

James Administration Building, Room 400

Pavillon James de l'administration, bureau 400

Tel.: (514) 398-1224

Fax: (514) 398-6283

Date: Monday, September 12, 2016
Doc. #: CGPS-MM.02_2016.09.12
To : Members of the Council of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies (CGPS)
From : Josephine Nalbantoglu, Chair of Council of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies (CGPS)
Subject: New Thesis Examiner Report Forms
Purpose: For Information For Review and Approval

Rationale:

The evaluation of a graduate student's thesis is a key step towards degree completion. It is essential that the criteria for evaluation on the thesis examiner report forms align with the expectations for Master's and doctoral theses, respectively. In particular, a PhD thesis must constitute original scholarship and must make a distinct contribution to knowledge. A Master's thesis, on the other hand, does not need to fulfill these requirements.

Effective as of September 2016, GPS has moved from a single thesis examiner report form to two forms (Master's; PhD internal/external). The forms reflect the respective evaluation criteria for Master's and doctoral thesis. The revised evaluation criteria were developed by GPS and in consultation with academics in the community.

Details:

In order to increase transparency and clarity with the thesis examination process, the examiner report forms are now available on the [GPS website](#). Supervisors and students are encouraged to consult the criteria against which the thesis will be evaluated prior to writing and submitting the thesis. French versions of the forms are also available for examiners.

Appendices:

- A. Former thesis examiner form (Master's and doctoral) – **Doctoral form shown but the one for Masters is identical to this one.**
- B. New Master's form
- C. New PhD form (internal and external examiners)

REPORT DUE DATE: August 03, 2016

MCGILL UNIVERSITY
Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies**DOCTORAL
EXTERNAL
REPORT**NAME OF STUDENT:
DEGREE / UNIT:
THESIS TITLE:

Use the following scale:

EXCELLENT, VERY GOOD, GOOD, SATISFACTORY, or UNSATISFACTORY
(Choose one grade for each category)

Criteria	Excellent Top 10%	Very Good	Good	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory
1. Evidence of originality and creativity					
2. Resourcefulness, alertness to significance of findings					
3. Diligence, care, technical skill in the research					
4. Usefulness of the results to other workers in the field; value as a contribution to knowledge					
5. Grasp of subject, powers of criticism and general adequacy in review of previous work					
6. Quality of presentation (coherence, lucidity, grammar, style, freedom from typographical errors)					

7. **OVERALL JUDGEMENT (circle one) PASSED or NOT PASSED**
8. If the overall judgement is '**PASSED**' please provide:
- Comments explaining your evaluation of the thesis including recommendations for minor revisions to be included in the final thesis.
 - A list of questions to be asked at the oral examination.
 - Should this thesis be considered for a prestigious provincial or national award? (**circle one**) **YES or NO**
9. If the overall judgement is '**NOT PASSED**', at least one of the criteria above must be graded unsatisfactory. (Note: the thesis does not proceed to the Oral Defence unless a revised thesis has been submitted for examination and has been passed).
Please provide:
- Comments explaining your evaluation of the thesis, including a detailed description of the shortcomings that have informed your decision that it does not meet the requirements of a passing thesis.
 - An itemized list of the substantive issues that you expect the student to address for the written thesis to receive a passing grade upon re-examination and proceed to the oral defence. Please refer to appended instructions for examiners.

In order not to jeopardize the student's anticipated graduation timeline (and potential associated costs), we must receive your report no later than **August 03, 2016**. Please return your report to: Thesis Office by fax 514-398-6283, email or mail, Thesis Office, McGill University, James Administration Bldg, Room 400, 845 Sherbrooke St. W. Montreal, QC Canada H3A 2T5 Tel No. 514-398-5035 Ext.

DATE: _____ SIGNED: _____

McGill University
Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
Examiner Report – Master’s Thesis

Report Due Date:

Name of Student:

Degree/Unit:

Thesis Title:

As a thesis examiner, you will complete this form and attach a written report providing a detailed justification of your evaluation. The deadline to send **this form and your written report** to Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies (email: thesiscoordinator.gps@mcgill.ca) is _____. A late report has serious academic and financial consequences for the student. Thank you for your valuable contribution to this student’s examination.

1. Evaluation of the Thesis: Complete the evaluation grid below and comment on the criteria in your written report.

Criteria for Evaluation of Thesis	Excellent Top 10%	Very Good	Good	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory
1. Is in line with disciplinary norms					
2. Is situated in a broader context and appropriately acknowledges the larger field of research (e.g., citations/ references)					
3. Details methodology and methods					
4. Reports results clearly					
5. Justifies analyses and conclusions					
6. Discusses implications					
7. Is presented appropriately for disciplinary norms (grammar, style, coherence, cohesion)					
8. Complies with McGill’s guidelines for thesis preparation					

2. Overall Recommendation: Select one.

Recommendation	Select ONE
<p>PASSED - The thesis is ready for final submission.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Report must include any recommendations for <u>minor</u> revisions to the thesis (i.e., stylistic or editorial changes that can be completed in three weeks or less). 	
<p>NOT PASSED – The thesis needs major revisions before resubmitting.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> At least one of the Criteria for the Evaluation of the Thesis must be judged as unsatisfactory if the thesis is NOT PASSED. Report must include a detailed description of the shortcomings that have informed your decision, including an itemized list of substantive issues you would expect the student to address in order for the thesis to be given a PASS. If this is the first NOT PASSED assessment, the student will have the option to revise and resubmit the thesis. 	

DATE: _____ SIGNED: _____

McGill University
Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
Examiner Report – Doctoral Thesis

Report Due Date:**Name of Student:****Degree/Unit:****Thesis Title:**

As a thesis examiner, you will complete this form and attach a written report providing a detailed justification of your evaluation. The deadline to send **this form and your written report** to Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies (email: thesiscoordinator.gps@mcgill.ca) is _____. A late report has serious academic and financial consequences for the student. Thank you for your valuable contribution to this candidate's examination.

1. Evaluation of the Thesis: Complete the evaluation grid below and comment on the criteria in your written report.

Criteria for Evaluation of Thesis	Excellent Top 10%	Very Good	Good	Satisfactory	Unsatisfactory
1. Makes an original contribution to knowledge					
2. Advances knowledge in the field					
3. Is in line with disciplinary norms for research					
4. Is situated in a broader context and appropriately acknowledges the larger field of research (e.g., citations/ references)					
5. Details methodology and methods					
6. Reports results clearly					
7. Justifies analyses and conclusions					
8. Discusses implications					
9. Is presented appropriately for disciplinary norms (grammar, style, coherence, cohesion)					
10. Complies with McGill's guidelines for thesis preparation					

2. Overall Recommendation: Select one.

Recommendation	Select ONE
<p>PASSED - The thesis is ready to proceed to the Oral Defence.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Report must include any recommendations for <u>minor</u> revisions to the thesis (i.e., stylistic or editorial changes that can be completed in three weeks or less). Report must include questions to be asked of the candidate at the Oral Defence. 	
<p>NOT PASSED – The thesis needs major revisions before proceeding to the Oral Defence.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> At least one of the Criteria for the Evaluation of the Thesis must be judged as unsatisfactory if the thesis is NOT PASSED. Report must include a detailed description of the shortcomings that have informed your decision, including an itemized list of substantive issues you would expect the student to address in order for the thesis to be given a PASS and proceed to the Oral Defence. If this is the first NOT PASSED assessment, the student will have the option to revise and resubmit the thesis. 	

DATE: _____ SIGNED: _____