



Friday, December 12, 2014
10:49 AM EST

Like 175k

COMMENTARY

Search the archives
[Sign In](#)

- [HOME](#)
- [NEWS](#)
- [YOUR TORONTO](#)
- [OPINION](#)
 - Editorials
 - Commentary**
 - Readers' Letters
 - Public Editor
 - Corrections
 - Editorial Cartoon
- [SPORTS](#)
- [BUSINESS](#)
- [ENTERTAINMENT](#)
- [LIFE](#)
- [AUTOS](#)
- [PHOTOS](#)
- [DIVERSIONS](#)
- [CLASSIFIEDS](#)
- [OBITUARIES](#)

Opinion / Commentary

Canada's misguided approach to HIV

Canada's use of the criminal law to punish HIV-positive individuals who do not disclose their status to sexual partners is particularly harsh.

Tweet 69 +1 7 reddit this! + save to mystar



DREAMSTIME IMAGE

Canada treats not disclosing HIV-positive status as negating consent to sex, equating it to rape under the law. This approach is misguided and produces grave injustices.

By: Robert Leckey Published on Sun Nov 30 2014

World Aids Day, on Dec. 1, gives us cause to rejoice and to lament. In Canada and other countries with robust public health care, HIV is now a manageable chronic condition rather than a death sentence, as it remains for millions elsewhere. But Canada's use of the criminal law to punish HIV-positive individuals who do not disclose their status to sexual partners is particularly expansive and harsh. Its approach undermines basic messages of public health and ignores the diversity of sexual practices.

Canada's punitive approach comes courtesy of aggressive prosecutors and the Supreme Court of Canada. It treats not disclosing HIV-positive status as negating consent to sex, equating it to rape under the law. Even where the accused never transmits the virus or where there was minimal risk of transmission, this approach can lead to imprisonment and lifetime designation as a sex offender.

The current legal approach essentially invites individuals who are HIV-negative to assume that sex is safe. It encourages them to have unprotected sex with people whose HIV status they don't know and don't ask about. After all, the judges and prosecutors tell us, the criminal law obliges your partner to tell you if he or she has HIV.

The problems with this approach are legion. The [Public Health Agency of Canada](#) reports that one in four of those infected don't know that they are. Health researchers tell us that law doesn't effectively overcome those factors that make disclosure less likely. Indeed, potential criminal prosecution adds a reason not to take the test. All told, the few studies on the topic don't support the claim that criminal prosecutions lead to more disclosure.

On the contrary, the public health message for decades has been for everyone to beware

Bake from your heart, for your heart



A healthy diet low in saturated and trans fats may reduce the risk of heart disease. Becel® Buttery Taste is low in saturated and free of trans fats.

A SELECTION OF RECIPES WITH YOUR HEART HEALTH IN MIND

-  Oatmeal Chocolate Chip Cookies
[> See Recipe](#)
-  Banana Bread
[> See Recipe](#)
-  Becel Cookies
[> See Recipe](#)
-  Rhubarb Muffins with Walnut Streusel
[> See Recipe](#)
-  Apricot Almond Biscotti
[> See Recipe](#)

VISIT BECEL.CA FOR MORE DELICIOUS BAKING RECIPES

Top News

- The reality of being priced out of Toronto's housing market |
- NEW** 'All of U.K. airspace' shut down as computers black out
- Why are almost half of kids in Ontario's group homes on drugs?
- Ottawa probes drug companies' gifts to pharmacists
- Bill on gay clubs depicts Albertans as 'hillbillies:' Nenshi |
- Mystery of the Ghomeshi interviews: Salutin
- Torontonians will be freed from snow shovelling for weekend |
- Tory pitches SmartTrack in meeting with Stephen Harper |



Avoid gifting unspent cards



Why are they on drugs? The 'zombie kids' in Ontario group homes



Think we got it bad? Remembering Toronto's worst snowstorm



Video

The reality of being priced out of Toronto's housing market

of risks and take precautions. Instead, the court suggests that broaching the sometimes awkward conversation about risk and precautions isn't the job of everyone who has sex. It's the sole responsibility of those who are HIV-positive, intensifying their burdens and stigma.

An upcoming appeal highlights this approach's flaws. On Dec. 8, the Supreme Court will hear its first criminal appeal involving HIV and gay men. The complainant and the accused met and had sex in a Montreal bathhouse. They had sex on several occasions, sometimes using condoms and sometimes not. The accused didn't initially disclose that he was HIV-positive. The complainant didn't ask.

Here, the court's assumption that everyone is HIV-negative barring contrary indication is grossly misplaced. The court based its approach on a monogamous man and woman. The judges' [latest word on the subject](#), from 2012, makes this plain. The judges tied their punitive approach to historical developments allowing a wife to refuse sex with her husband.

