



## Minutes

Wednesday, May 18, 2011 10-11:09

Minutes of the meeting of Senate held on Wednesday, May 18, 2011 at 2:30 p.m. in the Robert Vogel Council Room (Room 232, Leacock Building.)

<b>PRESENT</b>	Gonnerman, Laura	Perrault, Hélène
Abaki, Joshua	Grant, Martin	Peterson, Kathryn
Aitken, Ellen	Grütter, Peter	Pierre, Christophe
Barney, Darin	Gyakum, John	Piper, Andrew
Bishop, Alexandra	Harpp, David	Possian, Amara
Blachford, Gregg	Hashimoto, Kyoko	Potter, Judith
Blom, Randall	Hepburn, Allan	Richard, Marc
Boss, Valentin	Hobbins, Joan	Riches, Caroline
Bray, Dorothy	Janda, Richard	Saroyan, Alenoush
Brophy, James	Johnson, Juliet	Shaughnessy, Honora
Caplan, Eric	Kirby, Torrance	Snider, Laurie
Clare, Emily	Kuzaitis, Ruth	Todd, Peter
Cook, Colleen	Lawson, Tyler	Van Eyk, Helen
Covo, David	Leask, Richard	Wade, Kevin
Cuello, Claudio	Levin, Richard	Wapnick, Joel
Deguisse, Alexandre	Lowther, David	Weinstein, Marc
Doucette, Elaine	Manfredi, Christopher	White, Lydia
Dudek, Gregory	Masi, Anthony	Wolfson, Christina
Etemad, Hamid	McCulloch, Mary Jo	Zhang, Ji
Everett, Jane	Mendelson, Morton	Zorychta, Edith
Franklin, Keith	Munroe-Blum, Heather	Strople, Stephen
Goldstein, Rose	Nassim, Roland	( <i>Secretary</i> )

**REGRETS:** Paul Allison, Gillian Bartlett-Esquillant, Renzo Cecere, Roshi Chadha, Stuart Cobbett, Philip Cutler, Michael Di Grappa, Andrew Doyle, Brian Driscoll, Gordon Foote, Evan Fox-Decent, Gerald Fried, Charles Gale, Engelbert Gayagoy, Brendan Gillon, Johanne Hebert, Jacques Hurtubise, Ashraf Ismail, Daniel Jutras, Martin Kreiswirth, John Kurien, Paul Lasko, Mark Lefsrud, Simon Liu, Annie Ma, Chandra Madramootoo, James G. Martin, Kevin McDonough, Arun Misra, Zach Newburgh, Gary Pেকেles, Amir Raz, Catherine Ready, Matt Reid, Michael Richards, Bernard Robaire, Renee Sieber, Arnold Steinberg, Claudette Van Zyl, Clare Wilkening.

## **SECTION I**

### **1. Resolution on the death of Professor Charles J. Adams**

The Dean of Arts, Professor Manfredi, rose and read the following death resolution, which was subsequently unanimously approved:

It is with sadness that I report the death of Professor Charles J. Adams, who died in Mesa, Arizona on March 23 of this year. He was associated with the Institute of Islamic Studies in various capacities from 1952 until his retirement in 1988, and served as its Director from 1964 until 1980.

Charles Adams was born in Houston, Texas on April 24, 1924. He undertook his undergraduate studies at Baylor University, but these were interrupted by World War II when he served from 1942 to 1945 in the US Air Force as an airborne radio operator and mechanic. After completing his university studies at Baylor, he obtained his B.A. in 1947 and later enrolled as a graduate student in the Divinity School of the University of Chicago, where he studied History of Religions with Joachim Wach. During his years of graduate studies, he taught at Princeton, served briefly with a photo reconnaissance squadron in the Korean War, and won a Ford Foundation scholarship with a research residency in Pakistan. Meanwhile he had begun since 1952 his long association with McGill University's Institute of Islamic Studies, just founded in that year by Professor Wilfred Cantwell Smith. Charles Adams was first a non-degree graduate student at the Institute of Islamic Studies, then an instructor, and in 1960 he was appointed assistant professor—to be later promoted to associate and full professor.

