### McGILL UNIVERSITY SENATE



# Report of the Academic Policy Committee D12-37

## 443<sup>rd</sup> REPORT OF THE ACADEMIC POLICY COMMITTEE TO SENATE

on APC meeting held on 13th December 2012

### I. TO BE APPROVED BY SENATE

(A) NEW TEACHING PROGRAMS REQUIRING SENATE APPROVAL (approvals of new minors and options added to existing programs and major revisions to programs are reported in Section IV.A.1.a. for information)

School of Continuing Studies - Appendix A

Certificate in Condominium Management (16 CEUs) Certificat en gestion de copropriété (16 CEUs)

At a meeting on 13<sup>th</sup> December 2012, APC reviewed a proposal from the School of Continuing Studies for the creation of two certificate programs, the Certificate in Condominium Management (16 CEUs) and its equivalent in French, the *Certificat en gestion de copropriété* (16 CEUs). This non-credit professional development program is intended for persons called to act as condominium managers. Response to the courses already offered, to test the market, has been encouraging, and the level of recognition was determined to be appropriate. Submission to CREPUQ's *Commission d'évaluation des projets de programmes (CEP)* and to the Ministry of Higher Education, Research, Science and Technology (MHERST) for evaluation and approval is not required.

APC therefore recommends that Senate approve the following resolution:

Be it resolved that Senate approve the proposed Certificate in Condominium Management and Certificat en gestion de copropriété.

### (B) ACADEMIC PERFORMANCE ISSUES / POLICIES / GOVERNANCE/AWARDS

Revisions to the Regulations on Challenge of a Thesis Examination Failure – Appendix B

At a meeting on 13<sup>th</sup> December 2012, APC reviewed a proposal from the Council of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies (CGPS) to revise the Regulations on Challenge of a Thesis Examination Failure. The proposed revisions result from a review of thesis guidelines conducted by Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies in consultation with PGSS, faculties, and other units. The only substantive change involves a modification to the policies and procedures for thesis challenges.

APC therefore recommends that Senate approve the following resolution:

Be it resolved that Senate approve the proposed Revisions to the Regulations on Challenge of a Thesis Examination Failure.

- (C) CREATION OF NEW UNITS / NAME CHANGES / REPORTING CHANGES none
- (D) CHANGES IN DEGREE DESIGNATION none

### II. TO BE ENDORSED BY SENATE / PRESENTED TO SENATE FOR DISCUSSION - none

### III. APPROVED BY APC IN THE NAME OF SENATE

- (A) DEFINITIONS none
- (B) STUDENT EXCHANGE PARTNERSHIPS / CONTRACTS / INTERUNIVERSITY PARTNERSHIPS
  - EBS (European Business School) Universität für Wirtschaft und Recht and McGill Faculty of Law

At a meeting on 13th December 2012, APC reviewed and approved a proposal that McGill enter into a student exchange agreement with EBS Universität für Wirtschaft und Recht that would be limited to students in the Faculty of Law. EBS and McGill are fellow members of the Law Schools Global League, founded at the Netherlands' Tilburg University in June 2012. EBS is one of relatively few German faculties of Law that offer courses in English. This exchange will provide an opportunity for McGill Law students to study German and European Law in English. Students with the requisite German language skills will also have access to the German-taught courses. Supplementary lessons in German legal language complement the exchange program. As part of the exchange, McGill students will be able to participate in the EBS Law Summer Program - The Law of the European Union, an intensive four-week summer English program in Law which will be held in June of each year focusing on European Business Law. The EBS Universität für Wirtschaft und Recht is Germany's first private stateaccredited research university specialized in business and law. Founded in 1971 as European Business School, it has, for decades, maintained a leading position among German institutions of higher education and research in business administration. In June 2010, EBS Business School became one of two faculties of the newly founded EBS University of Business and Law, the first of its kind in Germany. Today EBS is regarded as the pioneer and role model for innovative and dynamic types of new German business and law schools. McGill currently has eight student exchange agreements with institutions in Germany: Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg, Freie Universität Berlin, Ludwig-Maximilians-Universität München, Technische Universität Berlin, Universität Mannheim, Technische Universität München, Universität zu Köln, and Universität Tübingen

(C) OTHER - none

### IV. FOR THE INFORMATION OF SENATE

- A) APPROVAL OF COURSES AND TEACHING PROGRAMS
  - 1. Programs
    - a) APC approvals (new options/concentrations and major revisions to existing programs)
      - i. New concentrations/options within existing programs

Faculty of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences

M.Sc. (Applied) in Bioresource Engineering; Non-Thesis – Integrated Food and Bioprocessing (45 cr.)

