Glass Ceilings & Sticky Floors: Time for Academic Medicine to Renovate

Department of Medicine, Grand Rounds, April 4, 2017

Dr. Laurie Plotnick  MDCM, FRCPC
Associate Chair (Education)
Associate Professor
Department of Pediatrics, McGill University
Associate Director, Division of Pediatric Emergency Medicine, MCH, MUHC

Samara Zavalkoff  MDCM, FRCPC, FAAP
Program Director, Division of Pediatric Critical Care
Assistant Professor
Department of Pediatrics, McGill University
Medical Director, Extracorporeal Life Support (ECLS)
Attending Physician, Pediatric Critical Care, MCH, MUHC
Disclosures

We have no actual or potential conflict of interest in relation to this presentation.

(No affiliation, honoraria or monetary support from an industry source)
Objectives

By the end of this session, participants will be able to:

1. Describe barriers to women's advancement in medical leadership

2. Summarize the activities of the Women in Leadership Task Force

3. Describe strategies to close the gender gap in medical leadership
The Rise of Women does not mean The Fall of Men

Disclaimers

Disclaimers

Gender Disparity

• 23% university presidents
• 29% research chairs

Academics

• Academic rank
• Leadership

Academic Medicine

• Tenure
• Grants
• Papers

Research

Leopold TA et al., 2016, Timmons V, 2016; Marsden LR et al., 2012
Faculty of Medicine

- Dean
- Clinical Chairs
- Basic Science Chairs

- Vice Deans
- Associate Deans
- Director of centre/institute/unit
Department of Pediatrics

Demographics

- Women: 59%
- Men: 41%

Assistant

- Women: 65%
- Men: 35%

Associate

- Women: 58%
- Men: 42%

Professor

- Women: 29%
- Men: 71%
## Pediatrics - Leadership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Role</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pediatrics UGME Director</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-specialty Program Directors</td>
<td>14</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Training Program Director</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Assistant Program Director</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division Directors</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Chairs*</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vice Chair</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Head of Child Health Research**</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chair</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Is the Department of Medicine Different?
Department of Medicine

Demographics
- Women: 37%
- Men: 63%

Assistant
- Women: 45%
- Men: 55%

Associate
- Women: 33%
- Men: 67%

Professor
- Women: 24%
- Men: 76%
# Internal Medicine: Leadership

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Internal Medicine UGME Director</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Subspecialty Program Directors</td>
<td>9</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Site Directors</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Assistant Program Director</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Core Training Program Director</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Division Directors</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Directors</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive Associate Physician-in-Chief</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chair</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Common Misperceptions

- ↑♀ → ↑♀ leaders
- Less interest
- Opportunities ♀ = ♂
- Opportunities = Equality


http://chatsworthconsulting.com/tag/perceptions
Opportunities are the same but the ability to take advantage/accept the opportunities is different.

Female, Focus Group
Common Misperceptions

http://darkroom.baltimoresun.com/2014/02/sochi-olympics-day-5-mancuso-wins-skiing-bronze-curling-begins/
Advantages of Gender Diversity in Medical Leadership

Wider pool of talent → Varied perspectives, ideas, skills → More innovation, productivity, strategies
Advantages of Gender Diversity in Medical Leadership

- Representation of patient needs
- Creation of role models
- Increased engagement
Women in Leadership Task Force

Department of Pediatrics

April 2016 - Present
Membership

Laurie Plotnick – Chair
Associate Professor, Associate Director, Pediatric Emergency Medicine,

Ingrid Chadwick
Assistant Professor, Management, John Molson School of Business

Jean-Pierre Farmer
Chair, Pediatric Surgery and Pediatric Neurosurgeon

Stephen Liben
Professor, Director, Pediatric Palliative Care Program

June Ortenberg
Assistant Professor, General Pediatrics

Joyce Plckering
Executive Associate Physician-in-Chief of Medicine

Maria Psihogios
PGY1 Pediatrics

Aimee Ryan
Associate Professor, Department of Pediatrics

Christine Sabapathy
Assistant Professor, Hematology-Oncology

Samara Zavalkoff
Assistant Professor, Pediatric Critical Care
WIL taskforce mandate

