RELG 310  CANADIAN CHURCH HISTORY

A Reading Course survey of major developments in the history of the Christian Church in the Dominion of Canada from the arrival of the earliest missionaries up to the present day.

Place: Birks Seminar Room 017
Time: Tuesdays & Thursdays, 1:05 pm—2:25 pm

Professor: Torrance Kirby
Office Hours: Birks 206, Tuesdays and Thursdays, 10:00—11:00 am
Email: torrance.kirby@mcgill.ca

COURSE SYLLABUS—FALL TERM 2021

Date     Reading

2 September  INTRODUCTION

7 September  I. THE CHURCH IN NEW FRANCE
EARLY MISSIONS
Paul Le Jeune, SJ, Jesuit Relations (1634)

9 September  SULPICIAN SPIRITUALITY OF THE FRENCH SCHOOL
Pierre Cardinal de Bérulle, A Letter on the Priesthood (1644)

14 September  AN URSULINE EPIC
Marie-Emmanuel Chabot, The Life of Marie de l’Incarnation (1599-1672)
“Madwoman of God”, National Film Board

16 September  A MOHAWK SAINT
Kateri Tekakwitha (1656-1680), Allan Greer, “The Mohawk who converted a Jesuit”

21 September  II. AFTER THE CONQUEST
PROVINCE OF QUEBEC
Royal Proclamation (1763)
British North America Act: “L’Acte de Québec” (1774)
Mandamus of Monsignor Jean-Olivier Briand (1775)

23 September  NEW LIGHT IN THE MARITIME PROVINCES
Henry Alline, Hymns and Spiritual Songs (1797)

28 September  LOYALIST NOVA SCOTIA
The Rt Rev and Hon Charles Inglis, Steadfastness in Religion and Loyalty recommended in a Sermon in the House of Assembly (1793)

30 November  SCOTCH PRESBYTERIANS IN PICTOU COUNTY
The Rev Thomas McCulloch, The Mephibosheth Stepsure Letters (1822)

5 October  CHURCH OF ENGLAND IN UPPER AND LOWER CANADA
The Rt Rev and Hon John Strachan, A Sermon Preached at York, Upper Canada, on the Death of the Late Lord Bishop of Quebec (1825)

Confirm Mid-Term Essay Topics
Please consult style sheet, essay-writing guidelines, and evaluation rubric.

7 October  TOLERATION AND THE CLERGY RESERVES
A Despatch from the Governor-General of Canada to Lord Russell (1840)
John Strachan, The Clergy Reserves, a letter to the Commissioner of Crown Lands (1854)
9-13 October  
**Thanksgiving Break**

Friday 15 October  
**CHURCH OF SCOTLAND IN CANADA**  

**III. OPENING UP THE WEST**

19 October  
**MISSION IN RUPERTSLAND**  
Sarah Tucker, *Rainbow in the North* (1851)

21 October  
**RED RIVER SETTLEMENT**  
Mid-term Essays (1500-2000 words) due at beginning of class.  
Essay Conferences to be scheduled for week of 3 November.

Friday 22 October  
**CLASS EXPEDITION TO QUEBEC CITY (provisional)**  
Tour of the Old Town, Ursuline Museum, Holy Trinity Cathedral

26 October  
**TIDINGS FROM THE YUKON**  
Mission Reports by W. Kirkby, W. Bompas, and Robert McDonald (1867)

28 October  
**RIEL REBELLION**  

2 November  
**IV. FROM CONFEDERATION TO THE GREAT WAR**  
**ULTRA-MONTANISM IN MONTREAL**  
Monsignor Ignace Bourget, Bishop of Montreal (1799-1885)  
Essay Conferences begin this week, Birks Building, Rm. 206.

