

**McGill University**  
**Political Science 670: Special Topics**  
**Winter 2024**

**International Organizations and Global Governance in a Multipolar World**

(January 2024)\*

**Carola Weil, PhD** (she/her/elle)  
Associate Professor (CAS); Assoc. Faculty, Political Science  
Dean of Continuing Studies, McGill University

**Class**

**Schedule/Location (In Person):**

Fridays, 8.30 – 11.30 AM  
**LEACOCK 517**

**Email/Courriel:** [carola.weil@mcgill.ca](mailto:carola.weil@mcgill.ca)

Assistant: [dean.scs@mcgill.ca](mailto:dean.scs@mcgill.ca) (Caroline Telfeyan)

LinkedIn: <https://www.linkedin.com/in/carolaweil/>

Tel.: +1-514-398-6156

**Office: 680 Sherbrooke St. O., Suite 1240**

**Office Hours: Wednesday, 4-5.30 pm\* and by appointment**

(\*Except 1xmonth when McGill Senate meets, or in specific weeks when office hours will be from 5.00 – 6.30 pm.)

**Contact Information:**

*This seminar takes place at McGill University on land which has long served as a site of meeting and exchange amongst Indigenous peoples, including the Haudenosaunee and Anishinabeg nations. We acknowledge and thank the diverse Indigenous people whose footsteps have marked this territory on which peoples of the world now gather.*

*Ce séminaire se déroule à L'Université McGill sur un emplacement qui a longtemps servi de lieu de rencontre et d'échange entre les peuples autochtones, y compris les nations Haudenosaunee et Anishinabeg. Nous reconnaissons et remercions les divers peuples autochtones dont les pas ont marqué ce territoire sur lequel les peuples du monde entier se réunissent maintenant.*

**Seminar Description:**

The past decade has seen a dramatic increase in the volume and complexity of global demands on international organizations but also an increasing questioning of the existing international order and its ability to address these complex problems effectively. The post-World War II international liberal order, centered around the United Nations System and a set of defined inter-state relationships has shifted over time from a bipolar balance of power to multilateralism to a largely unipolar power structure to what some scholars now refer to as a state of multipolarity.

This seminar will focus on the current state of international organizations and consider the evolving nature of global governance against the backdrop of dynamic power relationships among states,

---

\* This course outline is subject to change depending on the availability of guest speakers, new readings, or other content, and/or by mutual agreement, in accordance with McGill University academic regulations.

regions, and relevant non-state actors. It will assess the extent to which we exist in a multipolar world, whether it is a truly new concept, and the implications for global governance and international organizations. Working through a series of specific issues, participants in this seminar will be able to apply a range of theories of international relations, governance and public policy to advance their understanding of practical policy processes and outcomes.

This is an interactive seminar. I am pleased to serve as your guide and facilitator on this learning journey. YOU are in charge of your own discovery journey and the learning path may look slightly different for each of you, depending on your interests and how you engage with the material and the course.

### **Learning objectives:**

This seminar seeks to analyze in depth key concepts in international relations. By the end of the seminar, you should be able to:

1. Define and distinguish between the concepts of global governance and international organizations and gain a more nuanced understanding of the historical and contemporary role of international organizations in the international system.
2. Define and obtain a more detailed understanding of the concept of multipolarity and its implications for how the world is governed, for the relationships among different global and regional actors.
3. Apply a range of theoretical lenses to ‘real world’ problems and situations, drawing from international relations, governance and public policy theories.
4. Deepen your understanding of political and social science research methodologies as well as policy-relevant argumentation and communication.
5. Strengthen your abilities to communicate clearly and persuasively in writing and speaking.

### **Course Format, Communications, and Resources/Reading Materials:**

Unless otherwise discussed<sup>†</sup>, this seminar meets IN-PERSON for three (3) hours (including a brief health break) once a week, unless otherwise arranged ahead of time. In the event of COVID or related infectious illness, the instructor and/or students may opt to participate remotely by prior arrangement.

All course materials will be available through MyCourses, through the library or open sources. I will share important announcements through our course website. It is your responsibility to check the MyCourses announcements, weekly sections, and your (McGill) email regularly. The best way to reach me is via MyCourses and email or through MS Teams.

There are no required books but I have ordered the following book which you might consider purchasing (it is also available through the library) as background reading:

Weiss, Thomas & Wilkinson, Rorden. *Rethinking Global Governance*. Polity: 2019.

In addition, you might consider investing in one or more of the following reference resources if you do not already have them:

---

<sup>†</sup> In the event of another outbreak of COVID or similar situations requiring social distancing, or weather-related emergencies we may need to move to remote learning. You will be notified in advance on MyCourses if that is the case and for how long.

We will draw on some of the following textbooks from time to time. There are many excellent textbooks on international organizations and on global governance, these are but a few for your consideration.

Barnett, Michael, Pevehouse, Jon, and Raustiala, Kal, eds. *Global Governance in A World of Change*. Cambridge University Press, 2022

Reus-Smit, Christian and Snidal, Duncan eds. *The Oxford Handbook of International Relations*. Oxford University Press. 2010 (Paperback edition)

Weiss, Thomas & Wilkinson, Rorden, eds. *International Organization and Global Governance*. Routledge: 2023. 3<sup>rd</sup> Edition. (This has just been published so you might have to go directly to the publisher for an e-book version. There is a 2018 edition but this one is significantly more current).

Pouliot, Vincent & Thérien, Jean-Philippe. *Global Policymaking: The Patchwork of Global Governance*. Cambridge University Press. 2023.

This seminar covers both historical and current events. Therefore, it is important that you keep up with relevant **news sources**. (Most of these are also accessible through the library, in case of paywalls blocking your access without a subscription.) Participation and assignment grades depend on your ability to reflect upon, and integrate, current news into your responses. Some *suggestions will be available in MyCourses*.

### **Course Requirements/Assessments:**

The objective of this seminar is to help you learn, to expand your own ideas and critical analytic capabilities. There is therefore a premium on active participation in class and pro-active engagement with the literature and any guest speakers or expertise presented. Regular course attendance is a prerequisite for success in this course. Additionally, this advanced graduate seminar is designed to help you advance your own thesis or dissertation research while also helping you communicate effectively with audiences outside your own subfield, discipline or even outside of academe. You will explore both academic and policy style writing and communication.