Realistic action plans

↑ Women applying for leadership

↑ Women assuming leadership
WIL Taskforce Initiatives

- Literature review
- Survey
- Leadership for Medical Women conference
- Focus groups
Survey and Focus Groups: Objectives

• Explore perceived barriers
• Surface innovative ideas
Survey - Methods

- Development

- Questions:
  - Demographic
  - Career development
  - Barriers
  - Strategies

- Target: faculty, trainees

- Administration
Focus Group-Methods

- 3 groups: male, female, mixed
- Participant selection
- Focus group facilitators
  - Gender matched to group
  - Qualitative researchers
- Question
Survey Results

- 57.5% (n=160) response rate
- Wide representation
Focus Group Results

• 17 women, 10 men
• Wide representation
https://medium.com/@UN_Women/comic-competition-winners-gender-equality-picture-it-b2b1690c6d14
Gender Disparity Principles

• Fairness
• Stereotypes and biases
• Stem from everyone
## Barrier 1 - Image of a Leader

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Agentic</th>
<th>Communal</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Dedicated</td>
<td>• Warm</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Competent</td>
<td>• Caring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Strong</td>
<td>• Sensitive</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Assertive</td>
<td>• Honest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Decisive</td>
<td>• Nurturing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Independent</td>
<td>• Dependent</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Analytical</td>
<td>• Collaborative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Action-oriented</td>
<td>• Supportive</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Burgess, DJ et al.; 2012, Zhuge, Y, et al., 2011)
Barrier 1 - Image of a Leader

**Agentic** = Men
- Dedicated
- Competent
- Strong
- Assertive
- Decisive
- Independent
- Analytical
- Action-oriented

**Communal** = Women
- Warm
- Caring
- Sensitive
- Honest
- Nurturing
- Dependent
- Collaborative
- Supportive

(Burgess, DJ et al.; 2012, Zhuge, Y, et al., 2011)
If you (and a male colleague) are both talking to someone, I often find that the male ... is being listened to more than the female...

I’ve even had some nurses [say] “You’re [going to] have to have...a deeper, more assertive voice, [because] they’re [going to] listen to the male in the room.

Female, Focus Group
Barrier 1 - Image of a Leader
... if a man is more outspoken, he is a leader... if a woman is more outspoken ... that can be seen as negative ... not only just by men, but I think as a society we do tend to ... have a harder time with strong-willed women, [whereas] being strong-willed... for a man is a positive thing when it comes to leadership.

Male, Focus Group
Barrier 1 - Image of a Leader

- Man
- Woman
- Leader
- Leader
- Leader
- Leader
Barrier 2 - Lack of Active Guidance

Mentorship – quantity and quality

...there is a bit of reluctance [for women] to go for mentorship: “I don’t know who to talk to, I am too shy, I wouldn’t even know where to begin”... [mentorship] seems to be more of a natural fit for men, and I think women are a little bit too shy or less inclined to go there.

Female, Focus Group
## Barrier 2 - Lack of Active Guidance

### Networking

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Networking Opportunities</th>
<th>Female</th>
<th>Male</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Same</td>
<td>34.1% (31)</td>
<td>66.0% (31)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Different</td>
<td>65.9% (60)</td>
<td>34.0% (16)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

$\chi^2 = 12.78; p=0.002$
Barrier 3 - Family Obligations

• Disproportionate

• Self-perceived barrier - F 42.5% vs. M 27.3%

• Top challenge to women
Barrier 3 - Family Obligations

• You have to look outside in a broader society context... I’ve been reasonably successful in my career ... I am very fortunate. I have a very supportive wife who was ready to give up her own career to raise our children ... I did a lot of things that, if I was a woman, I am sure I wouldn’t be able to do.

