

# MAUT • APBM

McGill Association of University Teachers  
Association des professeur(e)s et bibliothécaires de McGill

## SPRING GENERAL MEETING

April 19, 2013

### DRAFT MINUTES

#### 1. Call to Order

The meeting was called to order at 12:10 pm. A. Shrier, President, welcomed members to the MAUT Spring General Meeting, reminded them to sign the attendance record, and state their names and departments prior to questions and comments. He noted that M. Roy, FQPPU President, would report on the Provincial Association's activities.

He thanked Past-Presidents J. Galaty and B. Gillon for their mentoring and welcomed K. Hastings, the incoming President. He thanked H. Kerwin-Borrelli and J. Varga, MAUT Officers, and members of the MAUT Executive, Council, and CASC for their dedication over the past year. He mentioned J. Galbraith, who was honored at the Advisors' Dinner, for his contribution as an Executive and a CASC member since 2007 and who will continue in an advisory capacity. A. Shrier thanked the MAUT website development team of J. Day, G. Gore and J. Aitkens.

#### 2. Adoption of the Agenda

Members reviewed the Agenda. There were no changes. The Agenda was adopted.

**M. Mackey / C. Mandato  
Adopted**

#### 3. Minutes of the November 16, 2012 Fall General Membership Meeting

The Minutes were posted on the website. There were no objections. The Minutes were adopted.

**M. Richard /K. Hastings  
Adopted**

In the final count, 77 attendees signed in. Of the 77, 14 were retired members, 2 were guests, and 61 were full members. As the quorum for General Membership Meetings is 100, it was not achieved. All members' suggestions will be brought to Council.

- President's Report (Alvin Shrier)

Al Shrier noted that M. Roy will speak about the recent *Sommet*. The FQPPU organized sessions for Québec universities at several *Pre-Sommet* conferences. There was a joint statement from the McGill community, following the Council meeting in December 11/12, which condemned the extraordinary cuts to operating grants to Québec institutions of higher learning. This statement was sent to CAUT and FQPPU and published in the English and French Newspapers. It is posted on the web:

[http://www.mcgill.ca/maut/sites/mcgill.ca/maut/files/motion\\_dec2012\\_en.pdf](http://www.mcgill.ca/maut/sites/mcgill.ca/maut/files/motion_dec2012_en.pdf)

Al Shrier noted MAUT's involvement in CAUT and FQPPU. MAUT delegates attend Council and *Conseil* meetings and participate in other activities. CAUT has mediated the Librarians' Issues, provided financial support for the legal case concerning a dismissed member and actively promotes research funding in Canada. A. Shrier thanked J. Turk, CAUT Executive Director, for his support over the past year. He thanked M. Roy for making MAUT's concerns heard throughout the province.

Al Shrier spoke about CAUT's involvement with McGill.

Following the CAUT Council in 2012, Council mandated an Ad Hoc Committee on Academic Freedom to develop a statement on academic freedom that pertained to McGill. The Committee Chair is B. Gillon and its members have reviewed statements from various academic sources. MAUT hosted the February 2013 Forum on Academic Freedom during which the membership provided their input.

MAUT participated in the September 28/12 Forum on Academic Freedom, organized by the Provost, as well as others on Academic Leadership Issues throughout the past year.

Following a recommendation from the March 6, 2012 MAUT [GPS] Report "Governance, Protest, and Security - Report of the MAUT Committee on the Implications of the Events of 10 November 2011", the formation of a Citizens' Council was moved by R. Myles and seconded by K. Siddiqi and approved at Council. Its members represent the McGill community.

Earlier today, MAUT hosted the 12<sup>th</sup> Tenure and Mentoring Forum, chaired by A. Saroyan. The speakers addressed the academic requirements and concerns of those preparing for the tenure and renewal process, reported on critical issues, and emphasized the assistance provided by MAUT Advisors.

