The Nurse Family Partnership Program: Adolescent Outcomes in the Elmira Randomized Controlled Trial

John Eckenrode
Professor of Human Development
Director, Family Life Development Center
Cornell University

McGill University
April 14, 2010
Background

• Preventive interventions for young parents may reduce health and developmental problems later in life

• There is much recent interest in home visitation services aimed at promoting maternal health and caregiving

• There have been no studies of children in randomized trials of home visitation programs as they enter young adulthood
Objectives

• To review the long-term effects of the Nurse-Family Partnership program on mothers and children through age 19

• Special focus on prevention of child abuse and neglect in the Elmira Trial

• Discuss implementation
# Research Team

### Cornell
- John Eckenrode
- Chuck Henderson
- Charles Izzo
- Elliott Smith
- David Zielinski
- Jane Powers
- Mary Campa
- Margaret McCarthy
- Kerry Bolger
- Pamela Morris
- Barbara Ganzel
- Lyscha Marcynyszyn

### Rochester
- Harriet Kitzman
- Bob Cole
- Kim Sidora
- Kathy Buckwell
- Beth Anson

### Colorado
- David Olds
- Ruth O’Brien
- JoAnn Robinson
- Lisa Pettitt
- Dennis Luckey
- John Holmberg
- Kathy Isacks
- Robin Tutt

### Baylor
- Carole Hanks
FOUR PHASES OF PREVENTION RESEARCH

1. Problem Analysis
2. Intervention Design
3. Field Trial
4. Widespread Diffusion

Risk Factors

Prototype
TRIALS OF PROGRAM

Elmira, NY
- Low-income whites
- Semi-rural
N = 400

Memphis, TN
- Low-income blacks
- Urban
N = 1,138

Denver, CO
- Large portion of Hispanics
- Nurse versus paraprofessional visitors
N = 735
FAMILIES SERVED

• Low income pregnant women
  – Usually teens
  – Usually unmarried

• First-time parents
THREE GOALS

1. Improve pregnancy outcomes
2. Improve child health and development
3. Improve parents’ economic self-sufficiency
Elmira Trial

Families Served

• 400 women
• First live birth
• Demographic risk (teen, poor, or single)

(Random Assignment)

Comparison Group
Screening & referral only

Nurse Visited Group
Screening & referral

plus

Nurse visitation through child’s 2nd birthday
15-Year NFP Sample

- 324 Families were Assessed
  - 81% of the Randomized Sample
  - 92% of Families Eligible at 15 Years

- No differences in attrition based on:
  - Treatment group status
  - Key demographics
Enduring Effects on Low-Income, Unmarried Mothers’ Behavior
Elmira 15-Year Follow-up

- 79% fewer verified reports of child abuse and neglect
- 32% fewer subsequent births
- 30 fewer months of welfare use
- 44% fewer behavioral problems due to alcohol & drug abuse
- 69% fewer arrests

Survival functions for age at first CPS report:
All respondents

All Maltreatment

Neglect
Survival functions for age at first CPS report: High-risk sub-group

Number of Maltreatment Reports by Treatment Status and Level of Domestic Violence

How Does Nurse Home Visitation Prevent Child Maltreatment?

Home Visiting

Fewer children

Less child maltreatment over 15 years

Less welfare use
## ELMIRA SUSTAINABLE RESULTS:

### Adolescents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Percentage Decrease</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arrests</td>
<td>54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Convictions</td>
<td>69%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sexual Partners</td>
<td>58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cigarettes Smoked</td>
<td>28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of days consuming alcohol</td>
<td>51%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

15-YEAR OLDS BORN TO UNMARRIED, LOW-INCOME MOTHERS
19-Year Follow-Up

- N = 310 with an average age of 19, representing 78% of youth eligible for follow-up from earlier phases of the research
- There was no indication of attrition bias
- Data were collected through phone interviews
- Main outcomes: criminal involvement, reproductive behaviors, educational achievement, public assistance use
- Funding: Smith Richardson Foundation
Cox proportional hazard curves showing the hazard of first arrest for boys in the comparison (n = 67) and nurse-visited (n = 47) groups

Cox proportional hazard curves showing the hazard of first arrest for girls in the comparison (n = 73) and nurse-visited (n = 43) groups.

Estimates of rates of arrest from cubic regressions by treatment and the youth's sex using a generalized linear model assuming a negative binomial distribution and a log link.

• The program showed enduring effects on girls’ criminal involvement

• For girls born to unmarried and low income mothers, childbearing and Medicaid use. These findings were consistent with results reported in earlier phases of the trial for the mothers.

• Further analyses will seek to determine why there were few program effects for boys.
CONSISTENT RESULTS ACROSS TRIALS

• Improvements in women’s prenatal health
• Reductions in children’s injuries
• Fewer subsequent pregnancies
• Greater intervals between births
• Increases in fathers’ involvement
• Increases in employment
• Reductions in welfare and food stamps
• Improvements in school readiness
Figure 6-1
Rates of Return to Human Capital Investment Initially Setting Investment to be Equal Across all Ages

Cumulative Cost Savings: Elmira Home Visits (High-Risk Families)

Cumulative dollars per child

Cumulative savings

• Implications for future research in this area
  – A 27 year follow-up study of the youth in this trial will allow for a more complete assessment of life course outcomes.
  – More scientific attention to girls in observational and interventional studies of criminal behavior is needed.
  – More long-term studies of early intervention trials should be conducted.

• Implications for health policy
  – Prenatal and infancy home visiting by nurses to higher risk mothers having their first child may have a long-term benefits for their children.
FROM SCIENCE TO PRACTICE

- Nurturing Community, Organizational, and State Development
- Training and Technical Assistance
- Program Guidelines
- Clinical Information System
- Assessing Program Performance
- Continuous Improvement
Invest in Ongoing Research

- Evidence-based programs are works in progress

- Building next generation of NFP with national office, local sites, and British government
U.S. Policy Initiative

• Patient Protection and Affordable Care Act of 2010
  includes $1.5 Billion over 5 years in mandatory funding for an innovative Home Visitation Grant Program for States
Model Development

Original Trials
- Trial 1
- Trial 2
- Trial 3

Articulate Essential Model Elements

Develop/Test Model Innovations

Study and improve Implementation Process

International Replication
- Adapt and Test Original Model

US Community Replication
- Community Preparation
- Training/Coaching of Nurses
- Implementation Assessment
- Continuous Quality Improvement
Program Improvement Research

• Identify vulnerabilities in NFP in varying settings, with new populations.

• Develop NFP program innovations to improve NFP.

• Test efficacy and cost-effectiveness of program innovations.
Implementation/Dissemination Research

• Examine community, organizational, work-force, and NFP-team factors that affect the translation of the NFP model into effective practice.

• Improve selection and preparation of communities and organizations to deliver the NFP with fidelity

• Improve selection, education, and on-going support of nurses in delivering the program.

• Examine and enhance program reach within communities.
Nurse-Family Partnership

Helping First-Time Parents Succeed