4 November  
**MILLENIARISM IN THE WEST**  
Anthony Rasporich, “Utopia, Sect, and Millenium in Western Canada” (1870-1940)

9 November  
**SPIRIT WRESTLERS**  
Delevan L. Pierson, *How Spirit Wrestlers Came To Canada: Russian Doukhobors Universal Brotherhood Christians* (1900)

11 November  
**PREACHING DURING THE GREAT WAR**  
The Rev. Thomas Eakin, Principal of Knox College

16 November  
**V. CONTEMPORARY CHURCH**  
**CHURCH UNION**  
Subscription to the Basis of Union by the Members of the First General Council of the United Church of Canada (1925)  
*Waterloo Declaration* (2001)

18 November  
**UKRAINIAN ORTHODOXY**  
Archbishop Yurij Kalistchuk, *Letter to the Faithful of the Ukrainian Orthodox Church of Canada* (2012)

23 November  
**THE CHURCH AND HIGHER EDUCATION**  
George Grant, *Canadian Universities and the Protestant Churches* (1955)

25 November  
**FIRST NATIONS AND RESIDENTIAL SCHOOLS**  

30 November  
**THE QUIET REVOLUTION**  
David Seljak, “Why the Quiet Revolution was ‘Quiet’” (1996)

2 December  
**RELIGION AND SECULARITY**  
Rosalie Jukier and José Woehrling, “Religion and the Secular State in Canada” (2015)  
Term Research Essays (2500-3000 words) due at beginning of class.
EVALUATION
Preparation of assigned texts and engagement in tutorial discussion 40%
Mid-term Essay and Conference 30%
Term Research Essay 30%
Absence Policy: maximum of three un-excused absences permitted

Resolution passed by the McGill Senate, 29 September 2003: “McGill University values academic integrity. Therefore all students must understand the meaning and consequences of cheating, plagiarism, and other academic offences under the Code of Student Conduct and Disciplinary Procedures (see www.mcgill.ca/integrity for more information).”

In accord with McGill University’s Charter of Students’ Rights, students in this course have the right to submit in English or in French any written work that is to be graded.

ONLINE SOURCES
Anglican Church of Canada, Historical Documents: http://anglicanhistory.org/canada/
Archives of the Presbyterian Church in Canada: https://presbyterianarchives.ca/
Jesuit Relations. https://www.collectionscanada.ca/jesuit-relations/index-e.html
National Film Board of Canada: “Madwoman of God,” life of Marie de l’Incarnation
https://www.nfb.ca/film/madwoman_of_god/
United Church of Canada website: https://www.united-church.ca/

SELECT BIBLIOGRAPHY
Hay, Eldon. "Covenanter Settlers in the Chignecto Region." The Canadian Society of


"A Contest between a Missionary and a Medicine Woman," in Radford and Keller, 28.

"Marie of the Incarnation," 94-98.


"Kateri Tekakwitha,” document 18, 118-23.


Vernon P. Creviston, “‘No King unless it be a Constitutional King’: Rethinking the Place of the Quebec Act in the Coming of the American Revolution,” The Historian 73.3 (2011), 463-79.


ADDITIONAL BIBLIOGRAPHY—compiled by Prof. Alan Hayes, Wycliffe College, University of Toronto
Phyllis D. Airhart, “‘As Canadian as Possible Under the Circumstances’: Reflections on the Study of Protestantism in North America” in New Directions in American Religious History, ed. Harry Stout and D.G. Hart
Phyllis D. Airhart, Serving the Present Age: Revivalism, Progressivism, and the Methodist Tradition in Canada
Reginald Bibby, Fragmented Gods
Reginald Bibby, Unknown Gods
Robert Birkinshaw, Pilgrims in Lotus Land: Conservative Protestantism in British Columbia, 1917-81
S.D. Clark, Church and Sect in Canada
Brian P. Clarke, Piety and Nationalism.
Goldwin French, Parsons and Politics: The Role of the Wesleyan Methodists in Upper Canada and the Maritimes from 1780-1855
Michael Gauvreau, The Evangelical Century: College and Creed in English Canada from the Great Revival to the Great Depression
John Webster Grant, The Church in the Canadian Era, updated and expanded (Burlington: Welch, 1988)
John Webster Grant, Profusion of Spires
John Webster Grant, Moon of Wintertime: Missionaries and the Indians of Canada in Encounter since 1534.