This new option is based on the Faculty's expertise in food sciences and processes. The goals of this course-based program are to provide up-to-date world-class

knowledge on techniques for adequate process design and management of biomass production strategies to deliver quality food, natural fiber, biochemicals, biomaterials and biofuels, in a sustainable and environmental friendly way for the benefits of all. Students may complete any combination of research and internships totaling 12 credits. The program option was approved by SCTP on 18<sup>th</sup> October 2012, by the Council on Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies on 19<sup>th</sup> November 2012 and by APC on 13<sup>th</sup> December 2012.

- ii. Major revisions of existing programs none
- b) APC Subcommittee on Courses and Teaching Programs (SCTP) approvals (Summary reports: <a href="http://www.mcgill.ca/sctp/documents/">http://www.mcgill.ca/sctp/documents/</a>)
  - i. Moderate and minor program revisions

Faculty of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences

Approved by SCTP on 15th November 2012:

- M.Sc.; Animal Science; Thesis (45 cr.)

#### Faculty of Education

Approved by SCTP on 15th November 2012:

- M.A.; Counselling Psychology; Professional/Internship; Non-Thesis (60 cr.)
- M.A.; Teaching and Learning; Social Sciences; Non-Thesis (60 cr.)
- B.Ed.; Kindergarten and Elementary Jewish Studies (120 cr.)
- B.Sc. (Kinesiology); Kinesiology; Major (90 cr.)
- B.Sc. (Kinesiology); Kinesiology; Honours (90 cr.)
- ii. Program retirements

School of Continuing Studies

- Certificate; Computer Software Technology (30 cr.)
- Diploma; E-Business (30 cr.)
- Diploma; Information Technology (30 cr.)
- Diploma; Management; E-Business (30 cr.)
- Diploma; Management; E-Commerce (30 cr.)
- Graduate Certificate; E-Business (15 cr.)
- Graduate Certificate; E-Commerce (15 cr.)

#### 2. Courses

a) New Courses

Approved by SCTP on 15th November 2012: 21

Faculty of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences: 1

School of Continuing Studies: 9

Faculty of Education: 4

Faculty of Engineering: 3

Faculty of Law: 2

Faculty of Medicine: 2

b) Course Revisions:

Approved by SCTP on 15th November 2012: 23

Faculty of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences: 7

School of Continuing Studies: 1

Faculty of Education: 9

Faculty of engineering: 2 Faculty of Medicine: 2 Faculty of Science: 2

c) Course retirements:

Approved by SCTP on 15<sup>th</sup> November 2012: 81

School of Continuing Studies: 5

Faculty of Engineering: 2

Faculty of Medicine: 74

(B) OTHER - none



### New Program/Major or Minor/Concentration Proposal Form

100	and the second			(07/20
Degree Title     Please specify the two degrees for caprograms	concurrent degree		ing Faculty/Unit	
Certificate		School of C	ontinuing Studies	
1.1 Major (Legacy= Subject)(30-char. m	ax.)	Offering Fa	aculty/Department	
Condominium Management		SCS/Career	and Professional Dev	relopment
1.2 Concentration (Legacy = Concentration/Option) If applicable to Majors only (30 char. max.)		3.0 Effective To (Ex. Sept. 2 Term	erm of Implementat 2004 = 200409)	ion
1.3 Minor (with Concentration, if Applical	ble) (30 char. max.)	201301		
4.0 Rationale for new proposal				
Condominium development has enjoyed in condos is expected to increase to 266 professionals who can deal effectively wi School of Continuing Studies is introduci management and provides participants w	th various aspects of m	nanaging a condominium.	06). This growth requir	res qualified
5.0 Program Information				
Please check appropriate box(es) 5.1 Program Type	E 2 Cata			
☐ Bachelor's Program	5.2 Category	, ,	5.3 Level	
☐ Master's	☐ Faculty Progra	m (FP)	Undergraduate	
□ M.Sc. (Applied) Program	☐ Major ☐ Joint Major		☐ Dentistry/Law/	
☐ Dual Degree/Concurrent Program	☐ Major Concent	makin (OON)	Continuing Ed	(Non-Credit)
X Certificate	☐ Minor	ration (CON)	☐ Collegial	k.
☐ Diploma	☐ Minor Concent	rotion (CON)	☐ Masters & Grad	d Dips & Certs
☐ Graduate Certificate	Honours (HON		☐ Doctorate	
☐ Graduate Diploma	☐ Joint Honours		☐ Post-Graduate	Medicine/Dentistry
☐ Ph.D. Program	☐ Internship/Co-c	component (HC)	☐ Graduate Quali	ifying 
☐ Doctorate Program	☐ Thesis (T)	γþ	☐ Postdoctoral Fe	ellows
(Other than Ph.D.)	☐ Non-Thesis (N)	ı		
☐ Private Program	Other			
☐ Off-Campus Program	Dlagea engolify			
☐ Distance Education Program				
(By Correspondence)				
☐ Other (Please specify)				
) Total Credits		7.0 Consultation wit		
16 CEUs		Related Units	Yes <b>X*</b>	No 🛂
10 0003		Financial Consu	lt Yes	No 😧
-	Total American	Attach list of cor	isultations.	

