

Innovative Ideas Competition 2 (II-2): Report on the Review and Selection Process

II-2 supports 2-year projects up to \$200K each. In this competition, 90 Letters of Intent (LOIs) were received, of which 22 were invited for full applications. Of these 22 full applications, 14 are receiving awards.

Competition Timeline:

- Competition launch: October 22, 2018
- Letter of Intent: November 23, 2018
- Invitation to submit full application: December 21, 2018
- Full application deadline: January 31, 2019
- External peer review: Feb-Mar 2019
- Award start: earliest April 1 and no later than September 1, 2019

Review process:

- Applicants were asked to suggest eight (8) potential reviewers. 179 suggested reviewers were invited to participate, of which 36 accepted.
- Reviewers were assigned to review applications that matched their expertise. Reviewers were also asked to self-report any conflicts of interest and to refrain from scoring applications for which their comfort rating in terms of expertise was low.
- Each application was evaluated by at least four (4) reviewers.
- Most reviewers evaluated four applications each. One reviewed five applications and two reviewed three applications.
- The reviewers provided raw scores based on the following criteria: research excellence (score 1), alignment with HBHL goals (score 2), excellence of the leadership and team (score 3) and appropriateness of the budget (score 4), as well as brief comments of the strengths and weaknesses of the application.

Scoring and selection:

The total median score, based on external review scoring, was used to calculate the ranking. This method was recommended by the HBHL Research Management Committee (RMC) following the first Innovative Ideas Competition. Median scores for each of the four criteria were calculated based on the scores provided by all reviewers of a given application. The sum of each criteria median score was then used to rank the application within each theme. The external review and scoring indicate that the majority of the 22 proposals were of high scientific quality. Furthermore, the RMC recognized that significant effort was made to prepare and review the proposals. Therefore, the RMC recommended to the HBHL Strategic Steering Committee (SSC) that the competition envelope be increased from initial \$1.72M to \$2.8M, allowing for 14 awards. The increased envelope was approved by the HBHL Board of Directors.

Distribution by HBHL Research Theme:

Research theme	LOIs	full application	Awards
1. Neuroinformatics and Computational Modelling	19	5	3
2. Mechanistic Models of Neurodegenerative Disorders	33	7	5
3. Applied Cognitive Neuroscience of Brain Plasticity	20	5	3
4. Population Neuroscience and Brain Health	18	5	3
Total	90	22	14