Protecting women's bodily integrity and sexual autonomy is crucial. But an approach crafted to protect the woman who relies on her partner to disclose changes to his health neglects the range of adult relationships. As the upcoming appeal attests, many cases where one partner is HIV-positive involve no women.

The issue isn't what we think makes for an optimal romantic relationship. Some people's ideal centres on the monogamous couple. Others' involves multiple partners, but with frank discussion and full disclosure. Nor is the issue whether there is an ethical duty to disclose. The issue is whether the blunt instrument of the criminal law appropriately punishes failure to disclose, including where no physical harm ensues.

The current approach is misguided and produces grave injustices. Our judges' interpretation of the criminal law will never grasp the variety of human interactions. But they can do better. Next week's case is their opportunity to do so.

Robert Leckey is director of the Paul-André Crépeau Centre for Private and Comparative Law at McGill University.

More on thestar.com



Entertainment made easy

Hedvig Alexander outshines embattled ...

Days like these

Mystery of the Ghomeshi interviews...



Toronto.com: Holiday Cocktails



Best new design: Jaguar



Bring holiday spirit to your home



Spices and herbs can make you healthier,

Editorial Board

Meet the Star's editorial board |
The Atkinson Principles

The Star's Public Editor

The Star's Public Editor welcomes reader comments and complaints about news and feature content in the print and online editions.

About the Public Editor
Recent Corrections
Report an Error

Most Popular

Blue Jays stand still while rivals make a splash at winter meetings |

Comics

It's official: You can buy 3-litre milk jugs |

Jonathan Toews hurt on 'dangerous' hit from behind |

Why are so many black children in foster and group homes?

Banking while black? Toronto man accuses Scotiabank of racial profiling

Drug companies' gifts to pharmacists probed by Ottawa

Maple Leafs likely to miss playoffs, hockey analytics suggest |

TTC rebrands its airport bus — the cheaper if

and thoughtful discussion. Readers are encouraged to flag comments that fail to meet ed in our [Community Code of Conduct](#). For further information, including our legal see our full website [Terms and Conditions](#).

is closed.

nt. [Show comments.](#)

not faster way to Pearson |

Stuck on the sidelines |

Cours	à@à7	↳	à@ Best
In*im i/re	Gartner	Stocks	Dividend
collefedicañh'...	CM S	toH old	ETFs
DEPyCous	Report	Foreuer	investm eritu co...
dñn*im i/re	sitecore.net	wealthyretir...	Investor's
Auwillaine.èà	ust	Lookinf to	Guide TheTop
sem ainesf	ReleasedÀ	retireÀ	àH ifh
Français.	Geta Free	These	Dividend
InscriytoÀ	Copy from	ÀforuexÀ	Payinf ETFs
	Sitecore a Ów	stocksw ill	forà@ã.
	M afic	pruide	
	5uadnant	refular	
	Leader	incom e.	

From around the web



What You Need To Know About Home Appraisals
Financial Literacy



How to protect your car's timing belt | Smart Tips
Yellowpages



A Prediction of Oil and Gas Markets
S&P Capital IQ



Which Browser is Best? Chrome vs. Firefox vs. Internet...
PC Magazine

Recommended by



Sponsor a child

You can help lift a child out of poverty



Free Magazines!

Online digital editions or subscribe!



Vintage Hotels

Luxury accommodations, dining and spa



Come As You Are

The Florida Keys & Key West



Lincoln MKC CUV

Starting at \$39,940. Click for Info.



Disney On Ice

Playing at Rogers Centre from Dec.19-28.

thestar.com

- News
- Your Toronto
- Opinion
- Sports
- Business
- Entertainment

- Wheels.ca
- Insurance Hotline
- New in Homes
- Star Store
- Blogs
- Contests

Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd.

- About
- Atkinson Principles
- Statement of Principles
- Get Home Delivery
- My Subscription

Advertise with us

- Advertising Terms
- Mediakit
- Online Advertising
- Print Advertising
- Special Features

Initiatives

- Santa Claus Fund
- Fresh Air Fund
- Speakers Bureau
- Classroom Connection
- Pages of the Past
- Report on Community

Connect with Us

- RSS feeds
- Twitter Updates
- News Alerts
- Newsletters
- Mobile Devices

[Life](#)
[Diversions](#)
[Classifieds](#)
[Site Map](#)

[Lottery Results](#)
[Obituaries](#)
[Corrections](#)
[Public Editor](#)
[Behavioural Targeting](#)
[Today's News](#)

[Contact Us](#)
[Contact Webmaster](#)
[FAQ](#)
[News Releases](#)
[Star Internships](#)
[Careers @ the Star](#)

[Giving](#)