I. **General Works on the United Church Of Canada**
*Touchstone* [a United Church publication that has published many articles related to topics covered in this course as well as biographical profiles of many of its leaders]

II. **General works on the Presbyterian Church in Canada**

III. **Other resources for research and writing**
James E. Bradley, *Church History: An Introduction to Research, Reference Works, and Methods*
Wayne C. Booth, *The Craft of Research*
Norman F. Cantor and Richard I. Schneider, *How to Study History*
Deborah Core, *The Seminary Student Writes*
Wendy Fletcher-March and Norman Knowles, *Researching, Writing and Celebrating Parish History*
F.N. McCoy, *Researching and Writing in History: A Practical Handbook for Students*
Allan Nevin, *The Gateway to History*
Robin W. Winks ed., *The Historian as Detective: Essays on Evidence*
James P. Wind, *Places of Worship: Exploring Their History* (1990) [on doing congregational history]
ESSAYS AND TERM-PAPERS

Individual professors will specify the length of papers, though the text of term-papers, excluding endnotes and bibliography, is usually fifteen (15) to twenty (20) pages (3750 to 5000 words) long. Individual professors will also generally give specifications about research protocols and methodologies.

In the Human Sciences, there is an increasing tendency to use the "author-date" system of documentation. This is rapidly replacing the older "footnote-bibliography" system and is recommended by this style sheet. The author-date system is more efficient and takes up less space. Instead of footnotes or endnotes, all references are placed within the body of the paper by noting in brackets simply the author's name, the date of publication when necessary, and the page number(s). A List of References with full bibliographic data is then given at the end of the paper. (Examples are given below in sec. IV A-C).

Since some professors may wish to retain the footnote-bibliography system, section IV D below gives examples for this kind of procedure.

RESPONSIBILITY

Students are responsible for checking the accuracy of all citations and quotations in their papers.

Failure to document a paper properly may result in a charge of plagiarism, which is a serious offence and grounds for expulsion from the University. Plagiarism is the unacknowledged use of another person's words or ideas, usually those which have appeared in published form. Sometimes inexperienced students mistakenly think that research consists in copying out information from encyclopedias and other reference works. Not only is this not what research is, it technically constitutes plagiarism if the resource works are not properly acknowledged. Research is the collection of data for purposes of the development, clarification, and support of one's own ideas and arguments. A research paper is the report on the results of this kind of investigation.

STYLISTIC GUIDELINES FOR TYPESCRIPTS

Title-page

For a short paper, type the title two (2) or three (3) inches from the top of the page on which the paper begins, double space, and type the student's name, double space again, and start the paper. For a longer paper use a title page, including title, writer's name and student number, course number and name, and date. In this case the title does not appear on the first page of the text.
Page Numbers
The title page, the preface and the table of contents, when used, are unnumbered, as is the first page of the text. Each succeeding page is numbered with an Arabic numeral beginning with page 2. Numerals should be placed in the top right-hand corner, one inch (26 mm) from the top and side edges of the paper. No abbreviations, such as p. or pg., should be used with the numeral.

Format
All papers should be typed double-spaced on one side of the page with adequate margins (1 1/2 inch, 38 mm, for top, bottom, and left-hand margins; 1 inch, 26 mm, for right hand margin). Double-spacing should be used throughout, except for extended quotations, endnotes, and the List of References, which are single-spaced with a double space between separate items. Paragraph indentations should be eight (8) spaces.

Spelling
Following standard Canadian usage, spelling should conform to the Oxford English Dictionary (i.e. "British" spelling). Please note that the O.E.D. prefers the ending -ize to -ise for verbs and related formations: civilize, not civilise; civilization, not civilisation.

For students trained to use American spelling, usage should conform to Webster's Third International Dictionary. What should be avoided is mixing the two spelling systems. If the student uses a word-processor with a spelling check, the system of spelling for which the check is programmed should be determined and followed consistently.

Punctuation
Punctuation should be light and follow the rules of grammar rather than the way in which you hear the text in your head. In practice this means eliminating most non-grammatical commas.