Al Shrier referred to the dismissal case of an MAUT member. The MAUT Council, with support from CAUT, agreed to provide assistance to the dismissed member. The decision was based on the fact that it believed the dismissal by the University was too extreme a measure and the current arbitrary process had no provision for reinstatement. The case, which lasted over fifty days, was taken to the Québec Labour Tribunal. R. Janda, Past-President, was involved from the onset. At the conclusion, the dismissal by the University was upheld. A. Shrier emphasized the advice and support provided by J. Turk, Executive Director, and Council has agreed to make a contribution of \$10K for the next three years to CAUT's Academic Freedom Fund.

Al Shrier referred to the MAUT website initiative spearheaded by C. Riches, VP Communications. The website will be hosted by the University and the work is ongoing. The website is up and running: [www.mcgill.ca/maut](http://www.mcgill.ca/maut)

The last year MAUT conducted several membership surveys. A. Shrier thanked C. Riches and K. Hastings for spearheading this initiative. The surveys provided members' input on: the Protocol on Demonstrations, the issue of Tuition Fees, and the selection of the new Principal. Following input from members, the MAUT Committee met with the University Selection Committee. A. Shrier noted the surveys were an effective means for sampling.

He listed other Council motions during 2012-2013.

The motion to change the composition of the Pension Administration Committee was moved by G. Mikkelson and seconded by P. Caines to add one academic and one non-academic staff member. He noted that with this change, MAUT would provide more input into issues such as debt sharing.

Referring to the fallout from recent court case, a motion to create an appeal process within the University was moved by P. Caines and seconded by K. Siddiqi.

A motion to expand the current membership in the MAUT Communications Committee to include Librarians was presented to Council by S. Rankin [Chair].

A motion to democratize the process of selecting deans was moved by P. Caines and seconded by K. Siddiqi.

Al Shrier spoke briefly about the Committee on Academic Staff Compensation [CASC], a parity committee and the Terms of Reference [ToRs]. One change concerning benefits is that N. Acheson, Retiree, will sit on the SBAC. From September 2012 on, all decisions concerning salaries, pension issues and benefits must be addressed by the CASC committee. The change in the ToRs resulted from recent amendments to the McGill University Pension Plan [MUPP] and members' benefits that took place without any consultation and which were passed by the Board of Governors. A. Shrier noted that the deficit-sharing issue remains to be addressed.

Al Shrier referred to the current composition of the MAUT-CASC caucus and emphasized the necessity to have CASC members with the background, insights and expertise to deal with issues concerning pensions, benefits and salaries. He noted the current members of the MAUT-CASC caucus contribute a great deal to discussions.

Concerning salary discussions at CASC, A. Shrier noted an agreement had been reached but the provincial government changed the budget several times. There was an agreement on a three-year plan that would improve McGill's ranking from 11<sup>th</sup> to 6<sup>th</sup> place among Canadian universities. These ambitious increases were moving forward when the University was hit with funding cuts of \$19M for the next two years. The only change to the three-year plan was that academics were asked to agree to a one-year salary freeze. An exception was made for assistant professors who would be given a 1% increase. A. Shrier noted that other associations and unions at McGill would also be asked to consider a salary freeze.

Al Shrier, as Chair of the MAUT-CASC caucus, was asked to co-sign a public statement with the Provost. This was unprecedented and indicated a willingness to work with the University. The statement referred to the salary freeze and that the agreed-upon three-year plan would go forward. On April 17/13, the Provost presented the Budget to Senate and the academic salary increases were included.

M. Nahon commented on the salary agreement and said that, in this case, the MAUT-CASC caucus did not represent academics. He understood that other Québec universities had not agreed to salary freeze or cuts. He referred to the 2004 document: *Principles for Future Academic Salary Policy*, from then Provost L. Vinet and the commitment (a) to bringing McGill's salaries up to or above the mean for the G-10 universities and (b) that within the next 5 years McGill would work toward positioning

itself among the top three universities from the G-10 group. He noted that these promises have not been kept by the Administration.

Al Shrier would not speak for other universities but emphasized that because of serious funding cuts, McGill is trying to remain fiscally responsible and avoid incurring excessive debt. He stressed that the Budget presented at Senate included the provision for salary increases and that a short gain now would not be good for the long term.

