

**McGill University**  
**School of Physical and Occupational Therapy**  
**Graduate Program in Rehabilitation Science**  
**Ph.D. Comprehensive Examination**  
**Evaluation Grid Report for Structured Review**

**Student Name:**

**Question Evaluated:**

**Examiner Name:**

**Date:**

**Guidelines for evaluating Ph.D. Comprehensive Examination**

Objectives :

1. To extend the knowledge of the student in areas directly and indirectly related to the dissertation topic.
2. To determine if the student has the ability to integrate, organize and express his/her thoughts at a level that is expected for a Ph.D. candidate.

**PLEASE NOTE:**

- 1) While the topics are expected to relate to the thesis, the topics are NOT the thesis and are expected to prepare the student for their thesis work.
- 2) NO CRITERION SHOULD BE BELOW EXPECTATIONS EXCEPT IN THE PRESENTATION CATEGORY. Should a student merit a below expectation's rating, the evaluator is requested to address this in the critical review of the examination.

**Use a structured review to summarize the current evidence in your research area.**

| Evaluation criteria  | Expectations |       |       | Doesn't Apply |
|--|--------------|-------|-------|---------------|
|  | Exceeds      | Meets | Below |               |
| Rationale for the topic  |              |       |       |               |
| Statement of the question in PICO format   |              |       |       |               |
| Description of study outcomes  |              |       |       |               |
| Type of exposure or intervention used  |              |       |       |               |
| Type of study designs used   |              |       |       |               |
| Study population   |              |       |       |               |
| Search strategy  |              |       |       |               |
| Databases and registries used  |              |       |       |               |
| Citations located and excluded with justification  |              |       |       |               |
| Methods for data abstraction and coding (multiple raters, blinding and interrater reliability) |              |       |       |               |
| Assessment of study quality  |              |       |       |               |

|   |  |  |  |  |
|---|--|--|--|--|
| Graphic or tabular display of study selection process   |  |  |  |  |
| Graphic or tabular summary of individual study estimates and overall estimate if applicable (Forest Plot)   |  |  |  |  |
| Table giving descriptive information for each study included including study quality                        |  |  |  |  |
| Indication of statistical uncertainty of finds (may need to calculate if not provided in articles included) |  |  |  |  |
| Conclusions   |  |  |  |  |
| Relevance to inform thesis topic  |  |  |  |  |
| Future research   |  |  |  |  |
| <b>Overall Evaluation: PASS___ FAIL___</b>  |  |  |  |  |

Evaluation is based on Criteria for Reporting of Systematic Reviews: JAMA Instructions for Authors