

Minutes

Wednesday, December 7, 2016 16-17:04

Minutes of the meeting of Senate held on Wednesday, December 7, 2016 at 2:30 p.m. in the auditorium of the Redpath Museum

PRESENT

Bartlett, Joan
Bayen, Stephane
Bede, Jacqueline
Bernard, Daniel
Buddle, Christopher
Campbell, Angela
Chin, Joshua
Cleveland, William
Cook, Colleen
Cumming, Julie
Di Paola, Antonia
Dow, Alexander
Dunn, Nicholas
Dyens, Ollivier
Elbourne, Elizabeth
Fortier, Suzanne
Frankel, Victor
Fuhrer, Rebecca
Fussmann, Gregor

Galaty, John
Gehr, Ronald
Ger, Ben
Goldstein, Rose
Goodridge, Lawrence
Gore, Genevieve
Gyakum, John
Harpp, David
Hébert, Terence
Holmes, Amanda
Hooton, Brett
Kartinen, Mari
Kalil, Alex
Larsson, Hans
Leckey, Robert
Lennox, Bruce
Lowther, David
Maciasz, Eva
Manfredi, Christopher
Massey, Kathleen

McCulloch, Mary Jo
Mineau, Guy
Nichol, Jarrod
Oxhorn, Philip
Price Verreault, Cynthia
Rassier, Dilon
Richard, Marc
Riches, Caroline
Robaire, Bernard
Russo, Mitchel
Rogowska, Edyta
(*Secretary*)
Singh, Jaaved
Snider, Laurie
Sobat, Erin
Voudouris, Nellie
Waters, Natalie
Winer, Laura
Yalovsky, Morty
Zorychta, Edith

REGRETS: Paul Allison, Isabelle Bajeux-Besnainou, Lisa Barg, Mindy Carter, Stuart Cobbett, Terence Coderre, Jade Corriveau, David Covo, Gordon Crelinsten, Masad Damha, Elaine Doucette, David Eidelman, Eleanor Elstein, Jim Engle-Warnick, Guy Ettlin, Kalle Gehring, Anja Geitmann, Richard Gold, Samantha Gruenheid, Peter Grütter, James Gutman, Kenneth Hastings, Casarina Hocevar, Amine Kamen, Charles Keita, Tetyana Krupiy, Lucyna Lach, Gillian Lane-Mercier, Marcelo Lannes, Margaret Levey, Alexandre Magdzinski, Antonia Maioni, Michael A. Meighen, Amanda Montaque, Felicia Moye, Alfonso Mucci, Josephine Nalbantoglu, Jim Nicell, Ram Panda, Alexandre Perron, Trevor Ponech, Judith Potter, Nathaniel Quitarano, Saibal Ray, Fiona Ritchie, Nigel Roulet, Jerome Savaria-Carriere, Shannon Snow, Karsten Steinhauer, David, Stephens, Sean Taylor, Marc Weinstein.

SECTION I

1. Welcoming Remarks

The Chair welcomed Senators to the fourth Senate meeting of the 2016-2017 governance year. As this was the last Senate meeting of the calendar year, she wished student Senators success in their exams and all Senators a joyful holiday period. She thanked Senator Gruenheid for her service as this was her last meeting, and congratulated Senator Price Verreault and Senator Kalil on their reappointments on Senate.

She reminded Senators, guests and spectators that the use of electronic devices is permitted for viewing meeting documents, but that the *Senate Rules of Procedure* prohibit the recording of sound or images, and the communication or posting of Senate deliberations.

2. Memorial Tributes

There were none.

3. Report of the Steering Committee (16:17-04)

Senate received the Report of the Steering Committee (16-17:04).

Item 1. Approval of Minutes of Senate – November 23, 2016.

Item 2. Approval of Confidential Minutes of Senate – November 23, 2016.

Item 3. Speaking Rights Upon approval of the report, speaking rights were granted to Ms. Cristiane Tinmouth, Associate Vice-Principal (Financial Services) for item IIB1 (Annual Report on the Financial State of the University) and Mr. Bradley Tucker, Executive Director, Analysis, Planning and Budget, for item IIB2 (Budget Planning 2017-18 Report I).

Item 4. Senate Questions

Item 5. Approval of the Agenda.

On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved the Report of the Steering Committee.