Please note that you will have a choice in some of the assignments depending on your status and career aspirations. For those of you pursuing a thesis-based degree, I recommend the research/theory-focused options. For those of you considering non-academic careers you might want to take the policy-focused options. Each student must decide at the beginning of term which track they wish to pursue (research or policy focused).

To help you progress through the course, you must complete the following benchmarks/assignments:

Assignment	Percentage Weight	Date Due
Review Essay	15%	No later than Week 5 - Feb. 2, 2024, 5 pm
Policy Brief	15%	No later than Week 12 - March 22, 5 pm

In-Class Presentations (Part A: Formal Presentation)	20%	Continuous – To be scheduled individually
In-Class Presentations (Part B: Peer Review)	10%	Continuous – To be scheduled individually
Research Paper Proposal or Policy Memorandum Proposal	5%	Week 9– March 1, 2024, 5 pm
Final Research Paper or Policy Memorandum	25%	No later than Monday, April 15 by 11.59 pm.
Weekly Participation	10%	Continuous

*Please see the end of this document for a more detailed description of each assessment.*

### A word about Generative AI Tools

You are welcome to experiment with large language models to help you refine your topics, identify a possible flow for your arguments for your presentations and written work. However, please note the following caveats:

- All work generated by AI must be identified and cited accordingly, following appropriate citation rules otherwise you may run the risk of academic integrity violations.
- Just because it sounds logical does not mean it is accurate. Generative AI is notorious for hallucinating, i.e. producing plausible but false outcomes.

### Grading Scale:

Letter Grade	Points	Percentage Range
A	4.0	85-100%
A-	3.7	80 – 84%
B+	3.3	75-79%
B	3.0	70 – 74%
B-	2.7	65 – 69%
C+	2.3	60 – 64%
C	2.0	55 – 59%
D	1.0	50 – 54%
F (Fail)	0	0 – 49%

Scores of 0.5 and higher are rounded up and scores of less than 0.5 are rounded down. I give you a window of 60 minutes past the due time to submit your work as scheduled.

Deadlines are there to help you pace yourself and to allow me to review and assess your progress in a timely manner, and for your classmates to be able to effectively engage with your ideas. Therefore, I respectfully ask you to submit all required assignments on MyCourses by the set deadline. I cannot accept assignments emailed, faxed, slid under doors, or telepathically

transmitted. Unless otherwise previously discussed and agreed upon, after the grace period, penalties for late submissions are as follows: Within the same 24-hour period: -10%; 25-48 hours: -20%; 48-72 hours: -30%. Thereafter, 50% of a grade for every day late will be subtracted. Exceptions or extensions are granted only for documented medical reasons or family emergencies.

*Additional information regarding academic policies follows after the course schedule.*

### **Course Schedule**

***You are expected to have read the week's suggested readings PRIOR to (no later than) the date on which the reading assignments are listed.*** (The exception is the first session, where suggested readings have been provided for your general benefit and ongoing use).

Because this course deals with current events and a dynamic area of international relations, I may add or substitute some readings as they become available if I think it will add to your knowledge base. I will always inform you if this occurs.

For each week, I will provide a set of questions for you to consider as you read. Some weeks have more extensive suggested lists than others. You are not expected to have read everything thoroughly but sufficiently to be able to discuss critically the questions raised.

<b>PART I: CONCEPTUAL TOOLKIT &amp; HISTORICAL EVOLUTION OF IO's, GLOBAL GOVERNANCE, AND MULTIPOLARITY</b>
----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

### **Week 1 (Jan 5, 2024): Introductions & Overview: Unpacking Complexity in the International System or Global Order**

- *Introductions\*of seminar participants and instructor*
- *Learning Objectives/Goals*
- *Concepts & Definitions*
- *Research & Analytic Tools*
- *Writing and Communicating Effectively for academic and policy/public audiences*

#### **\*In-Class Writing Exercise to follow the seminar discussion from 11.00 am – 12.00 pm.**

Please see the Discussion Forum in MyCourses for instructions. Please upload your one-page biography to the discussion forum so that we can all review before the next class. This is ungraded but will help me make the seminar more relevant to your interests and career plans and help us build our own “epistemic community” in the seminar.

### **Resources/Optional Readings/Videos**

Hurd, Ian. 2018. “Three Views on Ontology: Actor, Forum, Resource” in Chapter 2: “Theory, Methods, and International Organizations” in *International Organizations: Politics, Law, Practice*. 3rd ed. Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press., pp. 32-41.

Weiss, T. G.; Wilkinson, R. *International Organization and Global Governance*, 2023. Taylor & Francis Group. 3rd Edition (January 2024). “Introduction”. (NB: The Library currently only has the

2018 edition, but you may be able to find an ebook version of the newest edition through the Publisher.) I have ordered this edition to be put on course reserve at the library.

Katzenstein, Peter, and Rudra Sil, ' Eclectic Theorizing in the Study and Practice of International Relations', in Christian Reus-Smit, and Duncan Snidal (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of International Relations* (2008; online edn, Oxford Academic, 2 Sept. 2009),  
<https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199219322.003.0006>, accessed 8 Aug. 2023

A good guide on research methods in political science/international relations. For a broad overview of this topic, see: <https://www.e-ir.info/resources/research-methods-in-international-relations/>

Van Evera Stephen. 1997. *Guide to Methods for Students of Political Science*. Cornell University Press.

King, Gary, Robert Keohane, and Verba, Sidney. 1994. *Designing Social Inquiry: Scientific Inference in Qualitative Research*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Mahoney, James, 2010. "After KKV: The New Methodology of Qualitative Research," *World Politics* 62(1): 120-47.

To assist your writing and reading skills, consider these works:

Scott. Gregory M. & Garrison, Stephen M. 2017. *The Political Science Student Writer's Manual and Reader's Guide*. Rowman & Littlefield. 8<sup>th</sup> edition.

