Case Study 1

- Department Chair appointed 2011 (Prof. Ray)
- Under pressure to find lab space for new CRC 1 hire
- Need to reallocate existing space
- Prof. Smith – lack of evidence of significant research activity
- Decision: space to be allocated on the basis of
  - Building constraints
  - Research productivity over the preceding 5 years
Case Study 1 cont’d

• Prof. Smith:
  – Declining success with grants
  – Supervising one struggling PhD student
  – Publication record below average

• Outcome:
  – Prof. Smith’s lab to be relocated and reduced by 25%.
Case Study 1 cont’d

- Prof. Smith files a grievance against Prof. Ray
- Alleges decision to reduce his lab space was unfair, unjust, and biased against him
- Professor Smith asks the Committee on Staff Grievances to:
  - Reverse the decision of the Chair and Dean regarding his research space
  - Uphold arrangement that his research space remain unmoved and untouched for the remainder of his career
Case Study 1 cont’d

- What should Prof. Ray do first? Whom should he consult?
- What are the next steps?
- How should the reply to the grievance be organized and what needs to be put to the Committee?
- What documents should be put in evidence, what “witnesses” should be presented?
- What points should be emphasised in Prof. Ray’s response?
Case Study 2

- Committee on Staff Grievance upholds Prof. Smith’s grievance
- Basis:
  - Not persuaded that Professor Smith’s performance was sufficiently low to justify a reduction in his research space
Tensions between Chair and Prof. Smith increase

Next merit exercise (and thereafter):

- Chair indicates (in writing) that Prof. Smith must increase his teaching
- Chair wants Prof. Smith to develop new course proposal
- Prof. Smith indicates this is not possible and ceases responding to Chair’s e-mails and telephone messages
- Chair recommends to Dean that Prof. Smith be disciplined for refusal to perform academic duties
Case Study 2 cont’d

- What does Prof. Ray need to provide for the Dean along with his recommendation?

- What courses of action are open to the Dean?

- What are the possible outcomes?
Next ALF is 17 December

The Future of Higher Education

with

Deputy Provost (Student Life & Learning)

Ollivier Dyens