As director, Adams continued Cantwell Smith's vision of studying Islam both as a living religion and as one with a long and complex history. For Smith and Adams, this would be achieved through the promotion of a respectful interaction of faculty and students of various faiths, Muslims and others, constantly seeking deeper understanding. Under his directorship, the Institute continued to attract well-known scholars as teachers, researchers, and visiting professors, and graduate students from North America, the Muslim world, and elsewhere for M.A. and Ph.D. degrees. And with his efforts, it continued to attract financial support from foundations and governments for scholarships, professorships, and library acquisitions, and it achieved international repute.

He was also active as a promoter of Islamic Studies on the international stage, having helped found the Middle East Studies Association of North America, established the Teheran Branch of the Institute of Islamic Studies, which remarkably survived the Revolution and continues to this day, and through his numerous contributions to a variety of encyclopedias and other publications. His teaching left an important mark on Islamic studies, as his students would go on to attain major positions in North America and the Islamic world.

Charles Adams will be remembered by his students and colleagues as a dedicated scholar and a successful academic administrator, and also as someone with a deep passion for the people of the Muslim world and a genuine appreciation for their culture and arts.

## **2. Report of the Steering Committee**

The report of the Steering Committee (10-11:09) was received.

*Item 1. Approval of Minutes of Senate.* On motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved the minutes of the April 27, 2011 meeting.

*Item 2. Speaking Rights.* On motion duly proposed and seconded, speaking rights were granted to Ms. Suzanne Smith, Director, Animal Compliance and Professor Jim Clark, Associate Dean (Academic), Faculty of Engineering, for item IIB2 (429th Report of the Academic Policy Committee).

## **3. Adoption of the Agenda**

On motion duly proposed and seconded, the agenda was adopted.

## **4. Chair's Remarks**

The Chair opened her remarks by congratulating McGill students and alumni who recently won seats in the last federal election. She noted that the administration expects the first action of the government will be to release a budget based on the one table on March 22, which has several items of importance to universities. There will be another round of Canada Excellence Research Chair competitions for which McGill is actively working to develop robust proposals. Of note there is a new brain research fund of \$100 million, which McGill is positioned to compete well for due to its outstanding expertise in the neurosciences. Another area that McGill has been promoting is finding federal support for strategic internationally collaborations to link research and student mobility. The Chair spoke about McGill's advocacy efforts regarding funding for social sciences and humanities research from the granting councils.

The Chair told Senate that the administration has been working to have politicians and civil servants visit the University because this often helps government to understand McGill's needs and turn them into the University's advocates at the federal and provincial levels. At the provincial level McGill continues to work on the *entente de partenariat* to shield universities from Bill 100 implications of accountability, reporting, and action. In addition, CREPUQ and the provincial government will be discussing the amendments to Bill 130, which, among other things, create greater administrative integration among the three provincial granting councils.

McGill and other universities are cautiously supportive of Bill 130, subject to a number of principles. Those include the need for the new organization to maintain balance between the three sectors, to ensure good governance and to have the resources necessary to further support fundamental research, and to develop interdisciplinary, interuniversity and intersectoral collaborations. Minister Gignac introduced amendments to this Bill, recommending that: the three distinct granting councils be maintained, each with a distinct board of directors; each board would be chaired by a Chief Scientist; and management of each fund would be shared between the Chief Scientist and the Scientific Director General.

With respect to Bill 127, which affects the relationship between universities and their affiliated teaching hospitals, the Chair noted that the reduction of university representation on teaching hospital boards has been decreased from four to two. Although this represents an increase from the initial government proposal, the Principal noted that this level of representation is still too low. Since there are six undesignated positions on these boards, the University will need to work hard to recommend members to these positions that the hospitals and its constituents will approve.

Regarding the MBA program, the Principal expressed disappointment in the government's response, particularly in light of the way that the program has performed. The University has been working with the Ministère de l'éducation, du loisir et du sport (MELS) to seek mechanisms for resolving the different positions that will recognize that the MBA is a self-funded program. The University needs to offer a program that is consistent with its mission of quality, but it is important to understand the MELS perspective, and explore accommodations that may be important from a government position. The Principal informed Senate that it updates would be provided as developments occur.