Vorley, Tim; Rahman, Syahirah Abdul; Tuckerman, Lauren and Wallace, Phil. Eds. *How to Engage Policy Makers with your Research: The Art of Informing and Impacting Policy*

## **Week 2 (Jan 12): Historical Evolution and Concepts of International Organizations as Institutions and Agents**

Barnett, Michael N., and Kathryn Sikkink, "From International Relations to Global Society", in Christian Reus-Smit, and Duncan Snidal (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of International Relations* (2008; online edn, Oxford Academic, 2 Sept. 2009),  
<https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199219322.003.0003>, accessed 3 Aug. 2023.

Iriye, Akira. 2002. [\*Global Community: the Role of International Organizations In the Making of the Contemporary World\*](#). Berkeley: University of California Press, Ch. 1: 1-36.

Alexander Thompson and Duncan Snidal, "International Organization" in Bouckaert, Baudewijn, and Gerrit De Geest, eds. 2000. "Encyclopedia of Law and Economics." Cheltenham: Edward Elgar. Available at: <http://enclo.findlaw.com/9800book.pdf>

Uhlin, Anders. "Opening Up of International Organizations," in Pallas, Chris, and Elizabeth Anne Bloodgood, eds. 2022. *Beyond the Boomerang : From Transnational Advocacy Networks to Transcalar Advocacy in International Politics*. Ngographies : Ethnographic Reflections on Ngos. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press.

Amrith, Sunil, and Glenda Sluga. 2008 ["New Histories of the United Nations."](#) *Journal of World History* 19, no. 3: 251-74.

Alvarez José E. 2006. [Ch. 3: "\(Re\) Introducing International Institutional Law."](#) In *International Organizations As Law-Makers*. Oxford: Oxford University Press. Pp. 109-122 (excerpt)

[The UN Charter](#), Signed June 26, 1945 (in Force as of October 24, 1945).

### Other Readings to Consider:

Krasno, Jean E.. *The United Nations: Policy and Practice*, Boulder, USA: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2023. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9781685859466>

Abbott, Kenneth W, and Duncan Snidal, eds. 2021. *The Spectrum of International Institutions: An Interdisciplinary Collaboration on Global Governance*. Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge.

Somini Sengupta. ["The United Nations Explained: Its Purpose, Power and Problems"](#). *The New York Times*: Sept. 17, 2017

Ecker-Ehrhardt, Matthias.2016 ["Why Do Citizens Want the UN to Decide? Cosmopolitan Ideas, Particularism and Global Authority."](#) *International Political Science Review / Revue Internationale De Science Politique* 37, no. 1 (2016): 99-114.

Herren, Madeleine. "International Organizations, 1865–1945." In Katz Cogan, Jacob, Hurd, Ian, and Johnstone, Ian. 2016. [The Oxford Handbook of International Organizations](#). 22 pp.

Finnemore, Martha. 1993. ["International Organizations As Teachers of Norms: The United Nations Educational, Scientific, and Cultural Organization and Science Policy."](#) *International Organization* 47 (4): 565–97.

Mingst, K., Karns, M., Lyon, A. (2017). „The Evolution of the United Nations System.” *The United Nations in the 21st Century*. New York: Routledge, Chapter 2: 21-69.

Commission on Global Governance. 1995. *Our Global Neighborhood : The Report of the Commission on Global Governance*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

### **Week 3 (Jan 19): Global Governance in History and Theory**

Acharya, Amitav. 2016. "Rethinking Demand, Purpose and Progress in Global Governance: An Introduction." In *Why Govern?: Rethinking Demand and Progress in Global Governance*, ed. Amitav Acharya. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. chapter, 1–28.

Deudney, Daniel. 2016. "The Great Descent: 'Global Governance' in Historical and Theoretical Perspective." In *Why Govern?: Rethinking Demand and Progress in Global Governance*, ed. Amitav Acharya. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Chapter 2, 31–54.

Ansell, Christopher K. 2023. *Rethinking Theories of Governance. Rethinking Political Science and International Studies*. Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar Publishing, Chapter 7, pp. 106-125.

Weiss, Thomas G, and Rorden Wilkinson, eds. 2023. *International Organization and Global Governance* Third ed. Abingdon, Oxon: Routledge. (*This book is brand new and unfortunately not yet available in the library. Only an earlier ebook version exists there. I have ordered it and it will be placed on course reserve as soon as it is available. You should be able to acquire an ebook version in the meantime.*)

#### Other Readings to Consider:

Simma, B, and A. L Paulus. 1998. ["The 'International Community': Facing the Challenge of Globalization. General Conclusions."](#) *European Journal of International Law* 9 (2): 266–77.

McNamee, Lachlan. 2023. "Settler Colonialism: Displacing and Destroying Peoples by Colonisation is Not Just a Historical Western Evil but a Global and Contemporary One", Essay, *AEON*. <https://aeon.co/essays/settler-colonialism-is-not-distinctly-western-or-european>

#### **Week 4 (Jan 26): Multipolarity or Multiplexity?**

Posen, Barry R. "Emerging Multipolarity: Why Should We Care?" *Current History* 108, no. 721 (2009): 347–52. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/45318866>.

Kassab, Hanna Samir. 2023. *Globalization, Multipolarity and Great Power Competition*. Routledge Advances in International Relations and Global Politics, 170. New York, NY: Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003295532> Chapters 1, 3, 4 & 7.

Amitav Acharya, Antoni Estevadeordal, Louis W Goodman, Multipolar or multiplex? Interaction capacity, global cooperation and world order, *International Affairs*, Volume 99, Issue 6, November 2023, Pages 2339–2365, <https://doi.org/10.1093/ia/iad242>

Ashford, Emma and Evan Cooper. 2023. "Assumption Testing: Multipolarity is more dangerous than bipolarity for the United States," Stimson Center Policy Paper. <https://www.stimson.org/2023/assumption-testing-multipolarity-is-more-dangerous-than-bipolarity-for-the-united-states/>

#### Other Readings To Consider:

#### **Week 5 (Feb 2): State and Non-state Global Governors – Who sets the rules and how?**

Matthias Hofferberth, Daniel Lambach, Martin Koch, Anna Holzscheiter, Maryam Zarnegar Deloffre, Nina Reiners, Karsten Ronit, Forum: The Why and How of Global Governors: Relational Agency in World Politics, *International Studies Review*, Volume 24, Issue 4, December 2022, viac054, <https://doi.org/10.1093/isr/viac054>

Michal Parizek, Matthew D Stephen, The Increasing Representativeness of International Organizations' Secretariats: Evidence from the United Nations System, 1997–2015, *International*



*Studies Quarterly*, Volume 65, Issue 1, March 2021, Pages 197–209, <https://doi.org/10.1093/isq/sqaa088>

Pallas, Chris, and Elizabeth Anne Bloodgood, eds. 2022. *Beyond the Boomerang : From Transnational Advocacy Networks to Transcalar Advocacy in International Politics*. Ngographies : Ethnographic Reflections on Ngos. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press. Chapter 1.