M. Richard emphasized the inconsistency in the joint statement on salary policy circulated on April 09/13 that referred first to academics [professors and librarians] and then only to assistant professors, excluding assistant librarians. This correction was noted by K. Hastings in a message to the Librarians' Section.

M. Richard also noted that the salary details were not disclosed. The Administration has been pledging for many years to raise academic salaries, but it has not met its targets and, as a result, McGill's salary ranking among Canadian universities has declined. He said that academics cannot continue to deliver excellence on the cheap and that, if salary targets are not met, eventually educational quality will be compromised.

R. Myles commented on the process whereby the CASC salary policy was delivered. He indicated he might have voted either for or against it, but was not given the opportunity to be consulted or was made aware of pertinent facts. He referred to structural problems and the process whereby decisions were made resulting in a joint statement signed by the Provost and the MAUT President.

R. Myles moved:

*That an outside "cyclical review" be performed by an expert from outside McGill be approved by Council. The reviewer will study MAUT's internal governance structure and its joint governance structure with the administration, comparing these to other joint faculty associations (e.g. U of T, UBC). The report and its recommendations will be sent to members and then considered by Council and the general membership.*

Seconded by R. Sieber.

The discussion followed. J. Galaty commented that MAUT had operated in good faith concerning the implications for MUNACA and MUNASA. MAUT is at the end of a salary agreement and discussions concerned the terms of the next three-to-four year package, and that agreement of a salary freeze was part of a long-term plan which included salary increases for all academics. McGill's ranking has fallen to 11<sup>th</sup> or 13<sup>th</sup> place among the U-15 and that the April 2013 salary policy from the Administration includes figures that will raise McGill's ranking.

R. Sieber referred to the salary freeze as a cut without prior consultation with Council or the membership. She stressed that MAUT cannot be passive and reactionary, did not have to agree to the ToRs on the table, and can change the references. A. Shrier noted that the ToRs for CASC have changed and that MAUT represents all academics at the University, which provides for a range of diversity. As happens in other universities, all on-going discussions/negotiations on salary policies are not necessarily shared with the membership and that the academics' designated representatives are tasked with finding the best deal. He suggested that MAUT begin a discussion on holding an internal review before proceeding to an external.

The discussion continued with a friendly amendment. M. Richard noted the term “cyclical review” refers only to academic departments. R. Myles said the term was in quotation marks. J. Dealy proposed a friendly amendment since the motion does not refer to regularly occurring reviews, the term, “cyclical” should be deleted.

R. Myles rephrased the first sentence:

*that an outside review be performed by an expert from outside McGill, approved by Council.*

Anthony Paré spoke in favor of the motion as a regular review of the Association is beneficial in assessing its performance and proposing improvements. He noted that that a review of governance procedures could be done by MAUT and that if the Association were to seek outside assistance, it should be done as economically as possible. G. Oegema spoke against the motion. Though displeased with the implications of the joint statement, he was pleased with the work of the CASC representatives. His proposed solutions to problems included changing the current government and getting the province out of debt.

D. Hensley spoke in favor of the motion to review the structures of governance since the CASC representatives did not consult with Council or the membership. J. Galaty suggested bringing this discussion on the proposed motion and analysis to the May Joint Council meeting, as quorum [only 67 full members had signed in] had not been achieved, and Council would be the representative body to ensure that all suggestions would be considered. M. Richard noted that, because quorum had not been achieved, the votes could be counted but the results of the vote would not be binding.

M. Smith proposed that MAUT begin with a broad discussion of its internal structures before moving to hire an outside expert who may or not deliver what was requested.

B. Gillon noted that motions are required to be written out and circulated prior to meetings.

C. Ragan spoke against the motion and questioned the benefits of hiring an expert, the reality of potential costs, and that the motion needs further examination and discussion concerning procedures. He proposed a friendly amendment:

*that R. Myles set up a sub-committee, internal to McGill but external to Council, that is knowledgeable about McGill structures of governance that will examine specific problems and propose specific solutions.*

R. Myles requested up to \$10K to hire an expert and remarked that the Association had spent \$300K on the legal case. He noted that CAUT has the expertise to conduct this review and provide an outside perspective.