Male, Focus Group
### Woman’s “choice”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Many role models</td>
<td>Few role models</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Woman’s “choice”**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Many role models</td>
<td>Few role models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentors and networks</td>
<td>Few mentors and networks</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Woman’s “choice”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Many role models</td>
<td>Many role models</td>
<td>Few role models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentors and networks</td>
<td>Few mentors and networks</td>
<td>Major role models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minority are primary caretakers</td>
<td>Minority are primary caretakers</td>
<td>Majority are primary caretakers</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Woman’s “choice”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Many role models</td>
<td>Few role models</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentors and networks</td>
<td>Few mentors and networks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minority are primary caretakers</td>
<td>Majority are primary caretakers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not bear children</td>
<td>Bear children</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Woman’s “choice”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Men</th>
<th>Women</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Many role models</td>
<td>Few role models</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mentors and networks</td>
<td>Few mentors and networks</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Minority are primary caretakers</td>
<td>Majority are primary caretakers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not bear children</td>
<td>Bear children</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Do not breastfeed</td>
<td>Breastfeed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Adapted from: Handelsman, J. https://med.stanford.edu/facultydiversity/diversity-resources/information-about-bias/handelsman-video-page.html
Barrier 4 - Distracting Roles

Clinical & Educational Roles

Image of Leader
No Guidance
Family

No Advancement

Low Visibility
Less Valued
...Male leadership tends to be ... about formal leadership roles... The informal leadership ... is heavily [undertaken by] women ... this sort of day-to-day, not named “chair of committee or department head,” but “lived” leadership ...that doesn’t necessarily get recognized or get much...

Male, Focus Group
Barrier 5 - Organizational Structure

Traditional Career Path

Dial M for Mother
Female labour-force participation rate by age 2012, %

- South Korea*
- Japan
- OECD average
- Denmark*
- United States

Source: OECD
*Biggest growth/decline between 25-29 and 30-34 in the OECD

Barrier 5 - Organizational Structure

Lack of:

• Family-friendly environment
• Metrics
• Policy
Glass Ceiling & Sticky Floor

(Monroe, A.K., et al., 2015; Zhuge, Y. et al., 2011; Carnes, M. et al., 2008)
Potential Strategies
Gender Diversity = Gender-diverse Solutions
1. Training & Education

The first step in solving a problem is to recognize that it does exist.

Zig Ziglar
1. Training & Education

- Diversity expert

Outcomes:
  - Buy-in
  - Gender Diversity policy
  - Training of Departmental leaders
  - Bias-free selection and promotion

Faculty of Medicine Diversity Workshops

(Carnes, M. et al., 2015; Burgess, DJ et al., 2012; CIDA 2010; Carnes, M et al, 2008)
2. Data Tracking and Monitoring

• Tracking demographics
• Measurement of metrics
• Real-time reporting

3. Renewed Career Framework

Academic Biomedical Career Customization (ABCC)

- Framework
  - Individualized
  - All life stages

- Banking Program

(Valantine, H & Sandborg, CI, 2013)
4. Active Guidance for Women

• Formal mentorship program
• Networking
• Workshops, programs and meetings
5. Family-friendly Work Environment

• Meeting times and remote access

• Departmental petition for:
  • On-site childcare
  • On-site amenities and services
  • On-site employee gym
Take-Home Points

• The gender gap is real
• Gender diversity is necessary
• Implicit biases → barriers
• Many strategies to consider
Acknowledgements

• Dr. Michael Shevell, Chair, McGill Department of Pediatrics
• Ms. Sylvie Lafleur, MUHC Administrative Assistant
• Mr. Jing Yang Xiao, McGill data analyst
• Dr. Saleem Razack, Director of PICU, Director of Office of Social Accountability and Community Engagement
• Dr. Peter Nugus, Assistant Professor, Centre for Medical Education and Department of Family Medicine, McGill University
• Dr. Franco Carnavale, Professor and Associate Director Research, Ingram School of Nursing, McGill University
• Ms. Kendall Kolne PhD student, School of Communication Sciences and Disorders, McGill University
• Ms. Isadora Hellegren, RA, Department of Art History and Communication Studies, McGill University
• Ms. Cecilia Delamora, graduate student, Études Urbanes et Touristiques, Université du Québec a Montreal
Be brave enough to start a conversation that matters.

Margaret Wheatley
References


References


Medscape Survey