Tieku, Thomas Kwasi. 2019. Ruling from the Shadows: The Nature and Functions of Informal International Rules in World Politics, *International Studies Review*, Volume 21, Issue 2, June 2019, Pages 225–243, <https://doi.org/10.1093/isr/viz012>

Prügl, Elisabeth. "[Gender In International Organization And Global Governance: A Critical Review Of The Literature](#)." *International Studies Notes* 21, no. 1 (1996): 15-24.

Avant Deborah D., Finnemore Martha, Sell Susan K., eds. 2010. *Who Governs the Globe?* Cambridge University Press.

Keck, Margaret E, and Kathryn Sikkink. 2018. "Transnational Advocacy Networks in International and Regional Politics\*." *International Social Science Journal* 68 (227–228): 65–76. <https://doi.org/10.1111/issj.12187>.

Other readings to consider:

Weiss, Thomas G., Seyle D. Conor, and Kelsey Coolidge. 2013. [\*The Rise of Non-State Actors in Global Governance: Opportunities and Limitations\*](#) One Earth Future Discussion Paper

Therien, Jean-Philippe and Madeleine Belanger Dumontier. 2009. "[The United Nations and Global Democracy: From Discourse to Deeds](#)." *Cooperation and Conflict* 44 (4) (12): 355-377.

## **Week 6 (Feb. 9): Formal and Informal Processes in Global Governance**

Barnett, Michael N., Jon C.W. Pevehouse, and Kal Raustiala. 2021. "Introduction: The Modes of Global Governance." In *Global Governance in a World of Change*, eds. Michael N. Barnett, Jon C. W. Pevehouse, and Kal Raustiala. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Chapter, 1–47.

Pouliot, Vincent, and Jean-Philippe Thérien. 2023. *Global Policymaking: The Patchwork of Global Governance*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Introduction & Chapters 1, 2.

Hurd, Ian. 2018. "Three Views on Ontology: Actor, Forum, Resource" in Chapter 2: "Theory, Methods, and International Organizations" in *International Organizations : Politics, Law, Practice*. 3rd ed. Cambridge etc.: Cambridge University Press., pp. 32-41.

Koremenos, Barbara, Lipson, Charles, and Snidal, Duncan, eds. 2003. "[Rational Design: Looking Back to Move Forward](#)", *The Rational Design of International Institutions*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Pp. 291-322.

Hooghe, Liesbet, Tobias Lenz, and Gary Marks, 2019. 'Measuring International Authority', *A Theory of International Organization, Transformations In Governance* (Oxford, 2019; online edn, Oxford Academic, <https://doi.org/10.1093/oso/9780198766988.003.0003>).

**PART II: ORGANIZING WORLD ORDERS – FUNCTIONS, PROCESSES**
**Week 7 (Feb 16): Legitimacy in, and Compliance with, IOs and Global Governance**

Tallberg, Jonas. 2021. “Legitimacy and Modes of Global Governance.” In *Global Governance in a World of Change*, eds. Michael N. Barnett, Jon C. W. Pevehouse, and Kal Raustiala. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Chapter, 311–37.

Abbott, Kenneth W., Philipp Genschel, Duncan Snidal, and Bernhard Zangl. 2015. “Orchestration: Global Governance through Intermediaries.” In *International Organizations as Orchestrators*, eds. Kenneth W. Abbott, Philipp Genschel, Duncan Snidal, and Bernhard Zangl. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Chapter, 3–36.

Henning Schmidtke, Swantje Schirmer, Niklas Krösche, Tobias Lenz, The Legitimation of International Organizations: Introducing a New Dataset, *International Studies Perspectives*, 2023;, ekad008, <https://doi.org/10.1093/isp/ekad008>

Anghie, Antony. 2006. “[The Evolution of International Law: Colonial and Postcolonial Realities.](#)” *Third World Quarterly* 27 (5): 739–53.

Hurd, Ian. 2019. “Legitimacy and Contestation in Global Governance: Revisiting the Folk Theory of International Institutions.” *The Review of International Organizations* 14 (4): 717–29. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11558-018-9338-z>.

Hafner-Burton, Emilie M, and Christina J Schneider. 2019. “The Dark Side of Cooperation: International Organizations and Member Corruption.” *International Studies Quarterly* 63 (4): 1108–21. <https://doi.org/10.1093/isq/sqz064>.

Other Readings to Consider:

Zelli, Fariborz. Ch. 10: “Effects of Legitimacy Crises in Complex Global Governance.” *Legitimacy in Global Governance: Sources, Processes, and Consequences*, edited by Jonas Tallberg, Karin Bäckstrand, and Jan Aart Scholte. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2018., 17 pp.

Rosenau, James N. 2007. “[Governing the Ungovernable: The Challenge of a Global Disaggregation of Authority.](#)” *Regulation & Governance* 1 (1): 88–97.

Felter, Claire. 2020. “[The Role of the International Criminal Court.](#)” *Backgrounders*. New York: Council on Foreign Relations, June 25, 2020. 12 pp.

Arbour, Louise. 2014. [The relationship between the ICC and the UN security council](#). *Global Governance*, 20(2), 195-201.

### **Week 8 (Feb 23): Layered Governance: From the International to Regional and Domestic Politics and Institutions.**

Drezner, Daniel W. 2003. "Locating the Proper Authorities : The Interaction of Domestic and International Institutions". Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.  
<https://ebookcentral.proquest.com/lib/mcgill/detail.action?docID=3414957>

Mihr, Anja. 2022. "Glocal Governance How to Govern in the Anthropocene?" *Springerbriefs in Political Science*. Cham, Switzerland: Springer. See especially Introduction, Chapter 1 & 2.