The Chair spoke about the taxation of postdoctoral fellows. She reminded Senate that since the 2010 tax year, when Canada Revenue Agency declared that postdoctoral fellowships would be taxable, postdoctoral fellows have been affected by a substantial decline in their real levels of financial support. The 2010 Federal tax law removes postdoctoral scholars from the Educational Tax Credit, taxing postdoctoral fellowships as income. The change has met with mixed response from stakeholders across the country, but has been denounced by the Canadian Association for Graduate Students, the Canadian Association of Postdoctoral Scholars, and l'Association des doyens des études supérieures au Québec. Unfortunately, all groups represented at the Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada, with the exception of those from Quebec, stated formally that this is not a fight worth fighting. This is mainly because postdocs outside of Quebec are already taxed provincially. Furthermore, a concentration of postdocs in Quebec and more importantly at McGill, Université de Montréal, and Laval has made this a parochial issue, even at the Quebec level. The Chair informed Senate that the four universities affected have taken the collective stance that postdocs should be the status of *stagiaire* and be included in MELS operating grant calculations.

## **SECTION II**

### **PART A – Questions and Motions by Members**

None

## **PART B – Motions and Reports from Organs of the University Government**

### **1. Achieving Strategic Academic Priorities (D10-64)**

The Provost presented the progress report on Achieving Strategic Academic Priorities (ASAP), the next White Paper. He noted that the changes in the budget should be understood in light of the academic priorities articulated in the White Paper 2006, and ASAP going forward. The University aims to identify and measure top academic priorities, but there will need to be compromises due to financial constraints. Those priorities that are identified will need to be coordinated with the Vice-Principal (Administration and Finance)'s work on the physical Master Plan for the campus' development, and the Vice-Principal (Research and International Relations) work on the Strategic Research Plan, as well as the Principal's Task Force and its related recommendations. These elements will need to be used to provide the University with a flexible roadmap for McGill's strategic direction over the coming five years.

The Provost presented the progress report as distributed in document D10-64, noting that consultation will take place through the summer and Fall with a presentation to Senate for feedback in September and approval in December.

Senator Doyle suggested the creation of a database to coordinate cross-disciplinary research.

Senator Janda suggested that students should be involved in working groups formed for the consultation process and that the Senate Nominating Committee could supply some of the names. He also suggested that Senate should have an opportunity to discuss ASAP at an additional meeting in October before the consultation process is completed. The Provost replied that he needed to organize working groups for consultation now, and the Nominating Committee could not submit names to Senate until the fall. He noted that he was consulting with the deans to ensure student involvement and once the consultation process is complete there will be ample time for Senate to provide feedback.

Senator Cuello noted the importance of strategic objective four because cross-disciplinary relationships will positively affect the long-term output of the University. However, strategic objective five was a source of concern because academic staff are increasingly burdened with obligations related to support services that detract from their academic output. The Provost acknowledged this problem and assured Senate that there is concern in the administration. Increasing reporting requirements have placed less emphasis on professors and more importance on government accountability. He noted that the Associate Provost (Policies, Procedures and Equity) has a mandate to streamline these processes and the concerns related to that priority are the reason it is in the ASAP paper.

Senator Richard asked if object nine is intended to support a virtue that already exists, or does it indicate a deficiency that has been identified. The Provost replied that the University wants to protect a virtue that already exists.

Senator Possian identified the need to define interdisciplinary, and that a course should be developed to address interdisciplinary thinking. The Provost replied that the University is

considering these issues, and as early as last year the Dean of Education ran a two-day symposium on interdisciplinary thinking.

Senator Barney expressed the opinion that the extent to which diversity of opinion is protected at McGill is debatable. He suggested that McGill should support principally and materially those venues where diversity of opinion is fostered and pursued.

Senator Caplan asked for clarification about how cluster hiring affects the University's ability to do other types of hiring, and what constitutes a cluster hire. The Provost replied that there is no definite answer as to how many hires in a given area constitute a cluster. He noted that the process is intended to identifying and building strengths across the University.

Senator Caplan said that ASAP reveals inherent tensions between priorities such as teaching, research, and service to the University. He noted that it is impossible to excel in all these areas due to time constraints. Regarding Key Performance Indicators (KPI), Senator Caplan noted that this type of quantitative analysis needs to be accompanied by a qualitative analysis in order to be meaningful. The Provost agreed that qualitative analysis will be important to fully understand KPIs.

