
Minutes of the meeting of the **Academic Policy Committee** held on Thursday 22nd April 2010, from 3:00 to 5:00 p.m., Room 310, James Building

Present: M.J. Mendelson (chairing), J. Angeles, W. Caplin, V. Errunza, D. Farrow, W. Hendershot, P. Holland, M. Kreiswirth,, S. MacDougall, J. Potter, C. Weston, H.M.C. Richard (Secretary to the Committee)

Regrets: G. Brown, J. Côté, A. DeGuise, R. Dooley, A. Gauthier, E. Gayagoy, M. Kaartinen, D. Klinck, A.C. Masi, M. Mehta, R. Rozen, W. Thomson, C. Urbain, M. Szyf, S. Woolf

Guests: M.G. Badami, R. Ramankutty (item 4.a), P. A. Todd (item 6), C. Madramootoo (item 7)

Document circulated at the meeting:

10-APC-04-65 Desautels Faculty of Management – Report on Self-Funded MBA Programs, April 2010

12.01 Proposed agenda

The agenda was adopted as proposed.

12.02 Minutes of the meeting held on 8th April 2010

The minutes were approved as circulated. A subsequent correction was made. On page 2, under 11.06, the 4th line of the 2nd paragraph should read: "...there exists an 'International Journal of Sustainable Engineering'..." For further information: (<http://www.tandf.co.uk/journals/titles/19397038.asp>)

12.03 Business arising

None.

12.04 Subcommittee on Courses and Teaching Programs (SCTP)

Special Report # 5 - program proposal for approval by APC (10-APC-04-63)

- a) B.A. & Sc.; Interfaculty Program in Sustainability, Science and Society (54 cr.)

Professor Madhav G. Badami, School of Urban Planning and McGill School of Environment, Associate Director, Graduate Affairs, and Professor Navin Ramankutty, Department of Geography, presented the proposed "B.A. & Sc.; Sustainability, Science and Society" program. The program, offered jointly by the Faculty of Arts and the Faculty of Science, focuses on what is believed to be the major challenge of the 21st century, i.e. "to improve human well-being while maintaining the Earth's life support systems" in the face of a projected global population in excess of nine billion by the year 2050. The aim of the program is to provide students with the knowledge and skills to "understand and address the challenge in its multiple dimensions – scientific-technological, socio-economic, political-institutional, ethical." The program's structure rests on three pillars: 1) Science and Technology, 2) Economics, Policy, and Governance, 3) Ethics, Equity, and Justice.

APC members' questions and comments dealt with the following:

- It was suggested that alternative statistics courses offered by the Department of Mathematics and Statistics should be included, but it was noted that the faculties of Arts and of Science have established equivalences for statistics courses that are outlined in the Calendar.
- The absence of courses in Philosophy and Religious Studies. It was suggested that the possibility of including more of such courses be considered.
- The guiding vision of the world reflected in the proposed program. It was noted that this would include access to fresh water for all humans, sustainable well-being, learning from societies that, in using only a fraction of the resources consumed by developed countries, have achieved human development indicators that are not very different.
- The challenge posed by interdisciplinarity. It was observed that, in the three Areas on page 4 (relating to the 18 additional credits of complementary courses), Area 1 offers fundamental, skill-related knowledge, while Areas 2A, 2B and 3 relate to the three pillars.
- The enrolment goal would be 30 students at the beginning.
- The program opens many possibilities for graduate studies.

APC members then discussed the proposal. “Sustainable Well-being” as a guiding vision for the proposed program was questioned. There was also concern about the use of such terms as “Ethics”, “Equity” and “Justice” while the proposed program includes no offerings by the Department of Philosophy and the Faculty of Religious Studies. It was stated that, while innovation was laudable, “Sustainability” may not be a sustainable academic subject for teaching programs. It was noted that the problem may be one of rhetoric, in which case the language in which the program is framed could be clarified and/or one of academic content and course packaging.