Double quotation marks should be used exclusively, except for quotations within quotations, where single quotation marks are used. Full-stops and commas at the end of a quotation should be placed within the closing quotation marks regardless of whether they belong to the quotation or not; colons and semicolons should be placed outside the closing quotation marks. An exception to this rule is when a reference in brackets occurs immediately after the quotation. In this case there is no final mark of punctuation, the quotation marks close the quotation, the reference is given in brackets, and the sentence ends with a full-stop, thus "... irrational rules of uncleanness" (Douglas 1966, 13).

Square brackets are used for parenthetical material within round brackets.

See also Abbreviations, sec. IV D 2 below.

Quotations
Short quotations should be included within the body of the text and enclosed in double quotation marks. Longer quotations (over five lines) should be set off from the body of the text as a block quotation by indenting five spaces and single spacing. In the latter case, quotation marks should not be used unless they belong to the passage quoted. Verse quotations should be centred on the page.

Dates
Dates should be given in the order: day, month, year (e.g. 21 March 1685). The abbreviations B.C.E. and C.E. are recommended, though B.C. and A.D. may be used. A.D. always precedes the year.

References
In the author-date system all footnotes should be eliminated. The material that would go into them should either be incorporated into the main text or be deleted. All references must be included in short form within term-papers, with full bibliographic data given in the List of References at the end.

For a quotation within the text, the reference is given in brackets immediately after the quotation.
In the case of reference to a single book or article by a single author, the author's surname and the page number(s) of the book or article are placed within the brackets, e.g. (Maritain 74-75). Where more than one book or article by a single author is cited, the date of publication of each work is placed immediately after the author's surname, e.g. (Douglas 1966, 13). For more than one item for the same year, the letters a, b, c, etc are placed after the date.

If reference is made to more than one author with the same surname, the author's initials or first name is placed before the surname, e.g. (Mary Douglas 70).

If a work in more than one volume is cited, the volume number is given in upper-case Roman numerals immediately before the page number(s) and followed by a comma, e.g. (Brown II, 101-102).

For works by two authors or editors, both surnames are cited, followed by the page number(s), e.g. (Morton and McLeman 45). When there are three or more authors or editors, the surname of the first author is cited, followed by the Latin phrase et al. (Kee et al. 40-41).

In the case of well-known general reference works, such as The Encyclopaedia Britannica or the Oxford English Dictionary, no information need be given in brackets in the text of the paper. It is sufficient merely to name the work quoted. For signed articles in more specialized reference works, such as the Encyclopedia of Religion or the Encyclopedia of Philosophy, the author's name and the volume and page numbers are given, e.g. (Joy VII, 105-06). In both cases, the reference sources are included in the List of References at the end of the paper. For examples see IV C 6 below.

Since classical and biblical texts are not copyrighted, they can be cited in brackets in the text of a paper without the usual reference apparatus. Where, however, particular editions of classical and other ancient texts are used, these should be included in the List of References. The translation of the Bible that is being cited should be mentioned in the text of the paper; if more than one translation is used, this can be noted in brackets after the reference, e.g. Mt 25:31-46 (RSV) = Matthew 25:31-46 (Revised Standard Version). It is advisable to use abbreviations, but they should follow a standard and consistent system. For biblical citations, consult New Testament Studies 34, 3 (1988): 476-79 and Journal of Biblical Literature 107, 3 (1988): 579-96 (the latter also provides citation forms for pseudepigraphal and early patristic texts, Targuus, Talmud, Nag Hammadi and Qumran texts). For classical Greek and Latin texts, the abbreviations listed at the beginning of the Oxford Classical Dictionary, 2nd ed., are recommended. See IV C 7 below.

Full bibliographic data for books and articles are given in a list at the end of the term-paper and are arranged alphabetically by the authors' surnames.

The following examples may prove helpful.

**A. Internal References**

*One book by one author*

"The serpent indeed was persuasive, as the Bible reports" (Brams 22).

*More than one book by one author*

"Robertson Smith used the idea of survivals to account for the persistence of irrational rules of uncleanness" (Douglas 1966, 13).

"Social intercourse requires that unintended or irrelevant organic processes should be screened out" (Douglas 1973,100).