Kacowicz, Arie M. 2018. ["Regional Governance and Global Governance: Links and Explanations."](#) *Global Governance* 24 (1) (Jan): 61-79.

Acharya, Amitav. 2018. "Regionalism and the Making of Global Order." Chapter. In *Constructing Global Order: Agency and Change in World Politics*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.pp. 155–85.

Alvarez, Jose. E., 2006. 'The Varied Forms of International Institutional Law', *International Organizations as Law-makers* (Oxford, 2006; online edn, Oxford Academic, 1 Jan. 2010), <https://doi.org/10.1093/acprof:oso/9780198765639.003.0004>

Matias Spektor, 2023. "In Defense of the Fence Sitters: What the West Gets Wrong about Hedging," *Foreign Affairs* 102, no. 3 (May/June 2023): 8-16

Stewart Patrick, 2010. "Irresponsible Stakeholders - The Difficulty of Integrating Rising Powers," *Foreign Affairs* 89, no. 6 (November/December 2010): 44-53

Gómez-Mera, Laura. "International Regime Complexity and Regional Governance: Evidence from the Americas." *Global Governance* 21, no. 1 (2015): 19–42. <http://www.jstor.org/stable/24526299>.

#### **Other Readings to Consider:**

Harsch, Michael F., and Johannes Varwick.2009. ["NATO-UN Cooperation Revisited: A New Dawn?"](#) *Studia Diplomatica* 62, no. 3: 29-35.

Prakash, Sethi, S., and Schepers, Donald H. ["United Nations Global Compact: The Promise-Performance Gap."](#) *Journal of Business Ethics* 122, no. 2 (2014): 193-208.

### **Week 9 (March 1): Wicked Global Problems I: Climate Change & Sustainable Human Development**

*Climate Change/Environmental Challenges:*

Sikkink, Kathryn. 2024. “How International Relations Theory on Norm Cascades Can Inform the Politics of Climate Change.” *PS: Political Science & Politics* 57(1): 36–39. Doi: 10.1017/S1049096523000380.

C. J. Polychroniou “COP28 Gave Us Another Agreement Full of Loopholes for Fossil Fuels”, *Global Policy*. 22 December 2023

Rashidi, Pedram, and Kristen Lyons. 2023. “Democratizing global climate governance? The case of indigenous representation in the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC)”, *Globalizations*, 20:8, 1312-1327, DOI: [10.1080/14747731.2021.1979718](https://doi.org/10.1080/14747731.2021.1979718)

Green, Andrew, David Duff, Jutta Brune, and Steven Bernstein. 2008. *A Globally Integrated Climate Policy for Canada*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press. [muse.jhu.edu/book/104175](https://muse.jhu.edu/book/104175).

*Human Development & Human Rights/Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs):*

Ansell, Christopher K., 2023. “Chapter 8. Reducing Poverty and Inequality”. *Rethinking Theories of Governance. Rethinking Political Science and International Studies*. Cheltenham, UK: Edward Elgar Publishing, pp. 126-152.

Bogers, Maya Bogers, Frank Biermann, Agni Kalfagianni, and Rakhyun E. Kim. 2023. “The SDGs as integrating force in global governance? Challenges and opportunities” *International Environmental Agreements* 23:157–164 <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10784-023-09607-9> Accepted: 18 May 2023 / Published online: 3 June 2023.

Stott, Leda and David F. Murphy. 2020. “An Inclusive Approach to Partnerships for the SDGs: Using a Relationship Lens to Explore the Potential for Transformational Collaboration”, *Sustainability*. MDPI. inv12 n7905 (20200901): 7905. Open Access, Downloadable.

Paulo Esteves, and Geovana Zoccal. 2020. “International Development Cooperation and Multipolarity: Scrambling North and South?” *Revista Brasileira De Política Internacional* 63 (2). <https://doi.org/10.1590/0034-7329202000213>.

Schoeman, Maxi. 2011. “Of Brics and Mortar: The Growing Relations between Africa and the Global South.” *International Spectator* 46 (1): 33–51. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03932729.2011.549753>.

Loeffler, James. “[Human rights treaties promised a better future. Why did they fail?](#)” in *The Washington Post*, Dec. 20, 2018.

#### Other Readings to Consider:

Trent, John, and Laura Schnurr. 2018. “[Social and Economic Development](#).” In *A United Nations Renaissance: What the UN Is, and What It Could Be*, Opladen; Berlin; Toronto: Verlag Barbara Budrich, pp. 71-97.

Van Driel, Melanie, Frank Biermann, Marjanneke J Vijge, Rakhyun E Kim, How the World Bank Engages with the Sustainable Development Goal on Reducing Inequalities: A Case of

Organizational Jiu-Jitsu, *Global Studies Quarterly*, Volume 3, Issue 3, July 2023, ksad035, <https://doi.org/10.1093/isagsq/ksad035>

Clark, Helen. 2017 "What Will It Take to Achieve the Sustainable Development Goals?" *Journal of International Affairs*, , 53-59.

Kuenkel, P., Kuhn, E., Stucker, D., & Williamson, D. (2020). *Leading Transformative Change Collectively: A Practitioner Guide to Realizing the SDGs* (1st ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003033561>

Dutt, Aruna. *The Global South's Untold Human Rights Legacy*. International Press Service, July 14, 2016

Barkin, J. Samuel. 2013, 2015. *Ch. 8: Human Rights & Humanitarian Aid. International Organization: Theories and Institutions* Second ed. New York, NY: Palgrave Macmillan. Pp. 87-96

Therien, Jean-Philippe and Philippe Joly. 2014. "'all Human Rights for all': The United Nations and Human Rights in the Post-Cold War Era." *Human Rights Quarterly* 36 (2) (05): 373-396.

### **Week 10 (March 8): NO CLASS (Reading Week)**

### **Week 11 (March 15): Wicked Problems II: International Peace and Security & Technology and Artificial Intelligence.**

*International Peace and Security:*

Kemp, Walter A. 2021. *Security through Cooperation: To the Same End* (1st ed.). Routledge. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003214267>.