### 8.0 Program Description (Maximum 150 words)

The non-credit Professional Development Certificate in Condominium Management is designed to offer new and experienced residential and commercial condominium managers with the information, knowledge and skills required for successful condominium management. Each course consists of 30 hours of classroom instruction plus pre-course readings and assignments. This program will be offered in English and French.

### 9.0 List of proposed program for the New Program/Major or Minor/Concentration.

If new concentration (option) of existing Major/Minor (program), please attach a program layout (list of all courses) of existing Major/Minor.

Proposed program (list courses as follows: Subj Code/Crse Num, Title, Credit weight under the headings of: Required Courses, Complementary Courses, Elective Courses)

### Certificate in Condominium Management (16 CEUs)

Required Courses: (16 CEUs)

CBUS 100 Condominium Financial Management (4 CEUs)

CBUS 102 Condominium Law in Quebec (4 CEUs)

CBUS 104 Condominium Building and Maintenance Management (4 CEUs)

CBUS 106 Managing Day-To-Day Condominium Operations (4 CEUs)

PROJ. 12.85

10.0 Approvals			
Routing Sequence	Name	Signature	Date
Department	Carmen Sicília. Director CPD	Thoke	Oct .21, 201
Curric/Acad Committee	James Archibald, Associate Dean		(O++ 23/12)
Faculty 1	Inna Popova, Associate Director CPD	Murol	180cx 2012
Faculty 2	Judith Potter, Dean of Continuing Studies		NOV. 1, 2012
Faculty 3	SCTP		
SCTP	DODAVEN		Dec.6,2012
GS 8	AFF MUVEL		
APPC	Helen H. C. RICHARD	Henkeledans	13th Dec 2012
Senate			
		en e	
Submitted by			
Name [	INNA POPOVA	To be completed by ARR:	
Phone	6227	CIP Code	
Email	INNA . POPOVA @ HCG-11.	<4	
Submission Date			
	•		



### New Program/Major or Minor/Concentration Proposal Form

(07/2004

			(07/2004
Degree Title     Please specify the two degrees for cor	ncurrent degree	2.0 Administerin	ig Faculty/Unit
programs	ing day and day stight it open in the world with the continues containing	School of Co	ontinuing Studies
Certificat			Adding which come and the first production and the production of the contract
1.1 Major (Legacy= Subject)(30-char. max	c.)	Offering Fac	culty/Department
gestion de copropriété		SCS/Career and Professional Development	
1.2 Concentration (Legacy = Concentration/Option) If applicable to Majors only (30 char. max.)		3.0 Effective Te (Ex. Sept. 2 Term	rm of Implementation 004 = 200409)
		201301	
1.3 Minor (with Concentration, if Applicabl	e) (30 char. max.)		
4.0 Rationale for new proposal			
Le développement de la copropriété s'est familles québécoises vivant dans les copropries par les professionnels	opriétés devrait ainsi au conalifiés qui neuvent o	igmenter à 266 000 en : érer efficacement les di	vers aspects liés à la gestion d'une
annonriété Dour rénondre à cette demar	ide croissante, l'Ecole d es de la gestion des cop	'éducation permanente	de l'Université McGill offre un nouveau mini- c participants d'acquérir les connaissances,
5.0 Program Information			
Please check appropriate box(es)	E 2 Catagoni		5.3 Level
5.1 Program Type	5.2 Category  Faculty Program	n (ED)	☐ Undergraduate
☐ Bachelor's Program	☐ Major	(,,	☐ Dentistry/Law/Medicine
☐ Master's			☑ Continuing Ed (Non-Credit)
☐ M.Sc. (Applied) Program	☐ Joint Major	ntion (CON)	☐ Collegial
☐ Dual Degree/Concurrent Program	☐ Major Concentr	ation (CON)	☐ Masters & Grad Dips & Certs
▼ Certificate	☐ Minor	r (00th	
☐ Diploma	Minor Concentr		<ul><li>☐ Doctorate</li><li>☐ Post-Graduate Medicine/Dentistry</li></ul>
☐ Graduate Certificate	☐ Honours (HON)		
☐ Graduate Diploma	☐ Joint Honours C		Graduate Qualifying
Ph.D. Program	☐ Internship/Co-o	р	☐ Postdoctoral Fellows
☐ Doctorate Program	☐ Thesis (T)		
(Other than Ph.D.)	☐ Non-Thesis (N)		
☐ Private Program			
☐ Off-Campus Program			
☐ Distance Education Program			
(By Correspondence)			
☐ Other (Please specify)			
6.0 Total Credits		7.0 Consultation v	vith Yes <b>X<sup>₺</sup></b> No <b>∄</b>
16 CEUs		Financial Cons	·
	-	Attach list of c	onsultations. VAGEMENT