*One article by one author*
"You might expect that English writers would partake of the national character, at any rate to the extent of dodging discussion of the metaphysics of their form" (Kermode 62).

More than one article by one author

"Writing and text are not one and the same problem" (Ricoeur 1975-76, 17).

"It is the naming of God by the biblical texts that specifics the religious at the interior of the poetic" (Ricoeur 1979, 219).

B. Corresponding List of References at End of Papers


N.B. Bibliographic entries are arranged alphabetically by author's surname. For more than one entry under the same surname, the items are arranged chronologically. Alternatively, they may be arranged alphabetically by the initial letter of the first main word of the title ("A" and "The" excluded). For short papers, however, chronological arrangement is recommended. A common practice is to displace the date of publication to immediately after the author's surname. In this case, the publication date is not repeated after the name of the publisher or the journal number.

C. Some Special Cases

A work by more than one author


A Translation


A work in more than one volume (also an example of a reprint of an older edition)


An edited collection of articles


A single article from an edited collection


Entries and articles in Encyclopaedias and Dictionaries

General
Specialized

Biblical and Classical Texts

Biblical
Gen 1:2; Exod 3:4, 6, 8 and 13:9-14:4; Mt 23:23-24, 29-33; Lk 16:19-31; 2 Cor 1:3-4. JV = King James Version; RSV = Revised Standard Version; NEB = New English Bible; JB = Jerusalem Bible.

Classical
Homer, Il. XVI. 6-19; Od. I. 1-5. Ovid, Met. X. 79-85. References to Plato should be included in the text, using the Stephanus pagination (e.g. Symposium I 79e-180b), though if a translation is used it should be listed in the References. Likewise, for Aristotle the Bekker pagination is used (e.g. Eth. Nic. VI. i:ll30a2-17). Again, translations should be included in the List of References.

D. Use of the Footnote-Bibliography System

Format
When this system is used, footnotes are numbered consecutively through the paper. They may be placed either at the bottom of each page, beneath a line drawn for twenty spaces, or at the end of the paper. In the latter case, they are simply Notes or Endnotes.

Foot- or endnotes should be single-spaced with double spacing between each entry.

Notes of this type are punctuated as a single sentence, without inversion of the author's names.

Examples:

Book

Article
2 Paul Ricoeur, "Naming God," Union Seminary Quarterly Review 34 (1979): 215. Observe the following characteristics:

The same indentation as for paragraphs (8 spaces) is used.

The number is placed half a space above the author's first name, or superscript is used.

The normal order of names is used; i.e. first name, or initials, surname.

A comma follows the author's name.

The title of a book is underlined, while the title of an article is placed in double quotation marks.

In the case of a book, there is no comma between the title and the publication data given in brackets.

In the case of an article, a comma is used after the title and within the closing quotation marks.

For books, the publication data are enclosed in round brackets in the order: first-listed place of publication (followed by a colon), publisher (followed by a comma), date of publication (which is always the date following the copyright symbol on the back of the title page; in the case of a
revised edition, it is the second or latest copyright date).

For articles, the name of the journal follows the title of the article and is underlined; it is followed by the volume number of the journal in Arabic numerals (convert Roman numerals to Arabic), the year of the journal in brackets, a colon, and the page number(s) without the abbreviation p. or pp.

**Further examples**

*An edited collection of articles*


*An article from an edited collection*


*A translation*


Note that the abbreviations ed., eds., trans. are not followed by the preposition "by."

**Abbreviations**

It is becoming increasingly the practice in academic writing to abbreviate the words University and Press as U and P. This procedure may be followed if used consistently. Likewise, for American publications the postal abbreviations for states may be used. These should be used only when confusion with another place of publication could occur. For example:

(Chicago: U of Chicago P. 1968);


The abbreviation Ibid. (thus, without underlining) is used only when a footnote refers to the same source that is cited in the immediately preceding footnote. The abbreviation Op.cit. should be avoided. When a single source is cited frequently in a paper, the surname of the author should be used, followed by a comma and the page number(s). If more than one work by the same author is referred to, the order is: author's surname, short title, page number(s).