Walt, Stephen M. 2023. "A Practical Guide To Perpetual Peace: How To Take Realistic (And Realist) Steps Toward A More Utopian World Order." *Foreign Policy*. December 19, 2023. <https://foreignpolicy.com/2023/12/19/realist-guide-world-peace/>

Boulden, Jane, Thakur, Ramesh, and Weiss, Thomas G., eds. 2009. Ch. 1: "[The United Nations and nuclear orders: Context, foundations, actors, tools, and future prospects](#)" in *United Nations and Nuclear Orders*. Tokyo: United Nations University Press. Pp. 1-27.

Howard, Lise, & Dayal, A. 2018. [The Use of Force in UN Peacekeeping](#). *International Organization*, 72(1), 71-103.

-True, Jacqui and Davies, Sara E. 2020. "Ch. 11: Gender, governance and security" in Oudraat, Chantal de Jonge & Brown, Michael, eds. *The Gender and Security Agenda*. London: Routledge, pp. 214-234.

Voeten, Erik. 2005. "[The Political Origins of the UN Security Council's Ability to Legitimize the Use of Force.](#)" *International Organization* 59 (3). Cambridge University Press: 527–57.

Other Readings to Consider:

Kupchan, Charles A., and Clifford A. Kupchan. 1995. ["The Promise of Collective Security."](#) *International Security* 20, no. 1: 52-61.

Beardsley, Kyle. 2013. ["The UN at the Peacemaking–peacebuilding Nexus."](#) *Conflict Management and Peace Science* 30, no. 4: 369-86

Harsch, Michael F., and Johannes Varwick. 2009. ["NATO-UN Cooperation Revisited: A New Dawn?"](#) *Studia Diplomatica* 62, no. 3: 29-35

Daalder, Ivo. 1999. [NATO, the UN, and the Use of Force.](#) Report, Brookings Institution.

Welsh, Jennifer. ["The Responsibility to Prevent: Assessing the Gap between Rhetoric and Reality."](#) *Cooperation and Conflict* 51, no. 2 (2016): 216-32.

[-The Responsibility to Protect: Report of the International Commission on Intervention and State Sovereignty. 9781552502129.](#) Ottawa: IDRC Books/Les Éditions du CRDI, 2001. Synopsis, pp. xi-xiii.

#### *Technology and Communications:*

Benvenisti, Eyal. 2017. "Upholding Democracy Amid the Challenges of New Technology: What Role for the Law of Global Governance?" *European Journal of International Law* 28 (3): 9–82.

Erman, Eva and Furendal, Markus. "The Global Governance of Artificial Intelligence: Some Normative Concerns" *Moral Philosophy and Politics*, vol. 9, no. 2, 2022, pp. 267-291. <https://doi.org/10.1515/mopp-2020-0046>

Levinson, Nanette S. and Meryem Marzouki. "IOs and Global Internet Governance: Interorganizational Architecture" in Musiani, Francesca et al. *The Turn To Infrastructure in Internet Governance*. Palgrave-MacMillan, pp. 47-71.

K. Wakunuma, G. Ogoh, D. O. Eke and S. Akintoye, "Responsible AI, SDGs, and AI Governance in Africa," *2022 IST-Africa Conference (IST-Africa)*, Ireland, 2022, pp. 1-13, doi: 10.23919/IST-Africa56635.2022.9845598.

Bradshaw, Samantha, Laura DeNardis, Fen Osler Hampson, Eric Jardine, Mark Raymond, and Global Commission 2017. [On Internet Governance. Who Runs the Internet?: The Global Multi-stakeholder Model of Internet Governance.](#) Report. Centre for International Governance Innovation. 45-66.

#### Other Readings to Consider:

Office of the United Nations Secretary General's Envoy on Technology. [High Level Advisory Body on Artificial Intelligence.](#)

<p><b>PART III: FROM MULTILATERALISM TO POLYCENTRISM – THE FUTURE OF THE LIBERAL INTERNATIONAL ORDER AND INTERNATIONAL</b></p>
--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------



## **Week 12 (March 22): The Demise of the “Liberal International Order” ?**

Mearsheimer, John J. “Bound to Fail: The Rise and Fall of the Liberal International Order”. *International Security* 2019; 43 (4): 7–50. Doi: [https://doi.org/10.1162/isec\\_a\\_00342](https://doi.org/10.1162/isec_a_00342)

Thomas Sommerer, Hans Agné, Fariborz Zelli, and Bart Bes. *Global Legitimacy Crises: Decline and Revival in Multilateral Governance*, by. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2022. 238 pp.

T V Paul, Globalization, deglobalization and reglobalization: adapting liberal international order, *International Affairs*, Volume 97, Issue 5, September 2021, Pages 1599–1620, <https://doi-proxy3.library.mcgill.ca/10.1093/ia/iab072>

Larionova M., Kirton J. (2020) Global Governance After the COVID19 Crisis. *International Organisations Research Journal*, vol. 15, no 2, pp. 7–17 (in English). DOI: 10.17323/1996784520200201

### **Other Readings to Consider:**

Commission on Global Security, Justice & Governance, The Hague Institute for Global Justice, and The Stimson Center. 2015. [\*Confronting the Crisis of Global Governance: Report of the Commission on Global Security, Justice & Governance\*](#). Washington, DC. Stimson Center., XV-XX

Sachs, Jeffrey D. "[COVID-19 and Multilateralism](#)." *Horizons: Journal of International Relations and Sustainable Development*, no. 16 (2020): 30-39

Schuetter, Leonard, Hylke Dijkstra, When an International Organization Fails to Legitimate: The Decline of the OSCE, *Global Studies Quarterly*, Volume 3, Issue 4, October 2023, ksad057, <https://doi.org/10.1093/isagsq/ksad057>

## **Week 13 (March 29): NO CLASS (Good Friday)**

## **Week 14 (April 5): Credibility, Power, and Change in International Organizations and Global Governance**

Cohen, Jared, and Bremmer, Ian. "[The Global Credibility Gap - Essay](#)," *Foreign Policy*, December 6, 2023.

Brown, Gordon. 2023. “A New Multilateralism.” *Foreign Policy*, no. 250 (Fall): 50–57. <https://search.ebscohost.com/login.aspx?direct=true&db=rch&AN=172338498&scope=site>.