The vote was called on the original motion with the friendly amendments. 16 full members voted in favour of the motion. [C. Riches had left and 51 full members voted against the motion.] The motion failed.

- **Past-President’s Report – John Galaty**

As Chief Returning Officer, J. Galaty presented the election results for the returning and newly-elected Executive for 2013-2014 and Council members for 2013-2015. [NB: K.

Siddiqi is a continuing Council member.] G. Mikkelson is the newly appointed VP Communications. His seat on Council is now vacant and this will be addressed at the joint Council Meeting in May.

- **Report on Pensions @ McGill**

The report concerned Amendment 24 of the MUPP. J. Galaty spoke about recent events: the proposed increased contribution rates to offset the deficit and the University's 5% contribution to notional accounts for members aged 65 to 69. The discussions at CASC are on-going. A MAUT-CASC Sub-Committee on Pensions was formed following the release of the D'Amours Report. Discussions continue on sharing the pension deficit to protect members' holdings and achieve an equitable solution. The CASC committee is charged with this responsibility.

- **Report: Chair of the MAUT-Librarians' Section (Sharon Rankin)**

The MAUT-LS membership consists of 51 librarians and 15 retired librarians. 78% of the librarians holding appointments at McGill are members of MAUT and of the Librarians' Section. The MAUT-LS Spring General meeting will take place on April 24<sup>th</sup>, 2013 when the results of the recent MAUT-LS elections will be disclosed. The main issue this year was the development of a collegial process for choosing librarians to serve on the collegial governance committees. S. Rankin thanked M. Richard who provided three background papers on governance-related committees. The MAUT-LS website has migrated thanks to Gen Gore and Jane Aitkens, who have since joined the MAUT Communications Committee. S. Rankin also thanked Jane Aitkens who served on MAUT's Academic Freedom Committee. Though the University has announced budget cuts, there will be no reduction of travel funding for tenure-track Librarians.

- **Report from the VP External (Brendan Gillon) Part A**

B. Gillon introduced Max Roy, President FQPPU, who is in his third mandate. M. Roy reported on the FQPPU's focus on issues: (a) conditions of a professor's professional life and (b) a published survey on the situation and role of female academics in universities, which was led by Concordia Professor Françoise Naudillon. The investigation concerning the role of women in upper management levels at Quebec universities is on-going.

A committee headed by Denis Bélisle [U Sherbrooke] is examining the state of online courses, their effects on professors' work, their influence on academic programs, and the overall impact on universities.

The Committee on University Funding, led by Prof. M. Umbriaco, looked at operating funds, real estate financing and research funding in Quebec universities. The reports will be presented shortly.

One report points to a steady increase in administrative expenses, material and property, while other university budgets have not increased. The result has been that the hiring of new professors, teaching assistants, and support staff has been cut or severely reduced. The number of students is increasing but operating budgets have not kept pace. There is a lack of new personnel, new positions are not created, and retired employees are not replaced. The employer is imposing additional tasks on academics and changing pension plans.

The FQPPU denounces the substantial raises granted to upper administrative levels while expecting employees to cover the costs associated with budget difficulties and seeking to reduce their participation in governing bodies.

The FQPPU continues to oppose the implications of Bill 38 which sought to hand control of the universities to a majority of outside external administrators whose values do not reflect those of the university sector. Students, staff and faculty fought against this Bill and it was tabled and later withdrawn.

The FQPPU has fought against Bill 130 that would have merged three research funding agencies. The FQPPU brief was defended at the parliamentary commission and Bill 130 was amended. More vigilance is required.