Examples:

Kermode, p. 63.

Ricoeur, "Philosophical Hermeneutics," p. 25.

**Bibliography**

With the footnote-bibliography system, the bibliography follows the same format as that given above (sec. IV B-C) for the List of References in the author-date system. The only exception is that in listing more than one work by the same author, the order is always alphabetical by first key-word of the title rather than chronological.
SOME GUIDELINES FOR WRITING TERM ESSAYS

Introduction
Writing essays may well be the opportunity for you to learn more about the subject you are studying than any other aspect of a course. It is worth doing well. You not only learn more, you also think more deeply about a topic when you have to put words on paper. Finally good grades depend on good papers.

I Collecting Information
Opinion is a fine thing, but in an essay your opinions are only worthwhile if they are backed up by facts and arguments. You must collect information, and, since many topics will be new to you, it is worthwhile looking at the work and opinions of more than one author. You should certainly look at your textbook but also at other authors. Your professors will always be willing to give suggestions.

As well as your textbook, you should learn to use the library as a source of information. Make it a top priority to learn how to find a book in the Library.

II Recording Information
It is no use to just read a book and then write. You must record what you read so that you can review it before and during the writing of the essay. There are a number of ways to do this:

- You can mark the book - only if it is your own copy or a photocopy - with pencils or highlighting pens. You cannot use this method on Library books and it is of limited use as it can be difficult to locate what is really important if you have marked up half a book. It also reduces the resale value of books.

- You can use 3”x5” index cards and note down one, or a series of connected facts, on a card. You then use the cards to organize the information in the way you want to use it in the paper. One problem is that you may get bogged down in detail. The other is that it can be difficult to review index cards at examination time. In general this is the method that is successful for most people. Make sure that you note down on each card the source of your information or you lose track of what each card means.

- Finally you can try to summarize a chapter on letter or legal paper. You can note down both facts and arguments at length. This system can be cumbersome if you take a lot of notes, but is very good for reviewing before exams.

III Thinking About the Topic
After you have read as much as you need, DO NOT just start to write. Think about what you have read, mull over it on a walk, or discuss it with friends. The professor already knows about what you are writing and is looking to see how well you have understood a topic. It is no use at all to just present your reading notes stuck between an introduction and a conclusion.

Thinking about your question is the most important stage of writing an essay.
IV The Plan

Sketch out on paper several ways of presenting your topic and your thoughts. You might think of doing this as a connected argument, or as a series of related headings organised in a way that makes sense of what you read. Another useful approach is to state, prove and defend a thesis.

You should always write out a plan. It will help you to be clearer both in papers and in tests. It is in fact another way of thinking about your topic.

V Writing and Editing

You cannot expect just to write out a paper and hand it in. Typographical errors alone will demand at least one re-type. So why not throw out the idea that what you write must be perfect first time?

It is a good writing technique just to WRITE down your thoughts as they come into your head (always keeping an eye on your paper plan). Do not stop to edit or correct spelling and grammatical mistakes. WRITING and EDITING are different skills. Even though you may think what you are writing is bad or plain stupid, once you have got it down on paper you can go back and look at what you have written. At that stage you can begin to knock it into shape, correct spelling and grammar and improve your style. Almost everybody thinks that what they are writing is bad at the time they write it: your aim is to find a way around this mental block.

You should note that in an exam, conditions force you to write and edit at the same time, however, the technique described here should help to improve your confidence in writing.

VI Finishing Touches

Before you hand a paper in make sure it looks good - use the Stylesheet handed out separately. Eliminate spelling and grammatical errors. Make sure all your references are noted. Add a bibliography. Type the paper cleanly.
EVALUATION RUBRIC FOR ESSAYS

Students sometimes do not understand how an essay is graded. The explanation of grading here derives from standards for Advanced Placement exams, and is called a "grading rubric." It outlines basic elements of the different classes of essay, and attaches grades to each of them. The basic grade of a paper derives from its content. The difference between the higher and lower grades here may depend on issues of both substance and presentation.

