

**Assignment type:** *Essay***Source:** *Prof. T. Piper, Faculty of Law, McGill University*

In her Industrial and Intellectual Property course, Professor Tina Piper gives students guidelines for a peer review exercise that allow them to evaluate one another's work on several detailed criteria, and frame their feedback productively.

*Peer review*

The peer review exercise is intended to give you a moment to get focused feedback from another person on your written work. The questions below are framed to allow you to focus on issues that I have observed arise frequently in this assignment.

Some further comments:

- Do approach this exercise in the spirit of constructive engagement and feedback.
- Don't hold back your thoughts out of politeness but...
- Do respect different approaches to writing and thinking.
- Do try asking questions: this is sometimes more helpful than providing firm conclusions and comments on another person's writing.
- Do try reading your pieces aloud to one another.

On a scale of 1 to 7 where 1 is 'excellent' and 7 is 'poor' please evaluate the paper (either overall or on each component below) and provide comments for the author.

- 1 This paper has an identifiable argument. The argument is neither too broad (ambitious) nor too narrow (unadventurous) for a five page paper.
- 2 This paper is responsive to the question asked: you can identify which question the author is answering and the author has defined, limited or framed the terms of the question so that their argument responds to the question asked.
- 3 In general, it is clear how the author is supporting her argument and she does so with clarity and precision. The author has fluidly anticipated (explicitly or implicitly) the strongest objections to her claims. You are, or could be, persuaded.
- 4 The paper cites or draws insight from the readings; those citations are relevant and well-placed. Citations accurately reflect what the case or article says without optimistic essentializing, excessive description or narration.
- 5 The paper has an appropriate introduction and conclusion, and it is clear where the author is going as you read the essay.
- 6 Overall, the paper is well written and understandable.