Smith, Jackie. “Power Shifts, Paradigm Shifts, and Transnational Advocacy Ecosystems,” in Pallas, Chris, and Elizabeth Anne Bloodgood, eds. 2022. *Beyond the Boomerang : From Transnational Advocacy Networks to Transcalar Advocacy in International Politics*. Ngographies : Ethnographic Reflections on Ngos. Tuscaloosa: University of Alabama Press.

Berman, Ayelet. 2021. “Between Participation and Capture in International Rule-Making: The Who Framework of Engagement with Non-State Actors.” *European Journal of International Law* 32 (1): 227–54.

Goddard, Stacie & Krebs, Ronald & Kreuder-Sonnen, Christian & Rittberger, Berthold. 2024. "Contestation In A World Of Liberal Orders". *Global Studies Quarterly*. 4.

Other Readings To Consider:

Graham, Erin R. 2017. ["Follow the Money: How Trends in Financing Are Changing Governance at International Organizations."](#) *Global Policy*. Vol. 8

Meyerrose, Anna M. 2020. "The Unintended Consequences of Democracy Promotion: International Organizations and Democratic Backsliding." *Comparative Political Studies* 53 (10–11): 1547–81. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0010414019897689>.

Voeten, Erik. 2000. ["Clashes in the Assembly."](#) *International Organization* 54 (2). Cambridge University Press: 185–215.

Xanthaki, Alexandra. 2019. ["When Universalism Becomes a Bully: Revisiting the Interplay between Cultural Rights and Women's Rights."](#) *Human Rights Quarterly* 41 (3) (08): 701-724.

**Week 15 (April 12): LAST DAY OF CLASS – Moving towards a Polycentric World**

Pouliot, Vincent, and Jean-Philippe Thérien. 2023. *Global Policymaking: The Patchwork of Global Governance*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. Chapter 6 & Conclusion.

Faude, Benjamin, and Julia Fuss. 2020. "Coordination or Conflict? The Causes and Consequences of Institutional Overlap in a Disaggregated World Order." *Global Constitutionalism* 9 (2): 268–89. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S2045381719000376>.

Olaf Scholz, ["The Global Zeitenwende: How to Avoid a New Cold War in a Multipolar Era,"](#) *Foreign Affairs* 102, no. 1 (January/February 2023): 22-38.

Stewart Patrick. 2023. *Rules of Order: Assessing the State of Global Governance*. Washington, DC: Carnegie Endowment for International Peace. <https://carnegieendowment.org/2023/09/12/rules-of-order-assessing-state-of-global-governance-pub-90517>.

Bekkevold, Jo Inge. "No, The World Is Not Multipolar: The Idea of Emerging Power Centers is Popular But Wrong – and Could Lead to Serious Policy Mistakes," in *Foreign Policy*, <https://foreignpolicy.com/2023/09/22/multipolar-world-bipolar-power-geopolitics-business-strategy-china-united-states-india/>.

**APPENDIX A: Explanation of Assignments**

*All written assignments must be submitted through MyCourses in the assignment section.*

**Review Essay:** (DUE BY FEB. 2<sup>ND</sup>) Your short essay should critically examine one or more readings you have done during the first third of the course (weeks 1 – 5). You can compare and contrast two or more readings or delve more deeply into a single text. You may draw on other



literature, news articles, podcasts, video broadcasts, films or plays to amplify your points so long as you provide proper citation of all sources. A good review essay does not simply summarize but draws attention to major issues, debates, questions, problems, or insights. If more than one student is presenting during the same week, I will ask you to coordinate so that you are not duplicating each other.

This essay will be no more than 1500 words (ca. 3 pages single spaced, standard size 11 or 12 pt. font) in MS Word (.doc or .docx), Adobe Acrobat (.PDF) or plain text and should be submitted to the appropriate myCourses discussion forum at least 48 hours prior to the seminar. Everyone is expected to read the review before class and be prepared to discuss in class. You must pick a week during which they will submit their review essay at the beginning of term. Late postings make it difficult for everyone to digest your good work. Please respect the timelines proposed.

**Policy Brief:** (DUE BY MARCH 22) policy brief is a short presentation of policy options for decision makers. In this case you will develop from your assigned and any other legitimated source material a short description of a contemporary policy issue related to the topics discussed in this course. The brief should be no longer than 3 formatted pages, including an executive summary (ca. 1250-1500 words total) plus 1-2 pages of supporting data as needed (tables and/or graphs). *Please follow the same instructions as for the Review Essay noted above.*

A good policy brief will provide sufficient background or context for the reader to understand the problem and will include a clearly articulated problem statement. It will convince the reader about the urgency of the problem, stimulate the reader to make a decision, and provide information about different alternative solutions. If you wish to advocate for a specific policy option, you must provide evidence supporting your recommendation.

### **In-Class Presentations:**

#### **Part A:** (in the form of a Research/Job Talk or a Policy Advocacy Presentation) (20%)

An important part of professional engagement is the ability to present one's work before a group of informed participants. In this exercise you will have some choices in format, and whether you wish to conduct this project alone or as a group. You may draw on the research you are conducting for your final paper/policy memorandum, or one of your shorter writing pieces. You will be expected to prepare a formal presentation of ca. 20-30 minutes in length followed by questions and answers from your peers. You should not be reading a paper. You may wish to prepare a power point or other type of visual aid for your audience to follow along with your presentation. You will have two choices in presentation format: either a research talk or a policy advocacy presentation. We will discuss the differences in the two formats and additional resources will be made available.

#### **Part B:** a Peer review or discussion of your classmates' presentation/work (10%)

Peer reviews or feedback also contribute to professional community building and provide a useful learning tool both for the recipient of the critique or feedback and the presentator. For this component you will be asked to lead a short discussion of one or more of your classmates' presentations. This could be a comparative discussion – linking at least two presentations together – or a peer review/critique of one individual work. You should prepare an outline for your discussion, a set of questions for distribution to your colleagues, and lead a class discussion of approximately 45 minutes in length. These will be based on the prepared outline and questions, as well as how you guide the group discussion.

**Research Paper/Policy Memorandum Proposal:** For your final written submission you will again have the option of writing a more traditional research paper or preparing a document for an informed professional audience aimed at advocating for a particular policy position or outcome. In both cases you will need to have completed extensive research and review of the literature on your own. To assist you in preparing for this project, you will be asked to submit a formal proposal/abstract no later than **Week 6 (Feb. 9)** to leave you enough time to prepare your final work.