The Superior Paper (A/A-)

**Thesis:** Easily identifiable, plausible, novel, sophisticated, insightful, crystal clear.
**Structure:** Evident, understandable, appropriate for thesis. Excellent transitions from point to point. Paragraphs support solid topic sentences.
**Use of evidence:** Primary source information used to buttress every point with at least one example. Examples support mini-thesis and fit within paragraph. Excellent integration of quoted material into sentences.
**Analysis:** Author clearly relates evidence to "mini-thesis" (topic sentence); analysis is fresh and exciting, posing new ways to think of the material.
**Logic and argumentation:** All ideas in the paper flow logically; the argument is identifiable, reasonable, and sound. Author anticipates and successfully defuses counter-arguments; makes novel connections to outside material (from other parts of the class, or other classes) which illuminate thesis.
**Mechanics:** Sentence structure, grammar, and diction excellent; correct use of punctuation and citation style; minimal to no spelling errors; absolutely no run-on sentences or comma splices.

The Good Paper (B+/B)

**Thesis:** Promising, but may be slightly unclear, or lacking in insight or originality.
**Structure:** Generally clear and appropriate, though may wander occasionally. May have a few unclear transitions, or a few paragraphs without strong topic sentences.
**Use of evidence:** Examples used to support most points. Some evidence does not support point, or may appear where inappropriate. Quotes well integrated into sentences.
**Analysis:** Evidence often related to mini-thesis, though links perhaps not very clear.
**Logic and argumentation:** Argument of paper is clear, usually flows logically and makes sense. Some evidence that counter-arguments acknowledged, though perhaps not addressed. occasional insightful connections to outside material made.
**Mechanics:** Sentence structure, grammar, and diction strong despite occasional lapses; punctuation and citation style often used correctly. Some (minor) spelling errors; may have one run-on sentence or comma splice.

The Borderline Paper (B-/C+)

**Thesis:** Vague, confusing, or weak in substance or insight. Structure: Confusing, not well organized.
**Use of evidence:** Poor, irrelevant, or inappropriate. Evidence does not support thesis, or supports the wrong thesis.
**Analysis:** Weak or non-existent. No clear understanding of the material.
**Logic and argumentation:** Arguments are not well developed or focused.
**Mechanics:** Many errors in grammar, spelling, punctuation, and citation style.


Thesis: May be unclear (contain many vague terms), appear unoriginal, or offer relatively little that is new; provides little around which to structure the paper.
Structure: Generally unclear, often wanders or jumps around. Few or weak transitions, many paragraphs without topic sentences.
Use of evidence: Examples used to support some points. Points often lack supporting evidence, or evidence used where inappropriate (often because there may be no clear point). Quotes may be poorly integrated into sentences.
Analysis: Quotes appear often without analysis relating them to mini-thesis (or there is a weak mini-thesis to support), or analysis offers nothing beyond the quote.
Logic and argumentation: Logic may often fail, or argument may often be unclear. May not address counter-arguments or make any outside connections.
Mechanics: Problems in sentence structure, grammar, and diction (usually not major). Errors in punctuation, citation style, and spelling. May have several run-on sentences or comma splices.

The "Needs Help" Paper (C/C-)

Thesis: Difficult to identify at all, may be bland restatement of obvious point.
Structure: Unclear, often because thesis is weak or non-existent. Transitions confusing and unclear. Few topic sentences.
Use of evidence: Very few or very weak examples. General failure to support statements, or evidence seems to support no statement. Quotes not integrated into sentences; "plopped in" in improper manner.
Analysis: Very little or very weak attempt to relate evidence to argument; may be no identifiable argument, or no evidence to relate it to.
Logic and argumentation: Ideas do not flow at all, usually because there is no argument to support. Simplistic view of topic; no effort to grasp possible alternative views.
Mechanics: Big problems in sentence structure, grammar, and diction. Frequent major errors in citation style, punctuation, and spelling. May have many run-on sentences and comma splices.

The Failing Paper
Show obvious minimal lack of effort or comprehension of the assignment. Very difficult to understand owing to major problems with mechanics, structure, and analysis. Has no identifiable thesis, or utterly incompetent thesis.