

Body Counts

*Medical Quantification in Historical and
Sociological Perspective /
La quantification médicale, perspectives
historiques et sociologiques*

EDITED BY
GÉRARD JORLAND, ANNICK OPINEL,
AND GEORGE WEISZ

Published for / publié pour
Fondation merieux

by / par

McGill-Queen's University Press
Montreal & Kingston • London • Ithaca

© McGill-Queen's University Press 2005

ISBN 0-7735-2829-6 (cloth)

ISBN 0-7735-2925-X (paper)

Legal deposit second quarter 2005

Bibliothèque nationale du Québec

Printed in Canada on acid-free paper that is 100% ancient forest free (100% post-consumer recycled), processed chlorine free.

McGill-Queen's University Press acknowledges the support of the Canada Council for the Arts for its publishing program. It also acknowledges the financial support of the Government of Canada through the Book Publishing Industry Development Program (BPIDP) for its publishing activities.

Library and Archives Canada Cataloguing in Publication

Body counts : medical quantification in historical and sociological perspective = la quantification médicale, perspectives historiques et sociologiques / edited by Gérard Jorland, Annick Opinel and George Weisz.

Text in English and French.

Proceedings of the symposium La quantification dans les sciences médicales et de la santé: perspective historique, held at Musée Claude-Bernard, in Saint-Julien-en-Beaujolais, France, Oct. 24-26, 2002.

Includes index.

ISBN 0-7735-2829-6 (bound).—ISBN 0-7735-2925-X (pbk.)

1. Medical statistics—History—Congresses. 2. Epidemiology—Statistical methods—History—Congresses. 3. Medical instruments and apparatus—History—Congresses. I. Jorland, Gérard II. Opinel, Annick III. Weisz, George IV. Fondation Marcel-Mérieux V. Title: Quantification médicale, perspectives historiques et sociologiques.

RA407.B62 2005 610'.9 C2004-906136-4E

Catalogage avant publication de Bibliothèque et Archives Canada

Body counts : medical quantification in historical and sociological perspective = la quantification médicale, perspectives historiques et sociologiques / edited by Gérard Jorland, Annick Opinel and George Weisz.

Textes en anglais et en français.

Compte-rendu du symposium La quantification dans les sciences médicales et de la santé: perspective historique, présentée au Musée Claude-Bernard, in Saint-Julien-en-Beaujolais, France, Oct. 24-26, 2002.

Comprend un index.

ISBN 0-7735-2829-6 (relié).—ISBN 0-7735-2925-X (br.)

1. Statistique médicale—Histoire—Congrès. 2. Épidémiologie—Méthodes statistiques—Histoire—Congrès. 3. Médecine—Appareils et instruments—Histoire—Congrès. I. Jorland, Gérard II. Opinel, Annick III. Weisz, George IV. Fondation Marcel-Mérieux V. Titre: Quantification médicale, perspectives historiques et sociologiques.

RA407.B62 2005 610'.9 C2004-906136-4F

Typeset in 10/12 Baskerville by True to Type

Contents

Contributors ix

- 1 Introduction: Who Counts?
Gérard Jorland and George Weisz 3

PART ONE MEDICAL ARITHMETIC

- 2 Quantifying Experience and Beating Biases: A New Culture
in Eighteenth-Century British Clinical Medicine
Ulrich Tröhler 19
- 3 When the State Counts Lives:
Eighteenth-Century Quarrels over Inoculation
Harry M. Marks 51
- 4 Quantifying Infant Mortality in England and France, 1750–1800
Andrea Rusnock 65

PART TWO QUANTIFICATION AND INSTRUMENTATION

- 5 Medical Statistics at the Paris School: What Was at Stake?
Ann F. La Berge 89
- 6 Standardizing Body Temperature: Quantification in Hospitals
and Daily Life, 1850–1900
Volker Hess 109
- 7 Les multiples usages de la quantification en médecine :
Le cas du diabète sucré
Christiane Sinding 127

- 8 “Measures, Instruments, Methods, and Results”:
Jozefa Joteyko on Social Reforms and Physiological Measures
Ilana Löwy 145
- 9 The Production of Biomedical Measures:
Three Platforms for Quantifying Cancer Pathology
Peter Keating and Alberto Cambrosio 173

PART THREE STATISTICS AND THE
UNDERDETERMINATION OF THEORIES

- 10 La sous-détermination des théories médicales par les
statistiques: le cas Semmelweis
Gérard Jorland 205
- 11 Epidemiology in Transition:
Tobacco and Lung Cancer in the 1950s
Mark Parascandola 226

PART FOUR REDUCING UNCERTAINTY AND
THE POLITICS OF HEALTH

- 12 William Farr and Quantification in Nineteenth-Century English
Public Health
Michael Donnelly 251
- 13 La santé publique et ses instruments de mesure :
Des barèmes évaluatifs américains aux indices numériques
de la Société des Nations, 1915–1955
Lion Murard 266
- 14 Statistical Theory Was Not the Reason That Randomization Was
Used in the British Medical Research Council’s Clinical Trial of
Streptomycin for Pulmonary Tuberculosis
Iain Chalmers 309
- 15 Exigence scientifique et isolement institutionnel : L’essor con-
trarié de l’épidémiologie française dans la seconde moitié du
XX^e siècle
Luc Berlivet 335
- 16 L’infléchissement du travail politique autour des essais con-
trôlés : L’épidémie de sida à la fin du XX^e siècle
Nicolas Dodier 359

Contents

vii

PART FIVE AFTERTHOUGHTS

- 17 From Clinical Counting to Evidence-Based Medicine
George Weisz 377
- 18 Medical Quantification: Science, Regulation, and the State
Theodore M. Porter 394
- Index 403