It was agreed that Professor Madhav G. Badami, and Professor Navin Ramankutty should be invited back to the next meeting of APC to address the following:

- Justification for the proposed breadth of the subject, given that the courses tend to be very focused;
- Justification for the three pillars (Science and Technology; Economics, Policy, and Governance; Ethics, Equity, and Justice);
- A definition of “Sustainability” as a field of study and a justification for the issues relating to the title of the program; an explanation of such ambitious goals as “Well-being” and “Justice”;
- Consultation with the Department of Philosophy and the Faculty of Religious Studies;
- A review of similar programs offered by other universities, for a better understanding of what is proposed.

The consultation process for new program proposals was also discussed.

(Secretary’s note: *the consultation memos that were attached to the document posted on the APC website were not intended for posting or circulation to Committee members.*)

APC members commented that

- the consultations occurred very late;
- only two weeks were allowed for a response;
- consultations may not be as collegial as they should be;
- APC should establish rules for the consultation process.

b) Ph.D. in Religious Studies; Gender and Women’s Studies

The Gender and Women’s Studies option has been applied to a number of graduate programs and is now being opened to students taking the Ph.D. in Religious studies.

APC approved the proposed “Ph.D. in Religious Studies; Gender and Women’s Studies”. This approval will be reported to Senate for information (in APC’s 420th Report for consideration on 19th May 2010).

12.05 International Education

- Report on student exchanges (10-APC-04-61)

Deputy-Provost Morton J. Mendelson thanked Kalyna Kruczewyj for so ably compiling the Report on student exchanges and then presented the major points. One concern has been the imbalance between the number of outgoing and incoming students, which penalizes McGill financially, as it receives government funding only for outgoing students and provides education to a greater number of incoming students. The University is taking measures to correct the imbalance. The number of outgoing students increased this year and McGill is considering possible imbalances when deciding whether to renew or revise agreements. McGill has also taken steps to limit the number of CREPUQ exchange students: CREPUQ partnerships involve the Quebec university network as a whole. McGill, as a preferred destination, has had to limit the number of incoming students on such exchanges.

Discussion ensued. The Report was found to be very helpful in providing the necessary background for the exchange agreements that APC reviews for approval. In response to a question regarding the value added and expectations in terms of learning outcomes for outgoing students, it was stated that students’ responses to questionnaires tend to indicate that study abroad is important for personal, if not so much for academic development. Except in Management programs, the international experience has not been formally included in the curriculum; an attempt is made to select courses that may be equivalent to McGill’s. It was suggested that students may be concerned about different marking systems in host institutions and may wonder whether grades

obtained abroad may handicap them in their application to graduate studies. It was also noted that the University's learning environment benefits from the presence of and interaction with international students, but McGill may not need to rely as much as other universities on student exchange agreements to attract an international student body.

12. 06 Desautels Faculty of Management

- Report on self-funded MBA programs (10-APC-04-64)

Professor Peter A. Todd, Dean of the Desautels Faculty of Management, presented the Faculty's draft response to the recommendation from the Senate Steering Committee to Senate "that APC receive a report from the Dean of Management, and other relevant information as appropriate, concerning potential academic impacts of the self-funded MBA programs adopted by the Executive Committee of the Board of Governors, for its discussion. APC is expected to "report the result of its exchanges to Senate, for discussion, providing at least an interim report by the end of the 2009-2010 academic year, paying particular attention to:

1. The principles that underscore the mission of the University as a publicly funded, research-intensive student-centred university, and how they would guide such initiatives, in particular if and when considered in the future.
2. The potential academic impacts of such initiatives, in particular in terms of academic quality, accessibility and student financial needs.
3. The impacts, if any, of the self-funded MBA model on the joint MBA programs with the Faculty of Law and the Faculty of Medicine and how they might be addressed."

(from the Report of the Senate Steering Committee to Senate, 09-10:04 for the Senate meeting on 4th November 2009, as reported in the minutes of the APC meeting held on 5th November 2009).