4. Business Arising from the November 23, 2016 Minutes

Senator Yalovsky updated Senators on matters related to the “Question Regarding Campus Accessibility During Construction Periods.” He explained that, with respect to fire truck access to buildings on McTavish Street, McGill staff members direct trucks in alleys to allow for access to emergency vehicles, noting that the Montreal fire department verified the area as being suitable for this purpose. He stated that police have been informed of the issue of illegal parking in the alleys and will work to ensure compliance. Concerning adaptive transport, Senator Yalovsky explained that the driver works with users directly, and the availability of service

depends on the demand. He stated that a registered user with an immediate need who is not already on a regular schedule can always call the driver directly to verify availability. Finally, with respect to the sidewalks outside the Bronfman and the Brown buildings that make access difficult to individuals in wheelchairs, McGill requested the City of Montreal to install temporary ramps.

5. Chair's Remarks

The Chair began her remarks by discussing the RVH Site. She stated that the Provost and Vice-Principal (Academic) convened two working groups to start developing the vision for bringing Sustainability Systems and Public Policy as anchors to the RVH, as well as to suggest structures to increase collaboration across units and disciplines. She then called on Senator Manfredi to report on the progress that has been made. Senator Manfredi explained that Sustainability Systems will encompass molecular materials systems, earth systems and urban systems and that the theme of Public Policy will be anchored by the School of Public Policy and the School of Population and Global Health. He reported that the working groups discussed how the space would be allocated and stated that the next step is to prepare the *Plan technique et fonctionnel*.

Regarding external relations, the Chair spoke about the Réseau électrique métropolitain (REM) project. She shared that she attended the announcement by the Caisse de dépôt et placement du Québec of the addition of three new stations that would link McGill's two campuses, the Université de Montréal and Griffintown in the heart of the Quartier de l'innovation. She stated that work will begin in 2017 and is scheduled to be ready as McGill enters its third century in 2020.

The Chair then moved to kudos. She reported that sixteen out of the 203 new and renewed Canada Research Chairs (CRC) had been awarded to McGill faculty (seven new Tier 2 Chairs and four new Tier 1 Chairs were granted to McGill researchers, and five researchers were granted renewals on their Tier 1 and Tier 2 awards). She congratulated McGill students Rashaan Allwood and Joel Peters on winning first and third prizes respectively in the organ category at the 2016 OSM Manulife Competition. She shared that the Law Society of Upper Canada named Professor Cindy Blackstock (School of Social Work) as one of the winners of the 2016 Human Rights Award and that the Quebec Branch of the Canadian Bar Association awarded the Paul-André-Crépeau Medal to Professor Geneviève Saumier (Faculty of Law). She then congratulated Professor Theresa Gyorkos (Department of Epidemiology, Biostatistics and Occupational Health) on receiving the Vic Neufeld Mentorship Award in Global Health Research.

The Chair ended her remarks by giving highlights from the December 1, 2016, McGill Board of Governors meeting. She informed Senate that the Board approved the University's *Policy against Sexual Violence* that had been recommended by Senate. She shared that Senator Meighen will be serving a second term as Chancellor and that Senator Panda will succeed Senator Cobbett as Chair of the Board on July 1st, 2017. She stated that the Board approved the re-appointment of Senator Eidelman as Vice-Principal (Health Affairs) and Dean of the Faculty of Medicine, and the appointments of Yves Beauchamp as Vice-Principal (Administration and Finance) and Martha Crago as Vice-Principal (Research and Innovation). She then thanked Senator Goldstein for her six years of exemplary service as Vice-Principal (Research and Innovation), and Professor Morty Yalovsky for his leadership as interim Vice-Principal (Administration and

Finance) since June 2016. Finally, she thanked the members of the three Advisory Committees, and everyone who participated in the search and evaluation processes for their contributions and counsel.

The Chair then opened the floor to questions and comments. Senator Sobat expressed his appreciation to the administration for recognizing the École Polytechnique de Montréal massacre and directing people to the memorial organized by the Sexual Assault Centre of the McGill Students' Society (SACOMSS). He noted that the statement to the McGill community mentioned that "...this violence cannot be forgotten by this generation or any other." He stated that it is important to talk about why this tragedy occurred and to acknowledge that it was an act of misogyny and gender-based violence. He added that this type of violence persists today, noting that it was recognized in the statement to the [McGill Reporter](#) by the Senate Subcommittee on Women. He suggested that a similar statement be included in future communications from the University.