The crisis caused by the student movement in opposition to rising tuitions grew enormously with serious consequences. At the last *Conseil fédéral* (October 26/12) the FQPPU adopted two motions:

- A call for a public inquiry into the police conduct during the student demonstrations. The CAUT adopted a similar position.
- A call for the resignation of the Rector and Secretary-General of the Université du Québec en Outaouais, following their request for police intervention that put the security of the students and professors at risk.

The FQPPU has been calling for an Estates General on the future of Québec universities concerning research, governance and funding.

The FQPPU supported the students' claims but denounced all forms of violence. The FQPPU has criticized the addition and modification of quality assurance mechanisms at the university as it will open the door to evaluations of programs, institutions and professors by external consulting firms with little connection to the academic and scientific communities.

The Québec Government announced a Summit on Higher Education in February 2013. The Summit was preceded by thematic meetings on the quality of teaching, accessibility, governance and university funding, and the contribution of research institutions and development throughout the province.

The FQPPU's *Sommet* took place on October 25/12 and focused on the financing and governance of universities. The presentations from this event will be available shortly. The FQPPU has established good relations with CAUT, with French and American universities, and organizations such as Education International, which enable the *Fédération* to offer support to colleagues and share issues. The FQPPU has participated in global conferences, is aware of new trends, and keeps its members informed.

K. Hastings congratulated M. Roy on the FQPPU's important research data and commented that MAUT is getting its money's worth.

J. Galaty asked about the anticipated withdrawal of two charter universities from CREPUQ and about the underlying politics of the possibility of having two units to represent the charter universities and the UQ system. M. Roy noted the on-going problems in Québec universities. In the past only CREPUQ could lobby successfully with

the government. Now there is a shared possibility. L. Glass commented on the current severe attacks on the university system that have hurt all major research universities, particularly McGill. M. Roy remarked the ongoing work of financial oversight with the intention to proposed changes to existing rules. A. Shrier noted that the FQPPU is holding Focus Groups to get information from academics concerning the working conditions at universities and that MAUT will participate.

- **President-Elect's Report (Ken Hastings) Part A**

Ken Hastings recapped the origin of the Citizens' Council idea as a recommendation of the March 6, 2012 MAUT [GPS] Report "Governance, Protest, and Security - Report of the MAUT Committee on the Implications of the Events of 10 November 2011". The goal was to increase communication among the various elements of the McGill community. MAUT Council established a Working Group consisting of K. Hastings, G. Mikkelson, R. Myles, A. Moores and K. Norget to contact the employee and student groups to initiate the Citizens' Council.

These overtures were enthusiastically welcomed and on March 19/13, the first meeting was held, jointly hosted by MAUT and PGSS, and attended by Executive representatives of AMURE, AMUSE, MAUT, MUNACA, MUNASA, PGSS, SEIU and SSMU (with regrets from AGSEM). At this meeting the goals and mode of operation of the Citizens' Council were discussed and there was a clear consensus that it should be a place to informally share information, with each organization retaining its individual autonomy. The preference was for an informal structure in which, rather than a Chair, each organization would act as host or steward of the meeting in a rotating fashion. There was clear enthusiasm for the potential of the Citizens' Council to be a meeting place and a forum for issues, both academic and non-academic, that affect the McGill community.

- **Report from the VP External (Brendan Gillon) – Part B**

There has been no CAUT Council meeting to report on since last Fall 2012. B. Gillon thanked M. Roy for reporting on the FQPPU activities. Two *Conseil fédéral* meetings have taken place in February and April 2013.

Three members of the MAUT Academic Freedom Committee attended the Harry Crowe Foundation Conference on Academic Freedom in February 2013. The MAUT Ad Hoc Committee on Academic Freedom hosted an Open Forum on Academic Freedom in February 2013. The MAUT Ad-Hoc Committee has met several times and will submit its final report and draft statement during the 2013 Fall term.

- **Report from the VP Finance (Christopher Ragan)**

C. Ragan presented a snapshot of MAUT finances as of April 15, 2013. He noted that MAUT's expenses have been covered and that professional fees, since the current legal case has ended, will be considerably reduced. He referred to the MAUT Auditor's projected numbers for 2013. He noted that following the conclusion of the legal case, MAUT Council has agreed to make three \$10K donations, over a period of three years, to the CAUT's Academic Freedom Fund.