The Dean's factual report describes the situation regarding the self-funded MBAs offered or soon-to-be offered:

- MBA Japan, started in 1997
- the McGill-HEC-Montréal Executive MBA, started in 2008
- the regular MBA, first offered in 1963 and to be offered in self-funded mode as of Fall 2010

It also describes the following Masters in Management programs:

- the Master in Manufacturing Management program jointly offered with the Faculty of Engineering
- the International Masters in Practicing Management (IMPM) offered in collaboration with Lancaster University and a number of other international partners
- the International Masters for Health Leadership (IMHL) whose first class graduated in 2008

As the Faculty shifts to a self-funded model for the regular MBA program, all its masters programs will be on the self-funded model. Given the cost of running a world-class MBA program that can keep up with global competition, the University is currently subsidizing the MBA program by about \$10 000 per student per year, in order to make up for the shortfall of funds from the Quebec government. It is not reasonable to subsidize students who can typically afford higher fees and will reap immediate financial benefits upon graduation. The Faculty will find ways to support students who cannot afford to pay the higher fees. The Dean went on to describe the highly successful situation with respect to the MBA Japan program and the Executive MBA. It has been the Faculty's experience that demand goes up despite a hike in fees and that a self-funded model results in higher yields, due to students' greater commitment. Scholarships, loan programs and exit scholarships upon graduation (depending on employment) are compensating measures put in place. Self-funding contributes to raising the academic quality of the program.

Discussion ensued. Asked how other Quebec MBA programs deal with the funding difficulty, the Dean responded that distinctions exist between programs and the Desautels Faculty at McGill aspires to rank among the best in the world. Other institutions increased their enrolment (to 8,000 at Concordia and to 12,000 at HEC-Montréal, compared with 3000 at McGill); they have also reduced the number of full-time academic staff, and increased reliance on part-time instructors, a staffing pattern that McGill's Faculty of Management resorted to, in the past. Despite MELS opposition and warning of a penalty, the experiment will go forward as the alternative would be to close the program. It was noted that Senate was concerned about changes that the self-funded mode may cause. Self-funded programs require internal approval only.

It was agreed that the minutes of Senate would be circulated to APC, that APC members should be invited to submit comments and questions, and that APC's comments should be forwarded to the Dean, who may be invited to address the issue again at a future meeting of APC.

12.07 Proposal for the creation of a McGill Institute of Global Food Security (10-APC-04-62)

Professor Chandra Madramootoo, Dean, Faculty of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences, presented the proposal for the creation of a McGill Institute of Global Food Security, first explaining the circumstances leading to the plan to establish such an institute: the 2007-2008 food crisis, the resounding success of the 2008 *McGill Conference on Global Food Security* and of the 2009 conference *Impacts of the Global Financial Crisis on Food Security*. In parallel, new programs have resulted from the FAES program review, namely the multidisciplinary specialization in Agriculture and Food Systems in the B.Sc.(Agr.Env.Sc.) degree. The Faculty is also identifying ways of making best academic use of the resources and facilities on the Macdonald Campus. The Faculty is well positioned to house an institute that will bring together McGill expertise on issues of food security. No other Canadian faculty of Agriculture has taken the subject as seriously and put together such a complete program.

In the discussion, in response to a suggestion that the Faculty of Engineering should have a role in food production, it was stated that no response was obtained from the Faculty. It was also noted that rich potential exists for distance education offerings, given the number of inquiries received from overseas. The website may in future, include pedagogical material. **In addition to adding the McGill Nutrition and Food Science Centre (joint with the Faculty of Medicine) in the list of potential partners, it was stated that the Centre for International Management Studies should be deleted from the list, as this Centre (which was not approved as a "research centre" *per se*) is dormant.**

APC approved the proposal for the creation of a McGill Institute of Global Food Security as revised, for submission to Senate for further approval and possible recommendation to the Board of Governors for final approval (the proposal will be included in APC's 420th Report, for consideration by Senate on 25th May 2010).

Secretary's note: The following text was added to Appendix B (page 17);

McGill Nutrition and Food Science Centre conducts research and teaching activities jointly with the School of Dietetics and Human Nutrition and the Faculty of Medicine. The Crabtree Laboratories of the Centre in the Royal Victoria Hospital Centre in Montréal and other McGill teaching hospitals have excellent clinical research facilities and offer opportunities to conduct clinical research in the areas of cardiovascular disease, diabetes, lipids, nutrition support, obesity, gastrointestinal disorders and pediatrics.

12.09 Other business

None.

The meeting adjourned at 4:45 p.m.

Helen M.C. Richard - HMCR/APPCdocs/minutes/2010-04-22