In response to Senator Singh's question regarding the REM, the Chair stated that the last station is Sainte-Anne-de-Bellevue and invited him to look at the plan on the REM [website](#).

SECTION II

Part "A" – Questions and Motions by Members

1. Question Regarding Faculty Internship Programs

Senators Ettlin and Sobat submitted the following question:

Whereas, the McGill Commitment focuses on “providing all students with a stimulating, innovative, and inquiry-based educational experience,” including through “experiential and scholarly learning opportunities that extend beyond the classroom and the gates of the University,”¹

Whereas, unpaid internships exacerbate social inequalities by excluding many students who cannot afford to work for free from meaningful experiential learning opportunities;²

Whereas, in the Faculty of Arts, students can only receive course credit for non-research internships by registering in supplementary internship courses supervised by a faculty member, which require the payment of tuition fees;³

Whereas, both the Faculty of Science and Faculty of Engineering Internship Programs recognize paid, *non-credit* internship placements, which are assessed via student and employer evaluations;^{4 5}

¹ <https://www.mcgill.ca/principal/five-priorities/mcgill-commitment>

² <http://www.macleans.ca/economy/business/why-unpaid-internships-means-inequality-of-opportunity/>

³ <http://www.mcgill.ca/arts-internships/credit>

⁴ <https://www.mcgill.ca/science/programs/internships>

⁵ <https://www.mcgill.ca/careers4engineers/engineering-internship-program/students>

Whereas, some Bachelor of Arts & Science (BASc) students have reportedly been rejected from the Science Internship Program due to preference for Bachelor of Science (BSc) students.

1. Why doesn't the University offer academic credit for recognized professional internship programs, such as those in the Faculties of Science and Engineering?
2. Can the University establish a revised Arts internship or co-op program where students are evaluated on, and receive credit for, internship experiences without the need to register in additional courses?

Senator Manfredi provided the following written response prior to the Senate meeting:

Thank you for your question, Senators Ettlín and Sobat.

As indicated on the Internship Offices Network website ([here](#)), students in most programs in the Faculty of Arts can register for an Internship Course to earn credit from their home department as a result of an internship they have pursued on their own or through the Arts Internship office. Normally, Arts students pursue internships during the summer months, and since Internship Courses are usually taken the semester following the successful completion of the internship, the Internship Course is typically part of their fall term course load. While precise requirements may vary between departments, to earn the credit, students would normally write "a major topical paper on an aspect of their internship from an academic perspective." There is no expectation that Arts students who pursue internships and seek credit thereafter would incur expenses for having to take additional courses. It is expected that the credits earned through the Internship Credit course would count toward the student's degree program, as a regular classroom-based course would, either as an elective, or possibly as an alternative way of fulfilling a regular degree requirement. Arts students may also apply for a range of Arts Internship Awards to help offset the cost of pursuing an internship during the summer months.

The Internship Credit course, offered in most departments in the Faculty of Arts, awards credit for scholarly work that draws on the internship experience in some significant way. It does not provide credit for the internship experience on its own, which, while certainly valuable, is not necessarily explicitly academic in nature, and is understood to be complementary to the student's work toward his or her degree.

There is no impediment to BASc students pursuing internships offered through the Arts Internship Office. They are likewise eligible for Arts Internship Awards and make take Internship Credit courses according to the same criteria required of BA students.

While the 'Science Internship Program' designation on a student's transcript is available only to BSc students who complete a Science Internship of at least 8 months or 2 Industrial Practica, BASc students are nonetheless eligible to pursue the non-credit Industrial Practicum courses available through the Faculty of Science. It is important to note, though, that as the BASc is its own degree program (and neither BA nor BSc),

participation in the Science Internship Program is not possible. That said, the BASc Program Advisory Committee has indicated a willingness to raise at a future meeting of the committee, the possibility of formal transcript recognition of something like a 'BASc Internship Program' for BASc students who pursue both an Arts internship and subsequent Arts Internship Course, and a Science Industrial Practicum.