Senator Wade said that as the University seeks more interdisciplinary linkages, it must also maintain excellence in core areas. He asked what proportion of the academic priorities will be derived from a consultative cross-faculty process and what proportion are already determined by compacts with the individual faculties. The Provost replied that the compacts with the faculties are expressions of the agreements the University had in 2006 that were, for the most part, derived from consultative processes.

Senator Blom hoped that the consultation process would not be made impossible by timelines that were too short.

Senator Blatchford asked if the report is based on principles or on operationalization. The Provost replied that the document is based on principle in order to facilitate flexibility for implementation from year to year.

Senator Abaki noted that the Students' Society of McGill University (SSMU) has over 300 clubs, but much of the work that they undertake is undocumented. In response, SSMU will be documenting its activities over the summer in order to better communicate and celebrate them. The Chair noted that the larger University is undertaking a similar activity in communicating the many activities it does that benefit the larger Quebec community. She noted that SSMU's efforts can be seen as a building block to that larger communication effort.

Senator Piper asked if the focus on interdisciplinary research will consider processes that will shape such things as creating new courses more quickly. The Provost replied that processes are important, but the creation of courses is a faculty level issue. He noted that the creation of institutes and programs that encompass interdisciplinary issues can be created quickly so long as there is a strong drive to create them at the local level; however, he acknowledged the Senator's

experience and agreed that the processes for the creation of interdisciplinary courses should be easier.

Senator Possian said that the question of diversity goes beyond mere inclusion of under-represented groups, but also these groups' actual experiences should be documented.

## **2. 429<sup>th</sup> Report of the Academic Policy Committee (D10-65)**

Senate discussed the Bachelor's in Engineering, Major in Bioengineering program.

Senator Deguise noted that the program has been rushed through the governance process, which did not follow a regular route. Furthermore, there are questions as to whether the University has the resources to run such a program. The Provost noted that the program would not have been presented to APC and Senate unless the administration had the assurances of the Dean that the resources existed for its implementation. He noted that all approvals to this point have been contingent on guarantees that the resources exist.

The Dean of Engineering told Senate that this program is important to McGill since peer institutions already have such programs in place. He noted that the program is forecast to recruit an additional 40 to 50 students per year to the Faculty of Engineering, which will bring additional resources to the University. In addition, the economic plan for the program also includes recruitment for several academic positions.

The Deputy Provost (Student Life and Learning) noted that although this program took an unusual route to Senate, this was only intended to facilitate eventual approval rather than be stalled due to a ridged adherence to process.

Senator Bishop asked if there were plans to expand into a graduate program. The Dean of Engineering replied that would be a long-term objective once the program had established itself at the undergraduate level.

Senator Leask asked for reassurances that the resources for the program would be available, and that the implementation of the new program would not divert resources such as teaching assistants, faculty renewal, and research space from other programs. The Provost replied that it is not Senate's responsibility to debate how a dean allocates a budget within a faculty. All new positions within the Faculty of Engineering will be allocated through an activity based budgeting program.

Senator Abaki noted that there needs to be some sort of assurances at APC that a program is financially viable.

Senator Doyle asked if the administrative resources would be available considering that the Aerospace Institute and the Sustainable Engineering Institute formed last year are struggling. The Dean of Engineering replied that the two institutes mentioned are self-funded and thriving.

On a motion duly proposed and seconded, the Bachelor's in Engineering, Major in Bioengineering program was approved.

Senate discussed the Policy on the Study and Care of Animals.

Senator Wade noted that level of oversight required by the Policy goes beyond the available resources for its actual implementation. The Director of Animal Compliance acknowledged that the documentation requirements are burdensome, but that the University has authorized the purchase of new software that will significantly reduce the work involved.

Senator Wolfson asked if the wording "affiliated institution" or "affiliated hospital" could explicitly include the McGill University Health Centre, the Lady Davis Institute, the Shriners Hospital and the Jewish General Hospital in the policy. The Chair accepted the suggested change as a friendly amendment.

On a motion duly proposed and seconded, the Policy on the Study and Care of Animals program was approved with a friendly amendment to clarify that the McGill University Health Centre, the Lady Davis Institute, the Shriners Hospital and the Jewish General Hospital are affiliated hospitals.