- **Report from the VP Communications (Caroline Riches) presented by A. Shrier**

Al Shrier referred to the slide on MAUT's new website: [www.mcgill.ca/maut](http://www.mcgill.ca/maut)

The site is user-friendly and also hosts the Retirees' and the Librarians' sections. The MAUT Newsletter [Vol 38, No 1, March 2013] was distributed electronically to all McGill academics and is posted on the MAUT website. Paper copies can be requested.

- **Report from the VP Internal (David Harpp)**

D. Harpp reported that overall the health plan rates have increased somewhat while the dental rates have decreased. Concerning health rates, this means an increase of almost six dollars / month for single and eleven dollars / month for family coverage.

Concerning dental rates, there is a decrease of three dollars / month for single and seven dollars / month for family coverage. The net change for families is approximately four dollars per month.

D. Harpp referred to the slide on Contribution Rates for 2013 for Benefits which indicated what the University pays in comparison to what the individual member pays for supplemental health, dental, short and long-term disability, basic life insurance, optional life insurance and accident insurance. He noted that while the cost of generic drugs has decreased, the cost for biological drugs has increased and overall trends are difficult to predict. He noted that pharmacy prices will vary, encouraged members to shop around, and that direct deposit for benefit claims saves money.

D. Harpp referred to the change in benefits for those who retire after May 31, 2016. The University will only cover 30% for health benefits and there will be no dental coverage. McGill employees hired after 2010 will not have any dental plan when they retire.

D. Harpp also referred to changes to the travel insurance for retirees. If a retiree is medically stable for ninety days prior to travel and if there are no new symptoms or worsening of symptoms or new medications, the retiree will be covered. N. Acheson, Retiree, noted the new conditions for travel requirements, posted on the Manulife Website, will make it more difficult to qualify for and to get reimbursed by the insurance if medical attention is required when abroad. More discussion and clarification of terms are needed.

D. Harpp reported on membership statistics. Including full members and retirees, the total is 1112. He noted that of 99 Senators, 77 are MAUT members. He mentioned two successful recruitment initiatives - research mixers held in March and April, and that invitations were sent to both newly hired and established academics.

- **Report from the Chair of the MAUT Retirees' Committee (Kohur GowriSankaran)**

K. GowriSankaran reported on the changes to the benefits to retired staff, concerning the "proper interpretation of the Health Clause for coverage during travel abroad." N. Acheson, now a member of the Staff Benefits Advisory Committee [SBAC], has brought these issues to the attention of the Administration and the MAUT President.

The Retirees organized a guided tour of the Peruvian exhibit at the Montreal Museum of Fine Arts and are planning luncheons at the McGill and MAC Faculty clubs. The Retirees also participated in bird watching activities.

- **Faculty Club (Edith Zorychta)**

E. Zorychta reported on the financial stability of McGill's two faculty clubs and the excellent management teams. A. Shrier thanked E. Zorychta for her diligence in keeping both clubs operational.

- **New President's Report (Ken Hastings)**

Ken Hastings thanked Al Shrier for his hard work as President.

He mentioned several issues that he saw as important for his term as President.

First, he wanted to increase communication, both among the various elements of the MAUT machinery, and between MAUT and its members. To increase general awareness of members as to what MAUT does, he plans to circulate a monthly President's Report to the Members to provide an ongoing perspective of MAUT issues and activities.

Second, K. Hastings sees recruitment of new members as a critical challenge for the organization and one that all members should be thinking about. He especially thanked V-P Internal David Harpp for his very effective efforts at recruitment, and mentioned that all of us should view academic staff who are not MAUT members as potential members, and act accordingly.

- **Adjournment**

In his first official act as President, K. Hastings called for a motion to adjourn the meeting. Approved unanimously. The meeting adjourned at 2:30 pm.

Respectfully submitted:

Honore Kerwin-Borrelli  
MAUT Administrative Officer