The internship programs offered through Science and Engineering are not credit-bearing because they are industry-based and do not require scholarly research. Instead of being a credit-bearing component of the degree, successful completion of the Internship Program in either of these Faculties is recognized on students' transcripts as an enrichment of the degrees they have earned, and a valuable complement to their on-campus learning.

Additionally, Engineering is an accredited degree program, with the consequence that students working toward engineering degrees and, ultimately, recognition as professional engineers, must follow a more specific path, with a greater number of required courses, in order to earn the degree. Engineering students already typically complete 133-150 credits in pursuit of a BEng, compared to 120 for a BA or BSc. If the Internship Program in Engineering were credit-bearing, students would have to pay the corresponding tuition to participate, but unlike Arts students, Engineering students would most likely have to earn internship credit in addition to the regular requirements of the degree, and would thus incur additional expense. Students would also most likely have to complete additional academic work, supervised by a faculty member, to earn the credit.

Senator Sobat expressed concerned over interdisciplinary students facing undue burden. He suggested that the BASc Program Advisory Committee considers ways in which the interdisciplinary focus could be acknowledged to ensure recognition without requiring students to complete both internships. Senator Manfredi agreed to communicate the suggestion to the Committee. Senator Sobat then asked whether there can be alternate ways to evaluate the scholarly merit of Arts internships instead of requiring students to do stand-alone courses with additional fees. Senator Manfredi responded that students do not pay for additional courses as the internship course is already within the context of their regular course load.

Part "B" – Motions and Reports from Organs of University Government

Open Session

1. Annual Report on the Financial State of the University (D16-27)

Senator Yalovsky presented this report for Senate's information. He highlighted that the fiscal year ended with a GAAP surplus \$1.8 million, despite the operating grant budget cuts applied to universities by the Quebec government. He noted that there has been a slight increase in enrolment and a net change of 320 tenure track academics between 2002 and 2016. He reported that the total revenues of the Operating Fund was \$781 million, the largest expense being salaries and benefits. He explained that the Interfund transfers include \$26.9 million for pension and post-retirement liabilities, \$31 million in capital purchases, \$11.5 million for internal loan repayment and \$5.5 million of transfers into other funds. Regarding deferred maintenance,

Senator Yalovsky stated that a study conducted estimates it at \$925 million, with an additional \$425 million for buildings, which are not included in the study (buildings used for non-academic purposes, such as the gym, the residences). He ended the presentation by discussing challenges faced from a budgeting perspective and providing an overview of encouraging trends for future developments.

In response to a question by Senator Maciasz regarding the total expenses reported, Senator Yalovsky clarified that expenses with respect to the entire budget consists of the Operating Fund, Plant Fund, Endowment Fund and the Restricted Fund. The Principal added that regarding the Endowment Fund, only the payout is recorded.

Senator Galaty asked whether the Redpath property was ever reported as an asset. Senator Yalovsky responded in the negative, explaining that since it was an emphyteutic lease, it was supposed to return to the University. He added that the sale of Beatty Hall was recorded in the Plant Fund since it was always listed as a McGill building. Ms. Tinmouth confirmed that all the land and buildings are recorded in the Plant Fund and mentioned that details regarding the University's assets can be found in the audited financial statements.

Senator Robaire commented that there appears to be a ratio of one member of the management staff for every member of the academic staff. He asked how this compares with statistics over the past ten years and at other universities. Senator Yalovsky did not have that data but responded that there has been a decrease in administrative staff due to the Voluntary Retirement Program launched in 2013, noting that more details will be provided in the McGill University Staffing Report that will be presented to Senate in the spring. Senator Robaire suggested that the Staffing Report include a breakdown of administrative and support staff working in departments and central administrative offices as there is a perception of not having enough staff at the local level. Senator Yalovsky mentioned that additional staff was needed at the central level due to government reporting requirements.

Senator Dow asked about the grants for renovations to the Stewart Biology Building and certain science buildings. Senator Yalovsky responded that the University applied for the Post-Secondary Institutions Strategic Investment Fund, but no announcements have been made, noting that any grants received would be included in next year's budget.

Senator Frankel noted that 22% of the total combined expenditures during Fiscal Year 2016 were reported as "other expenses" and asked what this category included. Senator Yalovsky responded that it includes items such as heating, electricity, interest and bank charges and referred Senators to the Report for a more complete list.