#### 8.0 Program Description (Maximum 150 words)

Ce Certificat en gestion de copropriété permet aux gestionnaires des copropriétés résidentielles et commerciales, avec ou sans expérience, d'acquérir l'information, les connaissances et les compétences nécessaires à la gestion efficace des copropriétés. Les participants auront l'occasion de s'informer de l'état de la situation et d'avoir accès aux connaissances et compétences exigées des gestionnaires de copropriété. Chaque cours se compose de 30 heures d'enseignement en classe ainsi que des lectures et des devoirs. Ce certificat sera offert en anglais et en français.

9.0 List of proposed program for the New Program/Major or Minor/Concentration.

If new concentration (option) of existing Major/Minor (program), please attach a program layout (list of all courses) of existing Major/Minor.

Proposed program (list courses as follows: Subj Code/Crse Num, Title, Credit weight under the headings of: Required Courses, Complementary Courses, Elective Courses)

### Certificat en gestion de copropriété (16 CEUs)

Required Courses: (16 CEUs)

CBUS 101 Gestion financière de la copropriété (4 CEUs)

CBUS 103 Gestion juridique de la copropriété (4 CEUs)

CBUS 105 Gestion technique du bâtiment de la copropriété (4 CEUs)

CBUS 107 Gestion de la vie quotidienne d'une copropriété (4 CEUs)

10.0 Approvals			
Routing Sequence	Name	Signature	Date
Department	Carmen Sicilia, Director CPD	1 cles	Oct 21/2018
Curric/Acad Committee	James Archibald. Associate Dean		10 A 39/12
Faculty 1	Inna Popova, Associate Director CPD	Jagrol -	180cr 2012
Faculty 2	Judith Potter. Dean of Continuino Studies		NOV. 1, 2012
Faculty 3	CATE TO		
SCTP	3011		Dec. 6, 2012
GS	APPROVED		
APPC	Helen M.C RICHARD	Helen te checkard	13th Dec 2012
Senate			
de de la companya agua			
Submitted by			
Name	INNA POPOVA	To be completed by ARR:	
Phone	6227	CIP Code	
Email	INNA-POPOUA EMCGIII. CA		
Submission Date			
	•		

### Modifications to Thesis Challenge policy and procedures

As submitted to and approved by APC, 30<sup>th</sup> November 2012

For the past six months GPS, with consultation from Council, my Advisory Committee, PGSS, Faculties, and other units has been revising the thesis guidelines. The only substantive change that we have decided on, one that I think must go to Senate, involves a modification to the policies and procedures for thesis challenges. The attached document shows the current policy in the left column and the revision in the right column.

#### Background:

The Challenge Hearing Policy was originally designed so that the student would have recourse outside the normal examination process if he/she felt that "bias, error, or serious misrepresentation" on the part of the examiner was the reason that the thesis was not passed--rather than its scholarly or scientific merit. However, there is a clause in the existing regulations that has caused confusion regarding the purpose and procedures regarding the policy: "A challenge will seldom be heard unless the thesis has been failed after the revise and resubmit process." This sentence has been read to imply that bias, error, or serious misunderstanding on the part of the examiner could only occur in a second examination failure. More importantly, it has also been interpreted as follows: by suggesting that a challenge would not occur until the thesis failed twice, students and supervisors dealing with this situation viewed the challenge process as not specifically dealing only with issues of bias, etc. (despite clear instructions) but rather as another (now 3rd) attempt to judge the substantive scholarly and /or scientific merits of the thesis. The challenge is, of course, not about whether or not a thesis has substantive merit as partial fulfilment of the degree (the normal examination process ascertains this), but whether or not a student has been the victim of bias, error, or serious misrepresentation on the part of the examiner who failed the thesis. The proposed new process attempts to avoid this confusion by being clearer and more transparent, and by separating the challenge process from the revise and resubmit process; the revision also responds to recommendations made by the Committee on Student Grievances by including the student in the hearing process.