### **3. Update on the Administrative Response to the CASP Report on Academic Salary Differentials by Gender (Equity Report) (D10-66)**

The Associate Provost (Policies, Procedures, and Equity) presented the Update on the Administrative Response to the CASP Report on Academic Salary Differentials by Gender (D10-66). The report compared salary differentials by gender in 2008 and 2011, excluding small faculties for statistical purposes. The report noted some disparities in certain faculties, but the Associate Provost (Policies, Procedures, and Equity) explained that the results may be skewed because certain high paying departments are at the moment male dominated. Although the reasons for specific disparities were understood, further study was necessary to explain macro level differences in salary at the University. Of note, female professors at McGill are under-represented as Canada Research Chairs (CRC) in relation to their proportional representation at the University.

In response to salary differentials by gender, the University is studying and attempting to mitigate the problem. Specifically, when hiring, departments must submit equity reports to show that women and other under-represented groups were considered for positions; the University now submits internal nominations for female CRCs; mentoring programs are being instituted in traditionally male dominated fields to encourage female participation and success; and equity related information is being automated to better monitor progress.

Senator Zorychta noted that the under-representation of female CRCs is a nationwide problem.

Senator Wolfson noted that the University needs a larger data set in order to do a longitudinal data analysis of salaries from twenty-five years ago to today. The Provost replied that the data does not exist for that type of study. The University only has data going back to 2002 when the



human resources system was implemented to monitor these issues. The Provost noted that this report was not intended to provide analysis, but instead to give a picture of what exists.

Senator Wade asked that the average career lengths could be provided in future reports.

Senator Caplan noted that since the University may not have access to the data, it may want to speak to people explain their specific situations. The Provost replied that the data was intended to present tendencies rather than exceptional circumstances.

**4. Appointment of Assessors under the Policy on Harassment, Sexual Harassment, and Discrimination Prohibited by Law (D10-67)**

The Provost presented the recommendations for the appointment of assessors for Harassment, Sexual Harassment, and Discrimination Prohibited by Law for approval.

On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved the appointment of Ms. Susan Czarnocki as an assessor representing administrative and support staff under the Policy on Harassment, Sexual Harassment and Discrimination Prohibited by Law for a three-year term ending May 31, 2014.

Senate further approved the extension of Ms. Patricia Tuck's appointment as an assessor representing administrative and support staff under the Policy on Harassment, Sexual Harassment and Discrimination Prohibited by Law until the required consultation process to identify her successor can be completed.

**5. Report of the Senate Nominating Committee (D10-68)**

On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved the recommendations contained in the Report of the Senate Nominating Committee (D10-68).

**6. Report of the Board of Governors to Senate (D10-69)**

The Chair presented the Report of the Board of Governors to Senate (D10-69) for information.

**7. Motion to Amend the McGill University Statutes (D10-70)**

The Secretary-General proposed that Senate's February 16, 2011 approval of the name change of the Centre for Continuing Education be changed to the School of Continuing Studies (SCS) – École d'éducation permanente (ÉÉP) serve as the notice of motion to change the McGill University Statutes regarding the name change.

On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate agreed to accept the February 16, 2011 approval of the name change of the Centre for Continuing Education be changed to the School of Continuing Studies (SCS) – École d'éducation permanente (ÉÉP) serve as the notice of motion.

On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved, and recommended to the Board of Governors for approval, that in all relevant articles of the McGill University Statutes and University regulations that require Senate's approval the name of the Centre for Continuing Education be changed to the School of Continuing Studies (SCS) – École d'éducation permanente (ÉÉP).

The Secretary-General proposed the wording of the *Dean of the School of Continuing Studies – Doyen(ne) de l'École d'éducation permanente* be altered to Dean of Continuing Studies – Doyen(ne) d'éducation permanente in order to be consistent with other decanal titles at McGill University.

On a motion duly proposed and seconded, Senate approved, and recommended to the Board of Governors, in all relevant articles of the McGill University Statutes and University regulations that require Senate's approval, the title of the Dean of Continuing Education be changed to the Dean of Continuing Studies – Doyen(ne) d'éducation permanente.

#### **8. Senate Calendar of Dates 2011-2012 (D10-71)**

The Secretary-General presented the Senate Calendar of Dates for 2011-2012 (D10-71) for information.

#### **9. Other Business**

There being no other business to deal with at the meeting, on motion duly proposed and seconded, the meeting adjourned at 5:20 p.m.

END

The complete documents, including presentations at Senate, are kept as part of the official minutes.