In response to Senator Hébert's question concerning indirect costs of research, Senator Yalovsky explained that a funding formula, which had had been developed in conjunction with Deans, was in place to administer the distribution of the indirect costs of research. Senator Hébert expressed an interest in receiving more information about how funds in support of indirect costs of research are distributed within the University. The Principal stated that a response can be provided at the next meeting. She mentioned that indirect costs are an issue in Canada, noting that a lower percentage is allocated to universities with the largest research activities. Senator Bernard added

that researchers are being asked to shoulder the burden of the deficiency in indirect cost funding. The Principal stated that the University as well as the U15 (as this is a national program) have been asking the government to increase the budget in this area.

In response to Senator Singh's question regarding information on specific assets, such as the Gault Nature Reserve, the Morgan Arboretum, etc., Senator Yalovsky explained that they are embedded in the budget of faculties. For example, he mentioned that Macdonald Campus is part of the Faculty of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences, the Gaul Nature Reserve and the McGill Arctic Research Station are part of the Faculty of Science. Senator Singh then asked why the endowments had a slight deterioration. Senator Yalovsky responded that it was due to the markets.

2. Budget Planning 2017-2018 Report I

(D16-28)

Senator Manfredi presented this report for Senate's information. He stated that Fiscal Year 2016 ended reasonably well, allowing the University to pay down some of its accumulated finance deficit. He highlighted that priorities for FY18 include supporting the University's academic mission, strategic plan, and the Principal's Priorities, addressing critical deferred maintenance, investing in sustainability science, the School of Public Policy, Indigenous studies and populations, student support, student life and learning, and online initiatives. He shared that priorities also include reviewing budget measures, implementing administrative and support staff and academic staff salary policy commitments, diversifying revenue generation, and planning longer-term surpluses to address accumulated deficit and bond repayment.

Senator Dow asked for details regarding "diversifying revenue generation". Senator Manfredi responded that there are opportunities to generate revenue as some of the University's programs are under capacity. He added that there is also the possibility of developing professional master's programs and online programs. In response to Senator Bernard's question concerning online programs, Senator Manfredi stated that the current goal is for the University to offer at least one program, noting that the quality of the courses and the admission requirements would be equivalent to that of the courses delivered on campus. He also mentioned that professors would not be obliged to deliver online courses. Senator Sobat wondered what items are included under "student support". Senator Manfredi clarified that it refers mostly to the student aid budget.

Senator Ger asked if there have been any discussions or provisions in the budget for an increase in the Universal Access Capital Projects Fund. Senator Manfredi responded that it is too early in the process to provide that level of granularity.

Senator Maciasz asked about salary increases, noting that certain management staff have experienced a salary freeze. Senator Manfredi clarified that the increase was in salary mass, which may be due to increased salaries but also to an increased number of employees. He stated that there are discussions with different groups regarding salary increases and once more information is obtained, it can be built into the parameters for the budget. Senator Singh asked if employment for administrative and support staff is stable. Senator Manfredi responded in the affirmative, noting that the replacement rate is equal to the departure rate.

Senator Bernard asked whether changes to the funding formula would alter the tuition formula as well. Senator Manfredi stated that the University would like to have more flexibility with respect to tuition. Senator Dow wondered what the University is doing to deregulate tuition. Senator Manfredi clarified that flexibility is not necessarily for increasing tuition but ensuring that the money from tuition remains at McGill instead of being redistributed throughout the province.

3. Report of the Senate Nominating Committee (D16-29)

Senator Manfredi presented this report for Senate’s consideration. He explained that it contained recommendations to fill vacancies on Senate Standing Committees and Committees Arising from University Regulations.

On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved the recommendations contained in the Report of the Senate Nominating Committee (D16-29).

4. Annual Report from the Committee on Libraries (2015-16) (D16-30)

Senator Oxhorn presented this report for Senate’s information. The report contained an overview of the Committee’s activities undertaken last year.

Senator Elbourne clarified that the ad hoc focus group was not created to “manage the expectations and concerns of researchers in the Humanities” as stated in the report but to improve communication between faculty and the McGill Library. Senator Cook agreed to change the wording of the focus group’s mandate.

5. Other Business

There being no other business to deal with, on a motion duly proposed and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 4:02 p.m.

END

The complete documents, including presentations at Senate, are kept as part of the official minutes.