#### Consultation:

An earlier version of the attached revision was discussed at several council meetings and advisory committee meetings. It was then sent electronically to every GPD at McGill, to the PGSS executive, and to a number of chairs and academic staff along with a survey link for providing feedback, revisions, comments, etc. The responses were discussed with the GPS associate Deans, Advisory Committee, and Council. A revised version of the document, taking account of some of the suggestions and revisions, was brought to Graduate Council for approval on 19 November. It was approved unanimously by Council.

Sincerely,

MK

Martin Kreiswirth, PhD

Associate Provost (Graduate Education)
Dean, Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
Professor of English
McGill University
James Administration Building, Rm 325
845 Sherbrooke St. West

Montreal, Quebec, Canada H3A 2T5 Tel: **(514) 398-1224**; Fax: (514) 398-3296

#### Current regulations (to be replaced)

# Challenge of a thesis examination failure

When a thesis has been failed and the student feels that the failure is not based on the academic or scholarly quality of the thesis itself, but rather that the judgment of failure is determined by bias, error, or serious misrepresentation on the part of the examiner, he/she may challenge the failure.

To do so, the student must request a challenge of the failure to GPS within 6 weeks of its notification, including a detailed letter explaining the reasons he/she believes that the judgment of failure is based on the examiner's bias, error, or serious misrepresentation. The student's letter must also include a statement that he/she is fully aware of the serious consequences of a negative outcome of the challenge (see below), and must be accompanied by a supporting letter from the Unit.\* Scientific or scholarly disagreement as to whether or not the thesis meets the academic qualifications for the degree is not a basis for a challenge.

Whether or not the challenge of the failure will be accepted is determined by a hearing carried out by the Thesis Challenge Sub-Committee of the Council of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies, made up of:

- Dean of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies (Chair)
- Three standing members nominated from the membership of the Council of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies
- One academic member who is nominated by the Dean of the Student's Faculty (but not from the student's department, if the Faculty has departments)

A challenge will seldom be heard unless the thesis has been failed after the revise and resubmit process.

If the Challenge Sub-committee determines that the failing judgment was based on bias, error, or misrepresentation, the thesis will be re-examined.

If the request is approved, the Unit must provide GPS with the names of two potential new internal and/or external examiners. GPS will contact and secure the examiner. No contact between the Unit\* and potential examiners is permitted.

If the Challenge Sub-committee determines that the failing judgment was not based on bias, error, or misrepresentation, the failure stands and the student will be withdrawn from the university.

Replace with the following

# Hearing Committee (for bias, error, or misrepresentation)

If a thesis has not been passed and the student feels that this judgment is not based on the academic or scholarly quality of the thesis itself, but rather is determined by bias. error. orserious misrepresentation on the part of the examiner, he/she may submit to the Dean of Graduate and Postdoctoral Studies a written request for a new examiner for the thesis, documenting the bias, error, or serious misrepresentation. This request must be made within six weeks of the notification that the thesis has not passed, and may be accompanied by a letter of support from the supervisor and/or Unit.

To consider the request, the Dean will convene (and chair) a Hearing Committee, composed of 2 standing members of Graduate Council and an appointed member of the student's disciplinary Faculty. This Committee will review the request at a hearing to which the student will be invited in order to present his/her case<sup>1</sup>. The Committee will render a decision (in the absence of the student) as to whether bias, error or serious misrepresentation has been proven. The decision and the reasons behind it will be communicated in writing to the student by the Dean of Graduate & Postdoctoral Studies within one week of the Committee hearing.

If the request for a new examiner is approved by the Committee, the examination by the examiner in question will be considered void; the student and supervisor with the approval of the Unit must identify and contact a new examiner (and submit a new Nomination of Examiners form to GPS). The thesis may not be revised prior to submission to the new examiner.

If the request for a new examiner is not approved by the Committee, and this is first time that the thesis has been evaluated, the student has the right to Revise and Resubmit under the normal procedures. If the revised thesis also fails to pass examination, the thesis will be judged as not fulfilling the requirements for the degree and the student will be withdrawn from the University.

Revised and resubmitted thesis: If bias, error, or serious misrepresentation is first alleged as a result of the examination of a revised thesis (i.e. a thesis that did not pass the first examination and was subsequently revised and resubmitted), the Hearing Committee process described above will be followed. If the allegation is upheld, a new examiner will be secured as described above. If the allegation is not upheld, no further revisions will be considered; the student will be withdrawn from the University.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> The student may bring an advisor from the university community to the hearing (who must not be paid for his/her services.)