quebec tuition, less a mandatory contribution to Quebec's financial aid system (for which international students are ineligible).

Six years ago, the Ministry introduced a five-year plan to deregulate international tuition for programs in management, pure science, computer science, math, engineering, and law. Universities now keep the entire tuition charged of international students in these programs, but receive no teaching grant from the government for these individuals.

Both the Robillard Commission and the Tremblay-Roy Report have recently come out in favour of some form of further deregulation for international students, in part as a response to economic pressures, but also in the interest of fairness to Quebec taxpayers.

The Rectors, Principals, and Presidents of the Quebec university network are now discussing details with Government officials. Various workgroups are likely to be established soon.

In our brief to the Tremblay-Roy *Chantier*, McGill has argued that international tuition should be deregulated for all programs, in the same manner as it has been for the first six. This would create additional incentive to expand the international student population, with increased revenues and diversity benefitting both the students and the university.

McGill is committed to providing a first-rate education, and to ensuring that no qualified student be denied access to the University due to financial need. Our bursary and financial aid programs are the most comprehensive in the province. We continue to allocate 30% of net new tuition revenues to student aid programs, and we provide aid to international students. We will continue this assistance to the best of our ability in the bad as well as the good economic times.

Whenever the University can set tuition fees, it is done and will continue to be done with McGill's academic mission, priorities, reputation, and global reach as the clear and decisive

drivers. Furthermore, deregulation does not automatically lead to immediate and significant increases in tuition insofar as the latter requires careful assessment of market conditions and implications for the McGill experience as Canada's most national and international university.

Senators discussed how international student tuition rates would be determined if and when rates would be deregulated, and how the University could better target international students from particular socio-economic groups.

## Part "B" – Motions and Reports from Organs of University Government

### Open Session

#### 1. Reports from the Academic Policy Committee

##### 1.1 461<sup>st</sup> Report of the APC (D14-29)

The Provost presented this item for information. He highlighted the creation of a global designation for the B.Sc. degree to recognize students who have gone beyond the normal degree requirements by broadening their horizons by including language courses, independent research, global-related study and/non-McGill study or work experience in their program.

##### 1.2 Proposed Revisions to the *Policy on Late Withdrawals* (from the 460<sup>th</sup> Report of the APC) (D14-25)

Senator White, the Associate Provost (Policies, Procedures and Equity), reintroduced this recommendation from the 460<sup>th</sup> Report of the APC, which proposed revisions to the *Policy on Late Withdrawals* for undergraduate course withdrawals. She reminded Senators that this item had been considered at the December 2014 meeting. Senator White reiterated that the intention of this *Policy* is to set accurate, fair and compassionate guidelines to address exceptional circumstances students may encounter, such as mental and physical illness, and personal tragedies, which result in a full term withdrawal. In such cases, the revisions would allow for courses and grades to be removed from the official transcript.

Some Senators opposed the recommendation citing integrity-related concerns of the University's transcripts that would occur if it were possible to modify their academic records.

A majority of Senators supported the recommendation since the option to remove "Ws" from an undergraduate student's transcript would only occur in exceptional and extreme circumstances. They also reiterated that the "W" notation on transcripts is not as neutral as originally supposed.

Senators suggested a friendly amendment that the *Policy* be reviewed after three years which would allow for the *Policy* to be adequately implemented and evaluated.

*On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved the proposed Policy on Late Withdrawals, which shall be reviewed at the end of the third year of their operation.*

**2. Report of the Senate Nominating Committee** (D14-30)

Senator Masi presented this report for approval. He explained that approval was required for the appointment of an alternate graduate student to the Academic Policy Committee. He also highlighted that the Senate Nominating Committee is considering possible revisions to the terms of reference of the Academic Policy and Senate Steering Committees to further enhance Senate's engagement. He noted that the Senate Nominating Committee will propose recommendations to Senate for its consideration at a future meeting.

*On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved the recommendation contained in the Report of the Senate Nominating Committee (D14-30) to fill the alternate graduate student vacancy on the Academic Policy Committee.*

**3. Annual Report on Research Performance and Innovation (2013-2014)** (D14-31)

Professor Stroud presented this report, which presented key indicators of McGill's research funding performance and innovation, for information. Professor Stroud highlighted that McGill's research funding intensity (i.e. research funding per capita) is the second highest in Canada. She explained that the primary sources of McGill's research funding revenue remain the federal and provincial governments; though, the University is working to diversify its research funding revenue sources given that the amount of public funds remains stagnant. Professor Stroud also indicated that McGill continues to face challenges in moving research into the community and the market; however, the *Quartier de l'Innovation* and the McGill University Business Engagement Centre are helping the University improve in this area.

The ensuing discussion focused on McGill's research funding performance pattern over the past few years and how this compares with sister universities in the U15. Professor Stroud explained that research funding performance is closely linked with economic cycles.

**4. Annual Report on Student Life and Learning (2013-2014)** (D14-32)

Senator Dyens presented this report, which provided an overview of Student Life and Learning's current activities and goals, for information. He highlighted some of Student Life and Learning's successes in 2013-2014 including: holding the best Frosh in North America; the creation of the McGill App; Registrar Kathleen Massey's receipt of the *Association of Registrars of Universities and Colleges of Canada Outstanding Achievement Award*; and the development of a Counsellor in Residence program to better facilitate student access to therapists and mental health clinicians.

The subsequent discussion focused on the development of the McGill App and its use amongst students. Senator Dyens added that to-date, 4500 students have downloaded the app. To increase the app's use amongst students, the University will market the app to all students as of this year, rather than only to new students.



**5. Progress Report on the Quartier de l’Innovation (QI) (D14-33)**

Professor Stroud presented this report for information. She provided an overview of the project’s achievements since last year, discussed current activities and outlined its goals and priorities for the coming year. Professor Stroud underlined that a total of 58 McGill students were engaged in the QI, actively contributing to the QI Student Working Group, research projects and internships. With outreach activities, classroom presentations and experiential learning opportunities combined, over 600 McGill students were reached as part of McGill’s involvement in QI in 2014. Professor Stroud also noted that goals for 2015-2016 include enriching academic experiences of students, researchers and professors through projects, internships, entrepreneurship and outreach; capitalizing on existing partnerships and further collaborating with local and international partners; engaging more students; and launching Salon 1861.

Senators discussed the metrics for gauging the QI’s success and suggested that data be gathered as to how many undergraduate and graduate students participate in the initiative in future years.

**6. University Advancement Annual Report (2013-2014) (D14-34)**

Senator Weinstein, the Vice-Principal (University Advancement), presented this report for information. He provided an overview of philanthropic results for FY2014 and identified future fundraising challenges and opportunities. Senator Weinstein explained that in the post-Campaign McGill period, gifts to McGill remain strong, and that University Advancement streamlined its operations to ensure alumni relations is fully integrated into the University Advancement team.

Senators discussed how the University could continue to leverage funds from various members of the University community including those outside of Montreal, as well as how to maintain lasting relationships with alumni once they leave McGill.

**7. Report from the Board of Governors to Senate (D14-35)**

Senator Panda presented this report, which provided a summary of matters reviewed at the October 2014 Executive Committee meeting and the December 2014 Board of Governors meeting, for Senate’s information.

**8. Other Business**

No other business items were raised.

There being no other business to deal with, on a motion duly proposed and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 4:20 p.m.

END

The complete documents, including presentations at Senate, are kept as part of the official minutes.