For a **research paper proposal**, you should prepare a 2-3 page memo providing a brief description of your topic and research question, a statement of your leading hypotheses, including the key independent and dependent variables you expect to consider, a discussion of the methodology/-ies you propose to apply and a short bibliography of at least 4-5 academic sources.

For a **policy memorandum proposal**, you should prepare a 2-3 page memo that clearly define the problem to be addressed, the reason why it is important, and elaborate on the design (methods) you propose to identify possible solutions. You should clearly state who your intended reader/audience is, the time frame for implementation, and the likely constraints and opportunities that will influence your policy design. Your proposal should reference key data sources that will inform your analysis.

**Final Research Paper:** (DUE MONDAY AFTER THE LAST CLASS) This should look like a clean draft of a conference paper or journal article, of approximately 20-30 pages in length (double spaced, 11-12 point font, not including bibliography and any supporting appendices). The paper should include a clear argument, hypothesis and/or research problem. What is your focus? You should explain the methodology applied, why and any issues you may have encountered. Are you looking to make a particular argument regarding causation? You should place your work in a broader context of the relevant theories and literatures in the field. How does your work extend, differ, or reinforce existing theories/literature? If you chose to analyze a particular case study, you should explain how you selected your case(s) and why they are relevant to your question.

**Final Policy Memorandum:** (DUE MONDAY AFTER THE LAST CLASS) A typical policy memorandum ranges from 1-25 pages plus supporting materials but it is unlikely that you will be able to provide a comprehensive response in less than 10-15 pages. As with the research paper, the goal is to present a clear argument regarding a clearly articulated research question or problem, and to present a supporting analysis in a logical and well-organized way. A policy memorandum follows a standard structure centered around the core issue statement, why it is important, the methods used to identify solutions/recommendations, the criteria used to evaluate different recommendations, a cost-benefit analysis of the implementations for the recommendations, a rationale for your preferred recommendation, and a succinctly summarizing conclusion. It will include appropriate data, data visualization, and/or appendices for supporting evidence.

**Weekly Participation** (in-class, reading/study groups, asynchronous discussions, panel discussions):

This course involves a lot of reading. You are required to have completed all readings in advance of class and be prepared to comment. I strongly recommend that you organize yourselves in small reading/study groups – no more than 3-4 people to facilitate coordination – and think about your weekly readings collectively. You should be prepared to discuss in class the strengths and weakness of the literature, logical extensions from, improvements to, or counter arguments to the readings, and other questions that the readings provoked for you.

Additionally, you will have the opportunity to post comments regarding the weekly readings or other literature/news of interest in the discussion forum of MyCourses. You are encouraged to review the forum on a regular basis and respond to one another not only in class but asynchronously on the discussion forum. Posts could take the form of critiques, questions, book, or article reviews (short), suggestions for other readings, videos, or podcasts.

From time to time there may be guest speakers in class. You are expected to listen attentively and engage actively in discussion with the speaker following their remarks. Class discussion will take different forms to keep things interesting for everyone and give you a chance to explore different presentation formats. We will organize at least one panel discussion, where you will be asked to take a particular perspective and discuss the topic of the day together with at least 2 other classmates – each illuminating a different perspective.

### **Appendix B: Academic Policies**

McGill University values academic integrity. All students must understand the meaning and consequences of cheating, plagiarism and other academic offences under the Code of Student Conduct and Disciplinary Procedures (see <http://www.mcgill.ca/integrity> for more information).

*L'université McGill attache une haute importance à l'honnêteté académique. Il incombe par conséquent à tous les étudiants de comprendre ce que l'on entend par tricherie, plagiat et autres infractions académiques, ainsi que les conséquences que peuvent avoir de telles actions, selon le Code de conduite de l'étudiant et des procédures disciplinaires (pour de plus amples renseignements, veuillez consulter le site [www.mcgill.ca/students/srr/honest/](http://www.mcgill.ca/students/srr/honest/)).*

In accordance with McGill University's Charter of Students' Rights, students in this course have the right to submit in English or in French any written work that is to be graded.

*Conformément à la Charte des droits de l'étudiant de l'Université McGill, chaque étudiant a le droit de soumettre en français ou en anglais tout travail écrit devant être noté (sauf dans le cas des cours dont l'un des objets est la maîtrise d'une langue)*

Requests contesting a grade for an assignment or for a re-read must be submitted in writing (via email) with a rationale for the challenge to the grade received, within one (1) week of the day on which the graded assignment was returned. I will re-evaluate the paper, but please note that this may result in either raising or lowering the grade.

Should you need to miss a class due to a religious holiday, please let me know at least two weeks (14 days) prior to the holiday. If you miss a deadline to observe a religious holiday, you will be given an opportunity to complete/submit the missed work within the following week without penalty, provided you requested the absence/delay ahead of time as noted.

### **Student Accommodations/Health Needs:**

It is my goal to ensure an inclusive and barrier free learning environment. However, if you need special accommodations or encounter barriers please do not hesitate to discuss with me in advance and reach out to the Office of Student Accessibility and Achievement <https://www.mcgill.ca/access-achieve/>. You can [register](#) with OSAA for additional support.

Graduate school can be stressful. Please do not hesitate to make use of McGill University's support systems such as the Wellness Hub: <https://www.mcgill.ca/wellness-hub/get-support/mental-health-support> and the Office of the Dean of Students. <https://www.mcgill.ca/deanofstudents/>

**Classroom Etiquette/Pronouns:**

Our classroom is home to an inclusive learning community. We are here to learn from one another and to push the boundaries of knowledge. This means that we value a diversity of perspectives, and indeed, more than one idea might be true at the same time. Deep learning does not come from rote repetition but rather through dialogue, exploration and even failure. You are allowed to make mistakes, you can change your mind, and you can challenge others' ideas – provided we do so respectfully. Please also let me/the class know your preferred pronouns and form of address if you have not done so already.

***IMPORTANT NOTE:***

**[End-of-course evaluations](#)** are one of the ways that McGill works towards maintaining and improving the quality of courses and the student's learning experience. You will be notified by e-mail when the evaluations are available. Please note that a minimum number of responses must be received for results to be available to students.