

# **The Tenure Process 2011-2012**

Lydia White  
Associate Provost  
(Policies, Procedures & Equity)



# Context

- The aim of this session is to clarify tenure procedures at McGill, for those of you being considered for tenure in 2011-2012.
- Much of what we will be discussing is contained within the *Regulations Relating to the Employment of Academic Staff*.
- It is advisable to familiarize yourselves with these Regulations, if you have not already done so.
- The regulations are available at:  
<http://www.mcgill.ca/secretariat/policies/academic/>



# Academic duties

Criteria for tenure are based on performance in the following academic duties:

- Teaching (e.g. undergraduate and graduate courses; supervision of students)
- Research and other Original Scholarly Activities, and Professional Activities
- Other Contributions to the University and scholarly communities



# Some Basic Responsibilities

Candidates must exercise due diligence in preparing and pursuing the case for tenure

- Establishing they have met the requirements for tenure
- Assembling the parts of the tenure dossier for which they are responsible



# Dossier

## Prepared by the candidate

(to be submitted by Sept 1st)

- Curriculum vitae
- Personal statement
- ➔ Record of **research**, scholarship, professional activities and contributions
- ➔ Record of **teaching**  
(see Teaching Portfolio: Regulations, Appendix A)
- ➔ General **contributions to University & scholarly community**
- Other materials the Candidate may wish to submit



# Dossier

Additional items (added after Sept 1st):

- External evaluator reports
- Items (if any) added by DTC Chair (pre-Nov. 15)
- Items (if any) added by Candidate with explanation (pre-Nov. 15)
- New material, if requested by DTC, UTC or the Principal (or delegate) to clarify an issue that has arisen during deliberations (post-Nov. 15)



# External Evaluators

- Provide an evaluation of the candidate's research and scholarship.
- Must be of recognized standing and qualified to provide an evaluation.
- Must not be in the employ of McGill University.
- Must not be current or former supervisors, students, or individuals with whom the Candidate has or has had a close personal or professional relationship, or individuals who, in the past six years, have been departmental colleagues or collaborators.



# External evaluators

- 3 evaluations must be solicited by Sec-Gen
- Only the Secretary-General may communicate with evaluators
- No one can approach other evaluators or outside parties concerning a Candidate
- Exception. Where the UTC lacks sufficient information on research and scholarship, it can approach additional evaluators from the list of externals.





# Criteria

## **Focus:**

- Candidate's performance of academic duties

## **Standard required:**

- **Superior** performance in **two** categories
- **Reasonable** performance in the **third**



# Criteria

- Performance, not promise
- Performance during tenure-track period, rather than before (Exception: early tenure candidates)
- Whole record during tenure-track period (all years and all duties)
- No overflow from one category to another
- No double counting of achievements



# Levels of Tenure Review

Three levels of review:

- **DTC** – Departmental tenure committee
- **UTC** – University tenure committee
- **Principal** or delegate (**Provost**)



# Tenure Committees: DTC

- DTC Chair is normally the Head of the academic unit
- Minimum membership – 4 (plus Chair)
- Committee members – must be tenured
- No individual can simultaneously serve on a candidate's DTC and UTC



# Tenure Committees: UTC

- UTC Chair is normally the Dean of the Faculty
- UTC consists of 6 members (5 plus the Dean)
- 2 members appointed by the Dean from **Faculty list**
- 3 members assigned by the Secretary-General from the **Senate list**
- UTC members cannot be from the same department as the candidate



# Joint Appointments

- Chair of DTC determined by both Dept. Chairs
- Membership of DTC determined by both Dept. Chairs
- Chair of UTC determined by (both) Deans
- Faculty list UTC members determined by (both) Deans
- Secretary-General appoints Senate list members



# Committee Recommendations

- Objectivity, impartiality and fairness
- Recommendations to be based solely on performance of academic duties
- Recommendations to be based solely on the record of the Candidate's case before the committee
- Must provide substantive reasons to support assessment of Candidate's performance in each of three areas



# Committee Recommendations

- Recommendations may:
  - Be unanimous
  - Contain a majority and one or more minority recommendations
- Where the decision is not unanimous, all recommendations and supporting reasons must be seen and reviewed by all members of the committee and must be submitted at the same time
- Reports of DTC and UTC must be signed by all members of the committee





# Tenure Timetable

## Phase I

- **Mid-April:** Candidate seeking early consideration must notify Chair and Dean fifteen working days before May 1.
- **By May 1:** Dean notifies Sec-General of ALL tenure Candidates (mandatory and early).
- **May-early June:** Candidate and Chair agree on list of eight (8) external evaluators.



# Tenure Timetable

- **By June 15:**
  - Candidate submits current CV to Chair
  - Chair sends Dean list of external evaluators (with justifications) and Candidate's CV
- **June 15 to September 1:**
  - UTC ranks list of external evaluators
- **By August 31:** If intending to make election to stop 'tenure clock', candidates must have done so by this date.



# Tenure Timetable

- **By September 1:**
  - Candidate is informed of the composition of DTC and UTC
  - UTC Chair forwards ranked list of external evaluators to Sec-General, with copy to Candidate and DTC Chair
  - Candidate submits to Sec-General:
    - ▶ five internal packages and
    - ▶ four external packages (=internal package minus the teaching)



# Tenure Timetable

## Phase II

- **Sept-Jan DTC meets**
- **Early September:**
  - Sec-Gen transmits internal package to DTC and UTC
  - Sec-Gen transmits external package to external evaluators
- **November 15**
  - Deadline for addition of material by DTC Chair
  - Deadline for submission by Candidate of new material on research and scholarly activities



# Tenure Timetable

- **Post November 15**

If requested by DTC Chair, Candidate may add new material to dossier, to address new issues that have arisen during consideration of the case.

- **November 25**

Sec-Gen transmits external evaluators' reports to DTC and UTC



# Tenure Timetable

## Phase III

- **Jan – Apr** UTC meets
- **January 25**
  - DTC submits final report to Secretary-General who transmits copy to Candidate and UTC.
  - UTC may seek further information from the Department Chair or from one or more additional external evaluators.



# Tenure Timetable

- **April 30**
  - Submission of UTC report to Secretary-General who transmits copy to the Principal, the Candidate and the Chair of DTC.
- **May-June**
  - Decision by the Principal/Provost and recommendation to the Board of Governors. Principal/Provost, if tending to a negative, communicates decision to Candidate within 25 working days of receipt of UTC report.



# Tending to Negative

Where DTC, UTC or the Principal/Provost is tending towards a negative decision, the candidate must be:

- advised in writing, with concerns/reasons
- given access to the substance of external evaluators' reports
- given reasonable time to prepare response
- given opportunity to address the concerns in person
- allowed advisor of choice





# Negative outcomes

- In the event that a candidate is not recommended for tenure:
- Appointment continues for up to one year.
- The candidate may file an appeal.



# Positive outcomes

- Most of you will NOT face a 'tending to the negative' situation.
- Even if you do, it is important to understand that candidates not only have the opportunity to address the committee's concerns but that in many cases they are successful in convincing the committee that a positive recommendation is appropriate.
- You will be informed of a positive outcome by end May/early June.



# Conclusion

- The tenure process seems intimidating but don't be intimidated!
- You can make the process easier for yourselves by planning ahead.
- Don't wait till the last minute to put your dossier together.
- Don't be afraid to ask for advice.
- If you need help in interpreting any aspect of the Regulations, feel free to email me:  
[lydia.white@mcgill.ca](mailto:lydia.white@mcgill.ca)